America's leading advocate for oral health

Page **1** of **12** CDEL Minutes January 2020

COUNCIL ON DENTAL EDUCATION AND LICENSURE AMERICAN DENTAL ASSOCIATION HEADQUARTERS BUILDING, CHICAGO JANUARY 16-17, 2020

**Call to Order:** Dr. Linda C. Niessen, chair, called a regular meeting of the Council on Dental Education and Licensure to order on Thursday, January 16, 2020 at 8:30 a.m. in the Board Room of the ADA Headquarters Building in Chicago.

**Roll Call:** Dr. GeriAnn DiFranco, Dr. Bruce R. Donoff, Dr. Daniel A. Hammer, Dr. Uri Hangorsky, Dr. Willis Stanton Hardesty Jr., Dr. Steven M. Lepowsky, Dr. Jun S. Lim, Dr. William M. Litaker, Dr. Maurice S. Miles, Dr. James D. Nickman, Dr. Linda C. Niessen, Dr. Joan Otomo-Corgel, Dr. Jacqueline Plemons, and Dr. Donna Thomas-Moses were present. Dr. David F. Boden, Dr. Rekha C. Gehani and Dr. David L. Nielson attended portions of the meeting.

Dr. John F. Harrington attended as the ADA Board Liaison to the Council. Mr. Craig McKenzie attended as student liaison of the American Student Dental Association.

 The following guests attended portions of the meeting: Ms. Catherine Baumann, Director, National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards, Ms. Mary Borysewicz, Director, Commission for Continuing Education Provider Recognition, Dr. Joseph Crowley, Chair, Coalition for Modernizing Dental Licensure, Dr. Benoit Soucy, Director, Clinical and Scientific Affairs, Canadian Dental Association, Dr. Denice Stewart, Chief Policy Officer, American Dental Education Association, Dr. Sherin Tooks, Director, Commission on Dental Accreditation and Dr. David Waldschmidt, Director, Testing Services and Secretary, Joint Commission on National Dental Examinations.

In addition to the Council staff, the following ADA staff members attended all or portions of the meeting: Ms. Cathryn Albrecht, Senior Associate General Counsel, Ms. Jennifer Donahue, Manager, State Legislation & Regulation, State Government Affairs, Mr. Thomas Elliott, Deputy General Counsel and Director, Council on Ethics, Bylaws and Judicial Affairs, Dr. Chad P. Gehani, President, Dr. Kathleen J. Hinshaw, Senior Manager, Operations, Department of Testing Services, Ms. Heidi M. Nickisch-Duggan, Director, ADA Library and Archives, Dr. Kathleen T. O'Loughlin, Executive Director, Mr. Chad Olson, Director, State Government Affairs, Ms. Nicole Strayhorn, Data Informationist, ADA Library and Archives and Dr. Anthony J. Ziebert, Senior Vice-President, Education and Professional Affairs.

Adoption of Agenda, Disclosure of Business or Personal Relationships, and ADA Professional Conduct Policy: The Council approved the agenda, and authorized the chair to alter the order of the agenda items as necessary to expedite business. Dr. Niessen directed the Council's attention to the ADA Disclosure Policy. During the Licensure Matters portion of the meeting, Dr. DiFranco and Dr. Miles disclosed that they are examiners for the Commission on Dental Competency (CDCA). Dr. Litaker disclosed his examiner status with CDCA and the Council of Interstate Testing Agencies (CITA).

**<u>Affirmation of E-mail Ballots:</u>** The Council acknowledged e-mail ballots since the June 2019 meeting:

- a. Minutes: June 27-28, 2019 Meeting (Ballot 2019-4)
- b. Minutes: August 20, 2019 Conference Call (Ballot 2019-3)
- c. Minutes: October 21, 2019 Conference Call (Ballot 2019-5)
- d. Minutes: December 11, 2019 Conference Call (2019-6)

America's leading advocate for oral health

Page **2** of **12** CDEL Minutes January 2020

Consent Calendar: A consent calendar was prepared to expedite the business of the Council. Dr. Niessen reminded Council members that any report, recommendation or resolution could be removed from the consent calendar for discussion. The following reports in their entirety were placed on the consent calendar and adopted as received:

### **Dental Education Committee:**

Update on Activities of the Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA)

Actions Taken by the 2019 House of Delegates

#### Licensure Committee:

Update on the Progress of the DLOSCE Steering Committee

### **Anesthesiology Committee:**

Email Communication Regarding Proposed Changes to Texas Medical Board Rules

### Reports of Related Groups

ADA Board of Trustees Liaison: On behalf of the Board of Trustees, Dr. Harrington provided the Council with an update on ADA Board activities. The Board voted in May 2019 to narrow the focus of the ADA Foundation and create the ADA Science and Research Institute by combining the Science Institute and the Volpe Research Center. The Board of Directors of the Science and Research Institute was approved in December 2019. The ADA ended its relationship with CVS in September of 2019. In December 2019 the ADA adopted an interim policy on vaping that is in alignment with the American Medical Association's new policies on vaping. The new strategic plan, "Common Ground 2025" has been initiated.

