



MINUTES

COMMISSION ON DENTAL ACCREDITATION ADA HEADQUARTERS, CHICAGO, IL & VIDEO MEETING

THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 9, 2023 (CLOSED SESSION)

Call to Order: The Chair, Dr. Sanjay Mallya, called a regular meeting of the Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA) to order at 10:00 A.M. on Thursday, February 9, 2023, in the Executive Board Room of the American Dental Association Headquarters Building, Chicago, Illinois and in a virtual closed session for the purpose of reviewing educational programs by the Commission.

Roll Call: Dr. Evanthia Anadioti, Dr. Victor Badner, Dr. Keith Beasley, Dr. Joel Berg, Dr. Carolyn Brown, Dr. Indraneel Bhattacharyya, Ms. Margaret Bowman-Pensel, Dr. Joseph Cohen, Dr. Scott DeRossi, Dr. Scott DeVito, Dr. Maxine Feinberg (vice chair), Mr. Marco Gargano, Dr. Joseph Giovannitti, Dr. Amid Ismail, Dr. Susan Kass, Dr. Barbara Krieg-Menning, Dr. George Kushner, Dr. Brent Larson, Dr. Cataldo Leone, Dr. Frank Licari, Dr. Paul Luepke, Dr. Sanjay Mallya (chair), Ms. Lisa Mayer, Ms. Martha McCaslin, Dr. Carol Anne Murdoch-Kinch, Dr. Garry Myers, Dr. Frank Recker, Dr. Miriam Robbins, Dr. Nancy Rosenthal, Dr. Timmothy Schwartz, Ms. Lonni Thompson, Dr. Marshall Titus, and Dr. Deborah Weisfuse.

Commissioners attending in person: Dr. Victor Badner, Dr. Keith Beasley, Dr. Carolyn Brown, Dr. Scott DeRossi, Dr. Scott DeVito, Dr. Maxine Feinberg (vice chair), Mr. Marco Gargano, Dr. Joseph Giovannitti, Dr. Amid Ismail, Dr. Susan Kass, Dr. Barbara Krieg-Menning, Dr. George Kushner, Dr. Brent Larson, Dr. Cataldo Leone, Dr. Frank Licari, Dr. Paul Luepke, Dr. Sanjay Mallya (chair), Ms. Lisa Mayer, Ms. Martha McCaslin, Dr. Carol Anne Murdoch-Kinch (attended a portion of the meeting), Dr. Garry Myers, Dr. Miriam Robbins, Dr. Nancy Rosenthal, Dr. Timmothy Schwartz, and Dr. Deborah Weisfuse.

Commissioners attending virtually: Dr. Evanthia Anadioti, Dr. Joel Berg, Dr. Indraneel Bhattacharyya, Ms. Margaret Bowman-Pensel, Dr. Joseph Cohen, and Dr. Marshall Titus.

Dr. Frank Recker, and Ms. Lonni Thompson were unable to attend the meeting.

Trustee Liaison: Dr. James Boyle, III, Thirteenth District Trustee, Board of Trustees Liaison to CODA, American Dental Association (ADA) attended virtually.

Commission Staff: Dr. Sherin Took, *ex-officio* (senior director), Ms. Jamie Asher Hernandez, Ms. Kirsten Nadler, Ms. Katie Navickas, Ms. Peggy Soeldner, and Ms. Kelly Stapleton, managers, and Ms. Marjorie Hooper, operations coordinator, Ms. Bridget Blackwood, Mr. Nick Brattoli, Mr. Christopher Castaneda, Mr. Daniel Sloyan, senior project assistants, were in attendance. Ms. Bernadette Molina, site visit coordinator, attended virtually. Ms. Cathryn Albrecht, senior associate general counsel, CODA, was also in attendance.

Adoption of the Agenda: The agenda of the meeting was adopted.



Commissioner Fiduciary Duties and Conflict of Interest Obligations: Ms. Cathryn Albrecht, ADA/CODA Senior Associate General Counsel, reminded the Commission of its fiduciary responsibilities and the Conflict of Interest policy.

Policy Reminder of Confidentiality: Dr. Sanjay Mallya, CODA Chair, read the Commission's Reminder of Confidentiality, noting the confidential nature of the Commission's materials and deliberations related to the accreditation of programs.

Accreditation Mail Ballots Since Last Commission Meeting: The Commission approves for the record, twelve (12) mail ballots related to program accreditation actions, which had been considered since the Summer 2022 Commission meeting.

Consideration of Site Visitor Nominations: Site Visitors are appointed annually for one-year terms but for no more than six (6) consecutive years. The Commission considered the names of individuals recommended by the Predoctoral (including Dental Therapy), Postdoctoral General Dentistry (including Advanced Education in General Dentistry and General Practice Residency), Dental Anesthesiology, Dental Assisting, Dental Hygiene, Dental Laboratory Technology, Dental Public Health, Endodontics, Oral and Maxillofacial Pathology, Oral and Maxillofacial Radiology, Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, Oral Medicine, Orofacial Pain, Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics, Pediatric Dentistry, Periodontics, and Prosthodontics Education Review Committees.

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation approves the site visitor appointments for 2023-2024 (**Appendix 1**).

Consideration of Matters Relating to Accreditation Actions: The Commission reviewed site visit evaluations, progress reports, and other requested reports on predoctoral dental education programs, advanced dental education programs, and allied dental education programs.