**American Association of Dental Boards (AADB):** The Executive Director of the AADB was unable to attend the meeting, and no report was submitted.

 American Dental Education Association (ADEA): Dr. Stewart highlighted recent ADEA events and activities. The ADEA Snapshot of Dental Education, a collection of data on topics of particular interest to dental school deans, program directors, faculty, students, residents and fellows, has recently been issued. Dr. Stewart reported that the Interprofessional Education Collaborative (IPEC) is holding its 18th faculty development institute titled, "Building Effective IPE for Collaborative Practice" on May 19-21, 2020 in Washington D.C. ADEA is proud to be a member of the Coalition for Modernizing Dental Licensure and was excited to share that the majority of the Coalition member and supporter organizations are dental schools (63%). The ADEA Commission on Change and Innovation will convene a work group in February 2020 to assess competencies, review curricular development within its institution and strategize a path forward in a three-phase initiative. Dr. Stewart highlighted the ADEA Academic Dental Careers Fellowship Program (ADCFP), a program that connects dental students or Fellows with a faculty mentor to provide students insight into the day-to-day life of a faculty educator or researcher. Over the last five years, an average of 113 students and Fellows at 35 dental schools in the US and Canada have participated in the ADCFP.

ADEA is committed to developing and increasing the number of ADEA Chapters to ensure that dental students are aware that academic dental careers are an option. As of December 2019, there are 59 ADEA Chapters across the United States and Canada, an increase of 13.46% as compared to the previous year. Dr. Stewart concluded her report by informing the Council that ADEA, together with the

America's leading advocate for oral health

Page **3** of **12** CDEL Minutes January 2020

American Dental Association and American Association of Pediatric Dentistry, supports the faculty loan repayment program.

Canadian Dental Association (CDA): Dr. Soucy updated the Council on the progress of the work of the Committee on the Identification of Future Dentists, which includes the identification of research projects related to admissions to be funded by the CDA as the result of an agreement reached in 2017 with the Association of Canadian Faculties of Dentistry. CDA is also looking at how to monitor and publish better information on applicants to Canadian dental schools and ways to screen dental school applicants for stress resilience. Dr. Soucy reported that although the Commission on Dental Accreditation of Canada (CDAC) is housed within the CDA, the CDAC is independent of the CDA, reporting information to the CDA through the CDA Commission representatives. Pressure is being placed on the regulators to be more transparent and their inability to manage complaints is in question. In addition, he provided information on the status of the Commission on Dental Accreditation of Canada (CDAC) and changes affecting the certification for licensure of specialists. Regulators would like to see a change in the composition of CDAC specifically increased regulator representation. Lastly, the Royal College of Canada, the certifying agency for specialists, is also under question by regulators; regulators would prefer that the agency be managed by the National Dental Examining Board of Canada (NDEB).

Commission of Dental Accreditation (CODA): Dr. Tooks shared that the Unofficial Report of Major Actions from the August 1-2, 2019 meeting and CODA's first annual report to its communities of interest are posted on the Commission's website. Dr. Tooks reminded the Council that the publishing of an annual report by CODA was as a result of the ADA 2018 House of Delegates adopting Resolution 39H-2018. In December 2019, CODA implemented an annual mandatory site visitor training; additional information is located in the minutes section titled, "Emerging Issues, Trends and Miscellaneous Affairs, CODA Site Visitor Training." CODA appointed two Ad Hoc Committees, one to study the Commission's Review Committee and Board of Commissioners structure and function and another Ad Hoc Committee to study the use of sites where educational activity occurs (domestic and international) for all programs under its purview. The Commission also has directed that each review committee review the application of the term "should" in the Accreditation Standards for dental education programs in all disciplines. Dr. Tooks announced that currently CODA staff are preparing for the January 30-31, 2020 CODA meeting.

 In 2019, the Commission conducted ten validity and reliability studies of accreditation standards. In 2020, the predoctoral dental education standards will undergo a validity and reliability study. Dr. Tooks highlighted that in August 2019, the Commission accredited its first international accreditation program, King Abdulaziz University in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia. Dr. Tooks concluded her report by updating the Council on U.S. Department of Education (USDE) activities, noting that the regulations for the Higher Education Act were reauthorized late last year and there seems to be a shift calling for more transparency within the Department itself. The Commission will soon undergo its periodic review by the USDE; the Council will be updated at its June meeting when more information becomes available.

Joint Commission on National Dental Examinations (JNCDE): Dr. David Waldschmidt, as Secretary of the Joint Commission on National Dental Examinations (JCNDE), shared that the Integrated National Dental Board Examination (INDBE) will be available for administration on August 1, 2020 with discontinuation of NBDE Part I on July 31, 2020 and NBDE Part II on July 31, 2022. The fee for the INBDE will be \$680. Dr. Waldschmidt emphasized that the actions of the October 2018 House of Delegates were consistent with the direction the JCNDE would like to go by creating better alignment in governance structure across all Commissions and expanding focus to include all oral health care professionals, not only dentists and allied dental groups. On January 15, 2020 the JCNDE was

America's leading advocate for oral health

Page **4** of **12** CDEL Minutes January 2020

informed that the ADA Board of Trustees voted to transfer governance of the Dental Licensure Objective Structured Clinical Examination (DLOSCE) to the Joint Commission, including transference of the Steering Committee.

National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards (NCRDSCB): Ms. Baumann shared that the next Commission meeting is scheduled for March 2-3, 2020 during which time the Commission will be looking to adopt a strategic plan. Ms. Baumann concluded her report by expressing her appreciation on behalf of the Commission for the Council's thoughtful and in-depth comments on the applications for recognition.

 Commission on Continuing Education Provider Recognition (CCEPR): Ms. Mary Borysewicz gave an update on the Commission on Continuing Education Provider Recognition (CCEPR). She shared that CCEPR approved moving forward with participation in Joint Accreditation for Interprofessional Continuing Education which allows for obtaining CE provider accreditation through a single unified process. Providers who are approved through joint accreditation may achieve CERP approval as well as provide CE to interprofessional audiences. At the 2019 ADA House of Delegates, CCEPR was granted the ability to approve its own rules. Subsequently, it added a public member and a member appointed by the American Society of Dental Anesthesiologists to the composition of the Commission.

Senior Vice President, Education/Professional Affairs: Dr. Anthony Ziebert reported on activities within the ADA Division of Education and Professional Affairs. As of November 2019, the Division budget was on track to meet all revenue projections. There were some unanticipated expenses related to the DLOSCE associated with 3D imaging that will likely be offset by the transfer of the DLOSCE to the JCNDE; the Dental Admission Test (DAT) Program is on budget. Dr. Ziebert noted the many Division successes in 2019 highlighting the changes to the ADA *Bylaws and Governance Manual* that allow for all the commissions to create and adopt their own rules. Dr. Ziebert received an invitation to write a peer-reviewed paper for the California Dental Association Journal about Objective Structured Clinical Exams (OSCE) and provide an update on the DLOSCE. He shared the focus of the Division in 2020 will continue to be development of the DLOSCE, growth of the CMDL and development of the admission test for dental hygiene programs, all of which are multi-year projects.

 American Student Dental Association (ASDA): Mr. McKenzie summarized the goals that ASDA adopted for its 2018-2020 strategic plan and highlighted that during the 2018-19 membership year, ASDA had a total of 24,829 members and 66 chapters with plans to add two more chapters. ASDA is currently reviewing its Business Model and looking for ways to increase non-dues revenue and in doing so, has been focused on engaging ASDA Alumni. Mr. McKenzie shared that the ASDA Board of Trustees will be meeting this weekend (January 18-19, 2020) in Chicago to approve the budget and leaders for election. ASDA's Annual Session is also coming up on March 4-7, 2020 and will be held in St. Louis, MO. Mr. McKenzie provided a brief overview of the five pieces of legislation currently being supported by ASDA's Council on Advocacy, the Council that represents the interests of dental students on legislative and regulatory issues that impact the dental profession. Mr. McKenzie concluded his report with the following remarks: ASDA continues to be a proud founding member of the Coalition for Modernizing Dental Licensure; ASDA will continue to encourage members to become active in many dental organizations; and ASDA looks forward to celebrating its 50th Anniversary in 2021 in Chicago.

### **Committee Reports**

**Dental Education Committee:** Dr. Uri Hangorsky presented the Committee's comments and recommendations to the Council. The following summarizes the agenda items discussed and the Council's actions.

Page **5** of **12** CDEL Minutes January 2020

 Annual Report of the National Board for Certification in Dental Laboratory Technology (NBC): The Council reviewed the Annual Report submitted by the National Board for Certification in Dental

The Council reviewed the Annual Report submitted by the National Board for Certification in Dental Laboratory Technology in relation to the ADA's *Criteria for Approval of a Certification Board for Dental Laboratory Technicians*. The Council noted several of the NBC's activities and initiatives during the past year such as: NBC's efforts to increase accessibility to its candidates by transitioning its written examinations entirely to computer-based testing with remote proctoring beginning January 1, 2020; refreshing the CDT logo in 2019; and NBC's Independent Financial Audit for the year ending December 31, 2018 showing a "clean audit." At the Committee's recommendation, the Council accepted the NBC Report.