Two (2) special appearances were made before the Commission by educational programs reviewed in the Commission's Report on the Accreditation Status of Educational Programs.

Commission Action: Accreditation status was granted to programs evaluated since the Summer 2022 meeting. Accreditation actions are summarized in the "Report on the Accreditation Statuses of Educational Programs." (**Appendix 2**).

New Business (CODA Operations: Enhancing Training): The Commission considered a proposal to create an Ad Hoc Committee to explore the issue of ongoing professional development for Commissioners, Review Committee members, and site visitors, addressing trends in assessment and clinical education, and the purpose and structure of site visitor training. The Ad Hoc Committee would include members representing allied, advanced, and predoctoral education and could eventually become a standing committee of the Commission. The Commission noted that changes are occurring in dental education, and the Commission volunteers may benefit from enhanced understanding of new advancements in education, technology, and other issues while making decisions on educational programs and developing accreditation policies. The development of training could include Mega Issue Discussions and ongoing updates including calibration on Standards, since the Standards are written broadly to permit educational programs to achieve these requirements in several different ways.



Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directed the formation of an Ad Hoc Committee to consider professional development for Commissioners, Review Committee members, and Site Visitors, with a report to the Commission in Summer 2023.

Adjournment: The Commission adjourned the closed session at 3:26 P.M.

=====



MINUTES

COMMISSION ON DENTAL ACCREDITATION VIRTUAL MEETING

FRIDAY, FEBRUARY 10, 2023 (OPEN SESSION)

Call to Order: The Chair, Dr. Sanjay Mallya, called a regular meeting of the Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA) to order at 10:00 A.M. on Friday, February 10, 2023, in the Executive Board Room of the American Dental Association Headquarters Building, Chicago, Illinois and in a virtual open session.

Roll Call: Dr. Evanthia Anadioti, Dr. Victor Badner, Dr. Keith Beasley, Dr. Joel Berg, Dr. Carolyn Brown, Dr. Indraneel Bhattacharyya (substituted by Dr. Renee Reich), Ms. Margaret Bowman-Pensel, Dr. Joseph Cohen, Dr. Scott DeRossi, Dr. Scott DeVito, Dr. Maxine Feinberg (vice chair), Mr. Marco Gargano, Dr. Joseph Giovannitti, Dr. Amid Ismail, Dr. Susan Kass, Dr. Barbara Krieg-Menning, Dr. George Kushner, Dr. Brent Larson, Dr. Cataldo Leone, Dr. Frank Licari, Dr. Paul Luepke, Dr. Sanjay Mallya (chair), Ms. Lisa Mayer, Ms. Martha McCaslin, Dr. Carol Anne Murdoch-Kinch, Dr. Garry Myers, Dr. Frank Recker, Dr. Miriam Robbins, Dr. Nancy Rosenthal, Dr. Timmothy Schwartz, Ms. Lonni Thompson, Dr. Marshall Titus, and Dr. Deborah Weisfuse.

Commissioners attending in person: Dr. Victor Badner, Dr. Keith Beasley, Dr. Carolyn Brown, Dr. Scott DeRossi, Dr. Scott DeVito, Dr. Maxine Feinberg (vice chair), Mr. Marco Gargano, Dr. Joseph Giovannitti, Dr. Amid Ismail, Dr. Susan Kass, Dr. Barbara Krieg-Menning, Dr. George Kushner, Dr. Brent Larson, Dr. Cataldo Leone, Dr. Frank Licari, Dr. Paul Luepke, Dr. Sanjay Mallya (chair), Ms. Lisa Mayer, Ms. Martha McCaslin, Dr. Garry Myers, Dr. Miriam Robbins, Dr. Nancy Rosenthal, Dr. Timmothy Schwartz, and Dr. Deborah Weisfuse.

Commissioners attending virtually: Dr. Evanthia Anadioti, Dr. Joel Berg, Dr. Indraneel Bhattacharyya (substituted by Dr. Renee Reich), Ms. Margaret Bowman-Pensel, Dr. Joseph Cohen, Dr. Frank Recker, and Dr. Marshall Titus.

Dr. Carol Anne Murdoch-Kinch, and Ms. Lonni Thompson were unable to attend the meeting.

Trustee Liaison: Dr. James Boyle, III, Thirteenth District Trustee, Board of Trustees Liaison to CODA, American Dental Association (ADA) attended virtually.

Commission Staff: Dr. Sherin Took, *ex-officio* (senior director), Ms. Jamie Asher Hernandez, Ms. Kirsten Nadler, Ms. Katie Navickas, Ms. Peggy Soeldner, and Ms. Kelly Stapleton, managers, and Ms. Marjorie Hooper, operations coordinator, Ms. Bridget Blackwood, Mr. Nick Brattoli, Mr. Christopher Castaneda, Mr. Daniel Sloyan, senior project assistants, were in attendance. Ms. Bernadette Molina, site visit coordinator, attended virtually. Ms. Cathryn Albrecht, senior associate general counsel, CODA, was also in attendance.

Adoption of the Agenda: The agenda of the meeting was adopted.



Conflict of Interest Statement, Fiduciary Reminder, and Reminder of Professional Conduct Policy:

Ms. Cathryn Albrecht, senior associate general counsel, CODA, reminded the Commissioners of their fiduciary responsibilities and the CODA Conflict of Interest policy.