<u>Action</u>: The Council accepted the 2019 Annual Report of the National Board for Certification in Dental Laboratory Technology.

Annual Report of the Dental Assisting National Board, Inc. (DANB): The Council reviewed DANB's report in light of the *Criteria for Recognition of a Certification Board for Dental Assistants*. The Council noted the following updates: the overall passing percentage for all exam candidates taking the General Chairside portion of the CDA exam has been 84-85% through December 31, 2018; the CDA/GC Pathway I candidate pass rate is at or higher than 85%; the CDA/GC Pathway II candidates pass is at a rate lower than 85%; as of August 31, 2019, DANB has 36,755 CDA Certificants; at its August 9-10, 2019 meeting, the DANB Board of Directors approved a FY 2019-2020 budget of approximately \$9.6 million in revenue and expenses; and DANB has just over \$4.2 million in reserves. At the Committee's recommendation, the Council accepted the DANB Annual Report.

<u>Action</u>: The Council accepted the 2019 Annual Report of the Dental Assisting National Board, Inc.

Consideration of Proposed Revision to the Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs (Standard 2-24k): During its summer 2019 meetings, CODA considered proposed revisions to Standard 2-24k of the Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs related to the inclusion of a minimal clinical competency requirement for the management of temporomandibular disorders (TMD) as requested by the American Academy of Orofacial Pain (AAOP).

The Dental Education Committee agreed and the Council concurred that while inclusion of temporomandibular disorders is appropriate to note within Standard 2-24k, graduates should be required to *manage* temporomandibular disorder rather than *demonstrate competence* in treating temporomandibular disorder. Accordingly, the Council proposed the following alternative amendment (proposed addition is underscored):

- **2-24** At a minimum, graduates **must** be competent in providing oral health care within the scope of general dentistry, as defined by the school, including:
  - a. patient assessment, diagnosis, comprehensive treatment planning, prognosis, and informed consent;
  - b. screening and risk assessment for head and neck cancer;
  - c. recognizing the complexity of patient treatment and identifying when referral is indicated;
  - d. health promotion and disease prevention;
  - e. local anesthesia, and pain and anxiety control, including consideration of the impact of prescribing practices and substance use disorder;
  - f. restoration of teeth;

Page 6 of 12 CDEL Minutes January 2020

- g. communicating and managing dental laboratory procedures in support of patient care;
  h. replacement of teeth including fixed, removable and dental implant prosthodontic therapies;
  - therapies;
    i. periodontal therapy;
    - j. pulpal therapy;
    - k. oral mucosal and osseous disorders;
    - I. hard and soft tissue surgery;
    - m. dental emergencies;
    - n. malocclusion and space management; and
    - o. evaluation of the outcomes of treatment, recall strategies, and prognosis; and
    - p. management of temporomandibular disorder.

<u>Action</u>: The Council directed that written comment be sent to CODA noting its opposition to the current proposed amendment to Standard 2-24 of the Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs and proposing the alternative amendment noted above.

Consideration of Proposed Revision to the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Pediatric Dentistry (all Standards): During its summer 2019 meetings, CODA considered proposed revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Pediatric Dentistry and circulated the proposed amendments to the communities of interest for review and comment.

The Council's Dental Education Committee carefully reviewed and supported the proposed revisions. The Council concurred with its Dental Education Committee that the revisions provide additional clarification and better reflect the changing landscape in pediatric dentistry education and practice.

<u>Action</u>: The Council directed that written comment be sent to CODA supporting the proposed revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Pediatric Dentistry.

Review of Transitioning from Practice to Dental Education CE Course: The Council discussed the CE course titled, "Transitioning from Practice to Dental Education," a one-hour continuing education course, offered at the ADA Annual Meeting, that explores changing careers from dental practice to dental education. The Council discussed various details regarding the course such as expanding the course content, promoting the course offering through the American Dental Education Association (ADEA), and the possibility of offering this course as an online continuing education course to ensure the course is offered more consistently. When submitting the course proposal for the ADA Annual Meeting, the Council faces competition with over 300 course proposals and sometimes the "Transitioning from Practice to Dental Education" course does not get approved and/or offered. After some discussion, the Council supported the continuing education course presented annually at ADA Meetings and determined that efforts to encourage dentists to pursue dental education as a career option should continue to be explored.

<u>Action</u>: The Council directed that the Dental Education Committee continue its exploration of additional courses and/or opportunities encouraging dentists to pursue dental education as a career option.

**Licensure Committee:** Dr. Jacqueline Plemons presented the Committee's comments and recommendations to the Council.

America's leading advocate for oral health

Page 7 of 12 CDEL Minutes January 2020

Update on the Coalition for Modernizing Dental Licensure: Summarized elsewhere in the minutes.

**Update on the Progress of the DLOSCE Steering Committee:** Summarized elsewhere in the minutes.

**Update on the CRDTS and CDCA Testing Initiatives:** The Central Regional Dental Testing Service (CRDTS) announced in the summer of 2019 the development of an all-manikin dental examination for use as a remediation or re-licensure tool by state dental boards. The Commission on Dental Competency Assessments (CDCA) announced on October 16, 2019 the introduction of high-fidelity items to the ADEX Dental Skills Examination (DSE) OSCE. The Licensure Committee had suggested and the Council chair approved extending invitations to the presidents of CRDTS and CDCA to attend the January Council meeting and provide updates on their respective initiatives. Both agencies declined the invitations to meet with the Council.

**Update on Changes in State Regulations:** The Committee reviewed and discussed a written report highlighting legislation related to dental licensure and education regulation introduced or enacted in 2019. Of note, Connecticut HB 7303, enacted on July 7, 2018, states that after July 1, 2021 any clinical examination utilized for licensure cannot require the participation of a patient. Additionally, the Dental Board of California voted on November 15, 2019 for immediate acceptance of the American Board of Dental Examiners (ADEX) exam for licensure.

**Discussion of Dental Compacts:** The Committee discussed the June 2019 directive from the Council to study further the feasibility of establishing dental licensure compact(s) among interested states. Included in the discussion were the possible benefits and risks to the establishment of dental compacts. Dr. Plemons, Dr. Lim, and Dr. Boden agreed to serve on a subcommittee to further study the matter and provide a report to the Council at its January 2020 meeting. The presentation summarized the scope of their future research to gain a deeper understanding of the background of dental compacts, review of compacts currently in place in other health care professions and their impact, and evaluate the pros and cons for member dentists, patients, the profession, the ADA and state dental boards. The Council agreed that more information is necessary to continue its study of this topic.

**2020 CDEL Review of ADA Policies Report:** CDEL and the Licensure Committee were tasked in 2020, per the Board of Trustees established protocol on periodic review of ADA policies, to review, *Dentistry as an Independent Profession* and *Dentistry*. The Committee considered and supported a proposal by Dr. Niessen and Dr. Plemons to combine the two policies into one declarative positive statement that defines the independent profession of dentistry and notes dentistry's commitment to professionalism and interprofessional health. The Committee sought input on the proposed statement from the Council on Dental Practice (CDP) and the Council on Ethics, Bylaws and Judicial Affairs (CEBJA). The Council considered the CDP and CEBJA input and concluded that the two policies should be combined at noted below (additions are underlined and deletions are stricken):

**Resolved**, that the profession of dentistry is defined as the evaluation, diagnosis, prevention and/or treatment (nonsurgical, surgical or related procedures) of diseases, disorders and/or conditions of the oral cavity, maxillofacial area and/or the adjacent and associated structures and their impact on the human body, provided by a dentist dentists, within the scope of his/her their education, training and experience, in accordance with the ethics of the profession and applicable law, and be it further

America's leading advocate for oral health

Page 8 of 12 CDEL Minutes January 2020

**Resolved**, that dentistry is and should remain an independent health care profession that safeguards, promotes and provides care for the health of the public in collaboration with other health care professionals.

Further, the Council supported rescission of the policy *Dentistry as an Independent Profession* (Trans. 1995:640).

<u>Action</u>: The Council directed that a resolution be transmitted to the 2020 House of Delegates calling for the policy *Dentistry* to be amended as noted above and the rescission of the policy *Dentistry as an Independent Profession*.

**Anesthesiology Committee:** Dr. R. Bruce Donoff summarized the agenda items discussed by the Committee.

Consideration of Amendments to the 2016 ADA Guidelines for Teaching Pain Control and Sedation to Dentists and Dental Students: Actions to date regarding the development of teaching guidelines focused solely on pediatric pain control and sedation were reviewed. A draft developed by the subcommittee was discussed, and the whole committee agreed on the need to clearly identify the factors that define a pediatric patient. Work developing the draft will continue by the subcommittee. The Committee considered proposed dates for the 2020 consensus conference that will be hosted by the ADA with the \$25,000 grant of financial support provided by the American Dental Society of Anesthesiologists (ADSA), as well as potential invitees from the communities of interest.