Approve the Minutes from Summer 2022 Meeting: The minutes of the Summer 2022 Meeting were approved.

Accreditation Mail Ballots Since Last Commission Meeting: The Commission approves for the record three (3) mail ballots submitted by the Dental Assisting Education Review Committee, the Dental Hygiene Education Review Committee, and the Standing Committee on Nominations, which have been considered since the Summer 2022 Commission meeting.

Consent Calendar: The following mail ballot approved since the last Commission meeting was placed on the consent calendar and was adopted as received:

- Report of the Review Committee on Postdoctoral General Dentistry Education (**Appendix 3**)
- Report of the Review Committee on Endodontics Education (**Appendix 4**)
- Report of the Review Committee on Oral and Maxillofacial Pathology Education (**Appendix 5**)
- Report of the Review Committee on Oral and Maxillofacial Radiology Education (**Appendix 6**)
- Report of the Review Committee on Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Education (**Appendix 7**)
- Report of the Review Committee on Pediatric Dentistry Education (**Appendix 8**)
- Report of the Review Committee on Periodontics Education (**Appendix 9**)
- Report of the Review Committee on Prosthodontics Education (**Appendix 10**)
- Report of the Review Committee on Oral Medicine Education (**Appendix 11**)

Report of the Review Committee on Predoctoral Dental Education (PREDOC RC): Committee

Chair: Dr. Cataldo Leone. Committee Members: Dr. Charles Berry, Mr. Drew Christianson, Mr. David Cushing, Dr. Ana Karina Mascarenhas, Dr. Thomas McConnell, Ms. Wilhemina Leeuw, and Dr. Linda Wells. Dr. Deborah Weisfuse-Lipner was unable to attend the meeting. Guests (Open Session Only): Dr. Sheila Brear, chief learning officer, American Dental Education Association and Dr. JoAnn Gurenlian, director, Education and Research, American Dental Hygienists' Association attended the policy portion of the meeting. Staff Members: Ms. Kelly Stapleton, manager, Predoctoral Dental Education, Mr. Nick Brattoli, senior project assistant, Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA), Dr. Sherin Took, director, Ms. Peggy Soeldner, manager, Advanced Dental Education, and Ms. Cathryn Albrecht, senior associate general counsel, CODA, attended a portion of the meeting.

The meeting of the Review Committee on Predoctoral Dental Education (PREDOC RC) was held on January 9-10, 2023 via a virtual meeting. The PREDOC RC report is found in **Appendix 12**.

Report on Predoctoral Dental Education Programs Annual Survey Curriculum Data and Curriculum Section: The Commission considered the report on the annual survey curriculum data and curriculum section.

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs the Annual Survey Curriculum Section for predoctoral dental education programs (**Appendix 13**) be retained as written for use in the August 2023 Survey of Dental Education.



Report on Dental Therapy Programs Annual Survey Curriculum Section: The Commission considered the report on the annual survey curriculum section.

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs the Annual Survey Curriculum Section for dental therapy education programs (**Appendix 14**) be retained as written for use in the August 2023 Survey of Dental Therapy Education.

Consideration of Proposed Revision to the Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs Related to Sleep-Related Breathing Disorders: The Commission considered the PREDOC RC's recommendation that there be no revision to the Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs at this time related to sleep breathing disorders. The Commission noted that sleep-related breathing disorders may be an important part of the screening process in dental education. Sleep related breathing disorders pose a health risk to patients, and dentists can provide sleep screenings. When reviewing educational standards for revision, there may be a need to document data on epidemiology of conditions. Recognition, screenings and management, including referral, should be considered by the Ad Hoc Committee to Review Dental Education Standards. Following consideration, the Commission took action to refer this topic to the Ad Hoc Committee to Review Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs.

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs the Ad Hoc Committee on Predoctoral Standards to review the topic of sleep-related breathing disorders during its review of the Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs.

Consideration of Proposed Revision to the Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs Related to Diversity: The Commission considered the proposed revision to the Dental Education standards related to diversity.

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs the Ad Hoc Committee to Review Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs to consider the proposed revisions to Standards 1-3, 1-4 and 4-4 submitted by the National Coalition of Dentists for Health Equity (NCDHE), with a future report to the Review Committee and Commission.

Report of the Review Committee on Dental Assisting Education (DA RC): Committee Chair: Ms. Martha McCaslin. Committee Members: Ms. Julie Bera, Ms. Kimberly Bland, Ms. Dorothea Cavallucci, Ms. Heather Ferris, Ms. Christy Ross, Dr. Preeti Sahasi, Dr. Debra Schneider, Ms. Melissa Siegel (attended a portion of the meeting), and Ms. Diana Williams. Guests (Open Session Only): Ms. Laura Skarnulis, chief executive officer, Dental Assisting National Board (DANB), and Mr. Aaron White, chief operating officer, DANB, attended the policy portion of the meeting. Staff Members: Ms. Jamie Asher Hernandez, manager, Allied Dental Education, Ms. Katie Navickas, manager, Allied Dental Education, and Mr. Daniel Sloyan, senior project assistant, Allied Dental Education, Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA). Dr. Sherin Tooks, director, CODA, attended a portion of the meeting.

The meeting of the Review Committee on Dental Assisting Education (DA RC) was held on January 12-13, 2023 via a virtual meeting. The DA RC report is found in **Appendix 15**.



Report on Dental Assisting Programs Annual Survey Curriculum Section: The Commission considered the report on the annual survey curriculum section.

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs the Dental Assisting Annual Survey Curriculum Section (**Appendix 16**) be retained with no changes for use in August 2023.

Consideration of Proposed Revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Dental Assisting Education Programs Related to Faculty: The Commission considered the proposed revisions to the Dental Assisting Education standards related to faculty and directed circulation for six (6) months.

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs the circulation of the proposed revision to Standard 3-6 of the Accreditation Standards for Dental Assisting Education Programs (**Appendix 15**) to the communities of interest for review and comment for a period of six (6) months, with Hearings in conjunction with the March 2023 American Dental Education Association (ADEA) Annual Session, with comments reviewed at the Commission's Summer 2023 meetings.

New Business: Dental Assisting Education Standards Regarding the Program Administrator and Faculty: There was no discussion on this report.

Commission Action: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

Report of the Review Committee on Dental Hygiene Education (DH RC): Committee Chair: Dr. Susan Kass. Committee Members: Ms. Denise Avrutik, Dr. Linda Boyd, Dr. Marcia Ditmyer, Ms. Patricia Guenther, Ms. Carrie Hobbs, Dr. Lorie Holt, Dr. Tariq Javed (attended a portion of the meeting), Dr. Barbara Krieg-Menning, Dr. Nancy Rosenthal, Ms. Laura Scully, Dr. Paul Francis Tayag Ayson, and Ms. Maiga Van Haalen. Guests (Open Session Only): Dr. JoAnn Gurenlian, director, Education and Research, American Dental Hygienists' Association, and Ms. Rebecca Stolberg, vice president, Allied Dental Education and Faculty Development, American Dental Education Association, attended the policy portion of the meeting. Staff Members: Dr. Sherin Tooks, director, Ms. Katie Navickas, manager, Allied Dental Education, and Mr. Daniel Sloyan, senior project assistant, Allied Dental Education, Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA). Ms. Cathryn Albrecht, senior associate general counsel, CODA, attended a portion of the meeting.

The meeting of the Review Committee on Dental Hygiene Education (DH RC) was held on January 10-11, 2023 via a virtual meeting. The DH RC report is found in **Appendix 17**.

Consideration of Proposed Revision to the Accreditation Standards for Dental Hygiene Education Programs: The Commission considered the proposed revision to the Dental Hygiene Education Standards related to periodontal classifications.

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs there be no revision at this time to Standard 2-14 (types of classifications of periodontal disease) of the Accreditation Standards for Dental Hygiene Education Programs.

Report on Dental Hygiene Programs Annual Survey Curriculum: The Commission considered the report on the annual survey of the curriculum section.



Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs the Dental Hygiene Annual Survey Curriculum Section (**Appendix 18**) be retained with no changes for use in August 2023.

New Business: Dental Hygiene Education Standards and Reporting Mechanisms: The Commission considered the new business related to Accreditation Standards for Dental Hygiene, specifically Standard 2-8 (general education courses) and 3-6 (faculty having current knowledge in the subjects they teach). Additionally, noting significant growth in enrollment increases in dental hygiene, the Commission considered the new business item proposing development of enrollment guidelines for dental hygiene education programs.

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs the Review Committee on Dental Hygiene Education to conduct Ad Hoc meetings of its available members in Spring 2023 to further discuss the Dental Hygiene Standards related to general education courses and faculty qualifications, and reporting mechanisms related to enrollment increases, with a report for further consideration by the Dental Hygiene Review Committee and Commission in Summer 2023.

Report of the Review Committee on Dental Laboratory Technology Education (DLT RC):

Committee Chair: Ms. Lonni Thompson. **Committee Members:** Ms. LaShun James, Ms. Sandra Kotowske, and Dr. Arpana Verma. **Guests (Open Session Only):** Mr. Bennett Napier, executive director, National Association of Dental Laboratories (NADL), and Ms. Rebecca Stolberg, vice president, Allied Dental Education and Faculty Development, American Dental Education Association (ADEA), attended the policy portion of the meeting. **Staff Members:** Ms. Jamie Asher Hernandez, manager, Allied Dental Education, Ms. Katie Navickas, manager, Allied Dental Education, and Mr. Daniel Sloyan, senior project assistant, Allied Dental Education, Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA). Ms. Peggy Soeldner, manager, Advanced Dental Education, CODA, attended a portion of the meeting.

The meeting of the Review Committee on Dental Laboratory Technology Education (DLT RC) was held on January 9, 2023 via a virtual meeting. The DLT RC report is found in **Appendix 19**.

The report was presented by Dr. Tooks on behalf of the DLT RC, due to the absence of Ms. Thompson.

Report on Dental Laboratory Technology Programs Annual Survey Curriculum Section: The Commission considered the report on the annual survey curriculum section.

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs the proposed revised Dental Laboratory Technology Annual Survey Curriculum Section (**Appendix 19**) be adopted for use in August 2023.

Report of the Review Committee on Dental Public Health Education (DPH RC): **Committee Chair:** Dr. Victor Badner. **Committee Members:** Dr. Bruce Dye, Dr. Maya Popova, Dr. Shannon Smith-Stephens, and Dr. Robert Weyant. **Guests (Open Session Only):** Dr. Frances Kim, executive director, American Association of Public Health Dentistry, Dr. Nadia Laniado, president, American Association of Public Health Dentistry, and Dr. Scott Tomar, president, American Board of Dental Public Health attended the policy portion of the meeting. **Staff Members:** Ms. Kirsten Nadler, manager, Advanced Dental Education, and Dr. Sherin Tooks, director, Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA).