Consideration of Proposed Revision to the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Pediatric Dentistry: The Council and its Dental Education and Anesthesiology Committees were requested to review and consider the proposed revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Pediatric Dentistry and recommend if any additional action should be taken during the comment period. Members of the Committee on Anesthesiology noted and agreed with the Dental Education Committee that the Council should support the proposed revisions.

**Update on "Review of Medical Emergencies in the Dental Office: Response Guide":** The suggested changes made by the subcommittee members identified to review the ADA resource, "Review of Medical Emergencies in the Dental Office: Response Guide" were supported by the entire Anesthesiology Committee, approved by the CDEL chair and transmitted to the editor of the resource in the fall of 2019.

**Continuing Education Committee:** Dr. David Nielson provided an update on the Continuing Education Committee's activities and considerations.

**Update on CE Developers Group:** The ADACE Developer's Group (staff) which includes representation from all departments at the ADA, meets quarterly to ensure high quality continuing education products that align with the Strategic Plan. At its last meeting in October 2019, the group heard a summary on the CE offered at the 2019 Annual Meeting, generated a comprehensive list of non-Annual Meeting CE plans for 2020 across all councils and committees, discussed the CE course submission process, and heard an update on Cadmium, the CE course review platform.

**Consideration of ADA Continuing Education Department Report:** Revenue and usage of ADA CE have increased, with a top line revenue growth of 36% over 2018 actuals. The online assessment based ADA Coding Certificate Program, initiated by the Business Innovation Committee and approved

America's leading advocate for oral health

Page 9 of 12 CDEL Minutes January 2020

by the Board of Trustees, is being developed for the allied dental team members and is scheduled for launch in the first quarter of 2020. All 2018 graduates from dental school have been provided with a free 2-year ADA CE Online subscription as a way to introduce them to the CE products and encourage the use of these services throughout their careers.

4 5 6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17 18

19

20 21

22 23

24

1 2

3

Update on Council and Committee Planned Continuing Education: The Committee received updates from the councils and committee represented on the Council's Continuing Education Committee. The Advisory Committee on Annual Meetings shared that scheduling of CE for the ADA 2020 Meeting in Orlando is almost complete, and preparations for Las Vegas in 2021 are underway. The Council on Dental Education and Licensure highlighted the two courses the Council is planning for 2020 which include "Transitioning from Practice to Dental Education" and the consensus conference of stakeholders to discuss proposed Guidelines for Teaching Pediatric Pain Control and Sedation to Dentists and Dental Students. The Council on Dental Practice has planned the Elder Care Symposium for August 7, 2020 to focus on promoting awareness and providing information and solutions for improvement in the delivery of care to this population. The Council on Ethics, Bylaws and Judicial Affairs intends to investigate the ethical impact natural disasters have on dental practices, and also shared that the Ethics Hotline is going to be eliminated due to low usage. The Council on Scientific Affairs (CSA) sponsored nine practical CE courses at the 2019 ADA Annual Meeting and also hosted an evidence-based dentistry workshop, "Dentistry for the Modern Age", in mid-November drawing 46 clinician participants. CSA together with the ADA Science Institute are planning to offer more interactive CE activities at the 2020 ADA Annual Meeting and is also planning on expanding the quiz format of the Journal of the American Dental Association (JADA) articles. The JADA editorial board is discussing ways to increase participation and make JADA articles, offered CE, and podcasts more interactive. The New Dentist Committee is discussing the focus and objectives of future New Dentist Conferences in an effort to determine if the meeting should remain with the ADA Annual Meeting.

25 26

# **Emerging Issues, Trends and Miscellaneous Affairs:**

27 28 29

30

31

32

33 34 **ADA Executive Director's Update:** Dr. Kathleen O'Loughlin reviewed *Common Ground 2025:* Strategic Plan 2020/Operating Plan Alignment with the Council. She explained that the 2020 Operating Plan aligns with Common Ground, continuing a disciplined approach to deliver a balanced budget, manage business via a cross-divisional Agile approach, invest in client services for states and locals and commit to Innovation. She reviewed the four goals of Common Ground 2025 (Membership, Finance, Organizational and Public) and discussed the objectives that support each of the goals. Dr. O'Loughlin urged the Council to consider how its defined responsibilities, programs and projects align with Common Ground 2025.

36 37 38

39

40

41

35

**Unofficial Report of Actions of the 2019 House of Delegates:** The Council received the Unofficial Actions of the 2019 ADA House of Delegates, noting that Resolution 66H-2019 Criteria for Recognition of a Certifying Board for Dental Assistants, 67H-2019 Criteria for Recognition of a Certifying Board for Dental Laboratory Technicians and 69H-2019 Geriatric Dentistry were adopted by the House of Delegates as recommended by the Council.

42 43 44

45

46

**Strategic Plan 2020-2025: Council Priorities in 2020:** The Council confirmed its priorities and projects for 2020 in light of the new Strategic Plan Goals and the Council's defined responsibilities.

47 48 49 Monitor and comment on matters of the Commission on Dental Accreditation, Commission for Continuing Education Provider Recognition, and the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards. [ORGANIZATIONAL GOAL AND PUBLIC GOAL]

America's leading advocate for oral health

Page **10** of **12** CDEL Minutes January 2020

- Continue to support the ADA and its involvement with the Coalition for Modernizing Dental Licensure.
   [ORGANIZATIONAL GOAL AND PUBLIC GOAL]
  - Further explore the implications of licensure compacts and advocate for changes to state dental practice acts, rules and regulations regarding licensure, as requested. [ORGANIZATIONAL GOAL AND PUBLIC GOAL]
  - Continue to support the development, implementation and promotion of the Dental Licensure Objective Structured Clinical Examination (DLOSCE). [ORGANIZATIONAL GOAL AND PUBLIC GOAL]
  - Provide oversight to the Department of Testing Services regarding the development of an admission test for dental hygiene programs. [PUBLIC GOAL AND FINANCIAL GOAL]
  - Provide oversight to the Department of Testing Services regarding the administration of the Dental Admission Test (DAT) and Advanced Dental Admission Test (ADAT). [PUBLIC GOAL AND FINANCIAL GOAL]
  - ➤ Consider nominations and award the 2020 CDEL Tuition Scholarships to the Academy for Academic Leadership's Institute for Teaching and Learning. [PUBLIC GOAL]
  - ➤ Host a consensus conference to discuss draft pediatric sedation teaching guidelines in late 2020. [ORGANIZATIONAL GOAL AND PUBLIC GOAL]
  - Per the 5-year review cycle, recommend revision to the policies, *Dentistry as an Independent Profession* and *Dentistry*. [ORGANIZATIONAL GOAL AND PUBLIC GOAL]
  - Consider the annual reports of the Dental Assisting National Board and the National Board for Certification in Dental Laboratory Technology. [ORGANIZATIONAL GOAL AND PUBLIC GOAL]

**Greetings from ADA President:** Dr. Chad Gehani expressed his appreciation to the Council members for their time and dedication to the dental profession. Dr. Gehani discussed that the Council on Dental Education and Licensure plays a valuable role in driving the ADA's mission and vision, shaping the nature of dental education and licensure, and ensuring that patients receive the quality care they deserve.

Coalition for Modernizing Dental Licensure: Dr. Joseph Crowley, Coalition for Modernizing Dental Licensure Executive Committee Chair, provided an update on the Coalition. Dr. Crowley reviewed the Coalition's governance structure, strategic plan, mission and goals. In 2019, the CMDL Executive Committee elected a public member as well as the first of two at-large representatives from the Coalition membership to serve on the Executive Committee. The Coalition has grown to include over 50 organizations and agencies, and hosted the inaugural meeting of its membership at ADA Headquarters in October of 2019. The Coalition website, <a href="www.dentallicensure.org">www.dentallicensure.org</a>, houses the complete list of members, webinars, the membership application, an interactive dental licensure map highlighting initial licensure requirements and additional resources. Dr. Crowley reviewed alternatives to the single encounter, procedure-based clinical examinations, discussed the groups impacted by a lack of licensure portability, and provided a brief overview of legislative changes occurring across the country.

Page **11** of **12** CDEL Minutes January 2020

Chair and Vice-chair Election for 2020-2021: Dr. Linda C. Niessen (ADEA appointee), will complete her term as chair at the close of the 2020 ADA House of Delegates meeting on October 19, 2020. Dr. Jacqueline Plemons (ADA appointee) also will complete her one-year term as vice-chair of the Council at that time. The Council was reminded that at its June 2020 meeting, Council members will elect a chair and vice chair for the 2020-2021 year.

Fundamentals of Clinical Education Program: Dr. Uri Hangorsky presented information on a new program offered by Penn Dental Medicine and the Academy of Academic Leadership. "Fundamentals of Clinical Education (FCE)" is a self-paced online learning course designed to support clinical dental and dental hygiene faculty development to ensure teaching mastery. Content includes effective communication with patients and students, cultural competencies and inclusion, student motivation techniques, best practices for effective feedback, calibration for clinical education, working with challenged students, and information about the Commission on Dental Accreditation. The Council noted that this program designed to enhance clinical faculty's understanding of education principles and teaching methods is available to other dental schools through the Academy of Academic Learning.