The meeting of the Review Committee on Dental Public Health Education (DPH RC) was held on January 13, 2023 via a virtual meeting. The DPH RC report is found in **Appendix 20**.

Informational Report on Dental Public Health Programs Annual Survey Curriculum Data: There was no discussion on this report.

Commission Action: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

Consideration of Proposed Revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Dental Public Health: The Commission considered the proposed revisions to the Dental Public Health Education Standards.

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs adoption of the proposed revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Dental Public Health (**Appendix 20**), with implementation July 1, 2023.

Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Dental Public Health Standards: The Commission considered the report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Dental Public Health Standards and comments of the DPH RC. The Commission noted the revisions included removal of qualifying words, addition of requirements for written documentation of activities, and strengthening evidence-based dentistry in educational programs. The Commission was also informed about a new standard related to experience in dental care settings, which is new for dental public health since there are no clinical requirements in this discipline. The new standard proposes a rotation to dental care settings, which could be clinical or managerial to provide students/residents with experience in this aspect of public health dentistry. CODA also noted the recommendation of the DPH RC to retain program length as currently noted in the Standards. The Commission discussed the expectation that any discipline should ensure competence in areas of practice they will supervise or provide, for example preventive programs in dental public health settings. Therefore, if students/residents oversee clinical programs they must be competent to do so. The Commission noted that within dental public health, there is no specific clinical differences beyond general dentistry in the public health setting; however, the dental public health student/residents will learn about dental public health related aspects of working in a public health clinic. Some programs already provide clinical experience, though the implementation of the impact on populations is the critical piece of the educational component. Commissioners noted that for US-trained dentists an individual's clinical background may not be an issue; however, internationally trained dentists in dental public health programs may not have the same clinical background.

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs circulation of the proposed revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Dental Public Health (**Appendix 20**) to the communities of interest for review and comment for a period of one (1) year, with Hearings in conjunction with the March 2023 American Dental Education Association (ADEA) Annual Session and the October 2023 American Dental Association (ADA) Annual Meeting, with comments reviewed at the Commission's Winter 2024 meetings.

Report of the Review Committee on Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Education (OMS RC):

Committee Chair: Dr. George Kushner. Committee Members: Dr. Vasiliki Karlis, Mr. John Manahan, Dr. Pushkar Mehra, Dr. Jan Mitchell, Dr. Faisal Quereshy (attended a portion of the meeting). Guests (Open Session Only): Dr. Paul Schwartz, president, American Association of Oral and Maxillofacial



Surgeons (AAOMS); Dr. Mark Egbert, president elect, AAOMS; Ms. Mary Allaire-Schnitzer, associate executive director, Advanced Education and Professional Affairs, AAOMS; Ms. Laurie Oddo, manager, Advanced Education and Resident Affairs, AAOMS; and Dr. Sheila Brear, chief learning officer, American Dental Education Association, attended the policy portion of the meeting. **Staff Members:** Dr. Sherin Tooks, director, and Ms. Peggy Soeldner, manager, Advanced Dental Education, Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA). Mr. Christopher Castaneda, senior project assistant, CODA, attended a portion of the meeting.

The meeting of the Review Committee on Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Education (OMS RC) was held on January 10, 2023 via a virtual meeting. The OMS RC report is found in **Appendix 21**.

Informational Report on Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Programs (Residency and Fellowship) Annual Survey Curriculum Data: There was no discussion on this report.

Commission Action: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

Report on Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Programs (Residency and Fellowship) Annual Survey Curriculum Sections: The Commission considered the reports on the annual survey curriculum sections for residency and fellowship programs.

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs the Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Annual Survey Curriculum Section for oral and maxillofacial surgery residency programs (**Appendix 22**) be retained with no changes for use in August 2023.

The Commission on Dental Accreditation further directs the Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Annual Survey Curriculum Section for oral and maxillofacial surgery fellowship programs (**Appendix 23**) be retained with no changes for use in August 2023.

Consideration of Proposed Revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery: The Commission considered the proposed revisions to the Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Education standards. The Commission learned some of the proposed revisions relate to issues of resident wellness and resiliency.

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs further consideration of the proposed revisions for the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery (**Appendix 24**) be tabled pending further review of the proposed revisions and submission of additional information by the American Association of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgeons to address potential conflicts within the document and with the Commission's policies.

Report of the Review Committee on Dental Anesthesiology Education (DENTANES RC):

Committee Chair: Dr. Joseph Giovannitti. **Committee Members:** Dr. Gerard Kugel, Dr. Mana Saraghi, and Dr. Philip Yen. Ms. LaShun James was not in attendance. **Guest (Open Session Only):** Ms. Erin Baker, executive director, American Society of Dentist Anesthesiologists; Dr. Sheila Brear, chief learning officer, American Dental Education Association. **Staff Members:** Ms. Peggy Soeldner, manager, Advanced Dental Education and Ms. Bridget Blackwood, senior project assistant, CODA.



The meeting of the Review Committee on Dental Anesthesiology Education (DENTANES RC) was held on January 11, 2023 via a virtual meeting. The DENTANES RC report is found in **Appendix 25**.