Consideration of Proposed Revision to CODA from ADA Standard committee on Dental Products (SCDP): Council members carefully considered the December 11, 2019 letter requesting that the Council support the recommendation of the ADA Standards Committee on Dental Products (SCDP) to propose a revision to the Commission on Dental Accreditation's Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs. Specifically, the proposed revision would add a new requirement calling for graduates to be "competent in in the application of consensus-based standards, i.e., ANSI/ADA and ISO standards, which ensure the safety and efficacy of professional equipment and materials used in oral healthcare, and of dental practice facilities."

The Council agreed that standards are important to ensuring that dental products and dental practice facilities meet minimums for safety and efficacy and that dental students should be aware of these standards and know how to access, interpret and apply them as dental practitioners. However, the Council believes that the intent of the SCDP proposal is addressed in the following Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs:

**2-10** Graduates must be competent in the use of critical thinking and problem solving, including their use in the comprehensive care of patients, scientific inquiry and research methodology.

**2-18** Graduates must be competent in applying legal and regulatory concepts related to the provision and/or support of oral health care services.

**2-22** Graduates must be competent to assess, critically appraise, apply and communicate scientific and lay literature as it related to providing evidence-based patient care.

Accordingly, the Council concluded that it cannot support the request to pursue the proposed revision to the Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs at this time.

<u>Action</u>: The Council directed that correspondence be sent informing ADA SCDP that the Council does not support the ADA SCDP's proposed revision to the Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs at this time.

**CODA Site Visitor Training:** Dr. Tooks presented a PowerPoint presentation titled, "CODA Site Visitor Training" which provides an overview of the CODA Training Program for site visitors. The Program

America's leading advocate for oral health

Page **12** of **12** CDEL Minutes January 2020

consists online training modules, two day in-house training program, annual updates at ADEA Meeting and other meetings, special training sessions (periodic as needed or requested), and an annual mandatory site visitor training. Dr. Tooks shared that the annual mandatory site visitor training is a new addition as of fall 2019, requiring a site visitor to complete PowerPoint training modules (about 1.5 hours independent training) focused on the following topics: changes and updates, interpreting Standards, completing CODA documents, and report writing. After completion of the training modules, a site visitor is required to take a 20 question quiz and achieve a minimum of a 70% passing score. CODA engages over 600 site visitors with site visit teams ranging from a minimum of two to three individuals to a maximum of 20-30 site visitors. Dr. Tooks concluded by informing the Council members that in an effort to be transparent, all training materials are posted on CODA's website.

**Update from the DLOSCE Steering Committee:** Dr. David Waldschmidt, as the Director of Dental Testing Services, provided an update on the DLOSCE Steering Committee. He highlighted the composition and charge of the Steering Committee, reviewed the definition and benefits of an OSCE, showed the topics that will be covered on the DLOSCE and provided an example question. Nationwide field testing is scheduled for November of 2020. Pending successful completion of field testing, release of the DLOSCE is scheduled for the second quarter of 2021. He reminded the Council that the ADA Board of Trustees has transferred governance of the Dental Licensure Objective Structured Clinical Examination (DLOSCE) to the Joint Commission on National Dental Examinations, including the transference of the DLOSCE Steering Committee.

**CDEL Scholarships for Dental Practitioners: Academy for Academic Leadership:** Dr. Hangorsky reminded the Council that each year, the Council grants three tuition scholarships to the Academy for Academic Leadership's Institute for Teaching and Learning (AAL/ITL) as part of a commitment to support dental education and ADA general dentist members interested in academia. Additional scholarship information and the scholarship application is available on ADA's website with announcements posted via various ADA media outlets. Council members were encouraged to share this information with potential nominees and were reminded that the application deadline is March 31<sup>st</sup>. All nominee applications will be reviewed by the Dental Education Committee during its spring 2020 conference call for the Council's consideration at the June 2020 meeting.

 Dr. Hangorsky shared that the Academy of Academic Leadership invited the Council to support their new scholarship offering, Leadership Essentials for Advanced Programs (LEAP). The LEAP workshop is designed to prepare new and incoming directors from all advanced dental education programs for the different leadership, administrative, teaching, and mentoring challenges they encounter while serving in their roles. CDEL staff informed the Council members that for 2020, the Council budgeted \$10,500 to support three ITL Scholarships and that AAL is offering to include one LEAP Program fee at no additional charge. After some discussion, the Council agreed to seek nominations and sponsor one advanced education program director for the LEAP workshop.

<u>Action</u>: The Council accepted the invitation by the Academy of Academic Leadership to send an advanced dental education program director to the AAL workshop, "Leadership Essentials for Advanced Programs (LEAP).

Adjournment: 9:20 AM, Friday, January 17, 2020