Informational Report on Dental Anesthesiology Programs Annual Survey Curriculum Data: There was no discussion on this report.

Commission Action: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

Consideration of Proposed Revisions of the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Dental Anesthesiology: The Commission considered the proposed revisions to the Dental Anesthesiology Education standards. The Commission amended the proposal of the Review Committee to correctly name the Accreditation Standards.

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs adoption of Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Dental Anesthesiology including the proposed revisions to Standards 2-2 and 2-6 found in **Appendix 25** and related documents for implementation July 1, 2023.

Report of the Review Committee on Orofacial Pain Education (OFP RC): Committee Chair: Dr. Joseph Cohen. Committee Members: Dr. Steven Bender, Dr. Reny de Leeuw, Dr. Bessie Katsilometes, and Dr. Robert Windsor. Guest (Open Session Only): Dr. Sheila Brear, chief learning officer, American Dental Education Association, attended the policy portion of the meeting. Staff Members: Ms. Peggy Soeldner, manager, Advanced Dental Education, and Ms. Bridget Blackwood, senior project assistant, Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA).

The meeting of the Review Committee on Orofacial Pain Education (OFP RC) was held on January 9, 2023 via a virtual meeting. The OFP RC report is found in **Appendix 26**.

Informational Report on Orofacial Pain Programs Annual Survey Curriculum Data: There was no discussion on this report.

Commission Action: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

Progress Report on the 2022 Validity and Reliability Study of the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Orofacial Pain: The Commission considered the report on the Validity and Reliability Study of the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Orofacial Pain. Through discussion, the Commission noted that the definition of the discipline is very broad. It was noted that defining the areas of advanced dental education is not within the Commission's purview but rather falls within the purview of organizations that recognize the specialties of dentistry. The Commission noted a potential conflict if CODA were to define a discipline in one way, while a recognizing body defines the discipline another way. Following discussion, the Commission amended the proposed Standards to remove the definition of Orofacial Pain (i.e., Orofacial Pain: Disorders of the jaw, mouth, face, head and neck) prior to circulation for a period of public comment.

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs circulation of the proposed revisions found in **Appendix 26**, to the communities of interest for review and comment for one (1) year, with Hearings conducted in conjunction with the March 2023 American Dental Education Association (ADEA) Annual Session and the October 2023



American Dental Association (ADA) Annual Meeting, with comments reviewed at the Commission's Winter 2024 meetings.

Miscellaneous Affairs- Consideration of Matters Relating to More than One Review Committee

Informational Report of Review Committee and Commission Meeting Dates: The Commission reviewed meeting dates through Summer 2025.

Commission Action: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

Reminder of Professional Conduct Policy and Prohibition Against Harassment: The Commission was reminded of the Policy on Professional Conduct and Prohibition Against Harassment.

Commission Action: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

Consideration of Resolutions Adopted by the ADA House of Delegates and the ADA Board of Trustees Related to the Commission on Dental Accreditation and Dental Education: The Commission considered the resolutions adopted by the ADA House of Delegates and ADA Board of Trustees.

Commission Action: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

Miscellaneous Affairs-Matters for the Commission as a Whole

Report of the Standing Committee on Finance: The report of the Standing Committee on Finance can be found in **Appendix 27**. Below are actions taken by the Commission related to the Report of the Standing Committee on Finance.

Review of CODA Administrative Fund (Administrative Fund): There was no discussion on this report.

Commission Action: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

Review of ADA-CODA Shared Services Agreement: The Commission reviewed the Finance Committee's report related to the Shared Services Agreement.

Commission Action: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

Consideration of Ongoing Business and CODA Directives:

Timeline (Long-Term Plan) to Assume Total Expenses and Authority to Determine and Manage Annual Operating Budget: The Commission reviewed and acted on the Finance Committee recommendation regarding authority to determine and manage CODA's annual operating budget.

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs postponement of its plan to obtain sole authority to set and administer CODA's annual operating budget and consider this matter in a future year following completion of the CODA financial analysis study, and announcement of the ADA's new budget process through the strategic forecasting model.



Financial and Comparative Analysis Study: There was no discussion on this report.

Commission Action: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

Consideration of CODA Proposed 2024 Operating Budget and Fees: The Commission considered its 2024 operating budget and fees, noting it is fiscally responsible to cover all expenses. CODA also noted the current administrative fund balance and cap on this fund. Finally, CODA noted its international activities. Following consideration, the Commission took the following actions.

Annual Fees and Application Fees:

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs:

- Adopting a 0% increase in annual fees for all disciplines in 2024; \$8,380 for predoctoral dental education programs, \$2,100 for dental assisting, dental hygiene, dental therapy, and advanced dental education programs, and \$1,490 for dental laboratory technology programs.
- Affirming that during the year a program is due for a regular accreditation site visit, the annual fee will be doubled.
- Maintaining the application fees of \$67,400 for predoctoral dental education programs and \$16,850 for allied and advanced education programs.

International Fees (For CODA Accreditation Process):

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs:

- Maintaining the international predoctoral dental education application fee of \$76,660 in 2024.
- Maintaining the international predoctoral dental education annual accreditation fee of \$19,670 in 2024.
- Affirming that international predoctoral dental education programs pay all site visit expenses (actual expenses) for all site visits during the application and regular site visit schedule.
- Affirming that international predoctoral dental education programs pay an administrative fee of 25% of the total site visit cost for coordination of each site visit.
- Maintaining the International Consulting Fee (outside of PACV process) of \$5,000.
- Affirming that all international fees must be paid in U.S. Dollars.

Other Accreditation Fees:

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs:

- Maintaining the Special Focused Site Visit Administrative Fee of \$5,000.
- Maintaining the CODA Fee for Non-Compliance with CODA Policy on Privacy and Data Security (HIPAA) of \$4,000 per program per submission.
- Maintaining the Email/Contact Distribution List Fee of a \$200 minimum.
- Assessing the CODA Administrative Fund fee of \$25 per program in 2024.

International Fees (For International Consultation and Accreditation PACV Process):

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs maintaining the current Preliminary Accreditation and Consultation Visit (PACV) International Consultation and Accreditation Fees (**Appendix 27, sub appendix 7**).



Commission Policies Related to Fees: There was no discussion on this report.

Commission Action: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

Report of the Standing Committee on Quality Assurance and Strategic Planning (QASP): The report of the Standing Committee on Quality Assurance and Strategic Planning can be found in **Appendix 28**.

Consideration of 2022-2026 CODA Strategic Plan Tracking Sheet and Operational Effectiveness Tracking Sheet: There was no discussion on this report.

Commission Action: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

Consideration of Ongoing Quality Assurance and Strategic Planning Activities

Discussion on CODA Administrative Fund and the Shared Services Agreement between the Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA) and the American Dental Association (ADA): There was no discussion on this report.

Commission Action: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

Additional Quality Assurance and Strategic Planning Items for Discussion

Activities Related to the Commission on Dental Accreditation of Canada (CDAC): There was no discussion on this report.

Commission Action: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

Trends in Dental Education, Practice, Research, and Higher Education, and Update on United States Department of Education, General Accreditation Matters, and CODA Re-Recognition: There was no discussion on this report.

Commission Action: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

Report of the Standing Committee on Documentation and Policy Review: The report of the Standing Committee on Documentation and Policy Review can be found in **Appendix 29**. Below are actions taken by the Commission related to the Report of the Standing Committee on Documentation and Policy Review.

Directives from Winter 2022 and Summer 2022 Commission Meetings:

Policy on Enrollment Increases in Advanced Dental Education Programs: There was no discussion on this report.

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs that authorized enrollment not be implemented for programs in the disciplines of Advanced Education in General Dentistry, General Practice Residency, Dental Anesthesiology, Oral Medicine and Orofacial Pain at this time.



Discussion Related to Decline in CODA-Accredited Dental Assisting Programs: There was no discussion on this report.

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs adoption and immediate implementation of the proposed revision to the Policy on Discontinuance or Closure of Educational Programs Accredited by the Commission and Teach-Out Plans found in **Appendix 29**, including the revision of the Policy in the Commission's EOPP, Guidelines for Preparing a Teach-Out Report, and in all appropriate Commission documents.

Consideration of Proposed Revisions to Miscellaneous Policies: The Commission reviewed the report of the Standing Committee and concurred with its recommendations related to revision of Commission policies and procedures found in the Evaluation and Operational Policies and Procedures (EOPP) manual.

The Commission reviewed the following policy:

- *Review Committees and Review Committee Meetings, section on Policy on Attendance at Open Portion of Review Committee Meetings:*

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs there be no revision to the Policy On Attendance At Open Portion Of Review Committee Meetings at this time.

The Commission also reviewed the following policies:

- *Site Visitors:*
- *Site Visit Procedures, section on Enrollment Requirements for Site Visits for Fully Developed Programs:*
- *Policy on Non-Enrollment of First Year Students/Residents:*
- *Policy and Procedures Regarding Investigation of Complaints Against Educational Programs:*
- *Due Process Related to Appeal of Accreditation Status Decisions:*
- *Review of Policies Referencing Delivery Mode of Correspondence:*

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs adoption and immediate implementation of the proposed revisions to policies found in **Appendix 29**, including the revision of policies in the Commission's EOPP and in all appropriate Commission documents.

Report of the Standing Committee on Communication and Technology: The report of the Standing Committee on Communication and Technology can be found in **Appendix 30**. While the report was informational, a summary of activity was provided by the Chair of the Standing Committee on Communication and Technology.

CODA Website Analytics: There was no discussion on this report.

Commission Action: This report is informational in nature and no action is required.

2019-2023 Communication Plan: There was no discussion on this report.

Commission Action: This report is informational in nature and no action is required.

Electronic Accreditation Platform: There was no discussion on this report.



Commission Action: This report is informational in nature and no action is required.

Report of the Ad Hoc Committee to Consider a Request to Establish a Process of Accreditation for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Operative Dentistry, Cariology and Biomaterials: The Commission considered the report and recommendations of the Ad Hoc Committee to Consider a Request to Establish a Process of Accreditation for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Operative Dentistry, Cariology and Biomaterials (**Appendix 31**). The Commission noted that the scope of the discipline in operative dentistry, cariology and biomaterials had significant overlap with other disciplines. The portion of the discipline related to cariology, while unique, was not well defined and not a predominate aspect of the discipline. The Commission agreed with the findings of the Ad Hoc Committee. While in agreement with the analysis of the Ad Hoc Committee, a Commissioner also noted there is difficulty in hiring faculty to teach operative dentistry, cariology and biomaterials, though there may not be a need for practitioners in general dentistry specific to this area. Following discussion, the Commission noted that criteria and guidelines are set forth to evaluate disciplines requesting establishment of an accreditation process; if the Commission wants to change those criteria, it could do so in the future.

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs that the Commission not establish a process of accreditation for advanced dental education programs in operative dentistry, cariology and biomaterials at this time.

The Commission on Dental Accreditation further directs that it formally communicate its decision not to establish a process of accreditation for advanced dental education programs in operative dentistry, cariology and biomaterials to the Academy of Operative Dentistry.

Report of the Ad Hoc Committee to Consider Advanced Dental Education Delivery Models: The Commission considered the report and recommendations of the Ad Hoc Committee to Consider Advanced Dental Education Delivery Models (**Appendix 32**).

Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs all advanced dental education Review Committees to consider the proposed revisions to advanced dental education Standards found in **Appendix 32**, related to sponsoring organization and authority to operate, for possible adoption and implementation, with a report to the Commission in Summer 2023.

Commission on Dental Accreditation Update on Re-Recognition by the United States Department of Education: Dr. Sherin Took, Senior Director, CODA provided a brief update on the Commission's re-recognition petition with the United States Department of Education, noting the Commission was re-recognized for a period of five (5) years (**Appendix 33**).

Consideration of a Letter from State Dental Associations Related to Allied Dental Education Standards: The Commission considered a letter from 17 state dental associations related to workforce shortages in dental assisting and dental hygiene, and requesting several actions by the Commission, including: immediate changes to the faculty to student ratios, establishment of an ad hoc group to draft rationale for establishing ratios, soliciting feedback from broad dental communities, and ensuring ratios are consistent with CODA-established rationale (**Appendix 34**). The Commission first noted that since 2019 there had been seven (7) new dental assisting and 14 new dental hygiene programs accredited by the Commission. The Commission also noted the number of enrollment increases approved, in particular for dental hygiene, over the past several meetings. Related specifically to dental hygiene, from February



2022 to the present meeting, the Commission considered approximately 35 enrollment requests, with 310 additional student positions approved. There were an additional number of enrollment increase reports under continued review.

Regarding the first request of the state associations, asking for an immediate change in the standards, the Commission noted that use of the term allied dental programs/personnel is preferred over the term dental auxiliary programs/personnel. Additionally, the Commission's process of standards revisions generally calls for a period of public comment. Further, there appeared to be insufficient rationale for the requested change. In further discussion of this topic, the Commission believed there could be other reasons why a program does not increase enrollment, including but not limited to facility capacity, also noting that during COVID-19 many programs could not support full enrollment within existing facilities.

The Commission also questioned whether increasing faculty to student ratios would increase the workforce, citing that an increase in students would require additional faculty with appropriate teaching credentials. Related specifically to dental assisting, the Commission discussed the declining number of programs, noting that in many states a dental assistant is not licensed and graduation from a CODA-accredited educational program is not required for practice. The Commission is looking at the reasons why dental assisting programs are discontinuing accreditation and/or closing. The Commission also noted that in dental hygiene, the current faculty to student ratio for radiology, preclinical and clinical instruction is 1 to 5, while the state associations requested that dental assisting, dental hygiene, and dental therapy all have a 1 to 6 faculty to student ratio. Some Commissioners believed that the Commission should request direct evidence that a change in faculty to student ratios would impact the workforce shortage in the states of each dental association, noting that the Commission's role does not include oversight of workforce needs. While the state associations made a connection between student to faculty ratios and the workforce, there was no direct data provided to support this connection. Additionally, the Commission discussed that its mission is to ensure the quality of education. The Commission was reminded that this same concept was considered in Summer 2022, regarding faculty to student ratios, with explanations from both the dental hygiene and dental assisting Review Committees as to why changes to standards were not appropriate at that time. Some Commissioners believed the ratios may be too prescriptive and that the Commission should ensure resources and infrastructure are sufficient (i.e., personnel, financial resources, facilities and equipment, information technology), though numbers of faculty to students may vary from program to program and should be based upon the type of student admitted to the program and the program's resources. Therefore, dictating faculty to student ratios in Accreditation Standards may be an overreach by the Commission and should be left to the program director. Other Commissioners supported faculty to student ratios in Accreditation Standards, indicating that ratios help to ensure academic quality, and assure that institutions support programs from an academic perspective rather than a fiscal perspective.

Following discussion of options to further study this request, the Commission concluded that an Ad Hoc Committee should consider this matter, including a review of ratios within the Commission's Accreditation Standards. Additionally, the Commission believed that the 17 state dental associations should be requested to provide information related to all the factors affecting the workforce shortage, and information or evidence that changes to faculty to student ratios in the educational Standards would have an impact on workforce shortages in their states.



Commission Action: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs a communication to the state dental associations requesting information on the request related to workforce shortages in dental assisting and dental hygiene.

The Commission on Dental Accreditation further directs establishment of an Ad Hoc Committee to consider ratios within the Commission's Accreditation Standards.

Update on USDE and Higher Education Accreditation Issues: The Commission received an update related to issues in higher education accreditation and the USDE.

Survey of Meeting: Commissioners were reminded to complete the electronic post-meeting survey following the meeting. The survey is important for determining whether the Commission is achieving its goals for the year and how the virtual meeting technology performed for this meeting.

New Business: There was no new business considered by the Commission.

Adjourn: The Commission adjourned the open session at 12:33 P.M.
