COUNCIL ON DENTAL EDUCATION AND LICENSURE
AMERICAN DENTAL ASSOCIATION
VIDEO CONFERENCE, CHICAGO
JUNE 17-18, 2020

Call to Order: Dr. Linda C. Niessen, chair, called a regular meeting of the Council on Dental Education and Licensure to order on Wednesday, June 17, 2020 at 4:00 p.m. via video conference. The Council adjourned for the day at 7:00 pm and reconvened on Thursday, June 18 at 4:00 pm via video conference.

Roll Call: Dr. David F. Boden, Dr. GeriAnn DiFranco, Dr. Bruce R. Donoff, Dr. Rekha C. Gehani, Dr. Daniel A. Hammer, Dr. Uri Hangorsky, Dr. Willis Stanton Hardesty Jr., Dr. Steven M. Lepowsky, Dr. Jun S. Lim, Dr. William M. Litaker, Dr. Maurice S. Miles, Dr. James D. Nickman, Dr. David L. Nielson, Dr. Linda C. Niessen, Dr. Joan Otomo-Corgel, Dr. Jacqueline Plemons, and Dr. Donna Thomas-Moses were present.

Dr. John F. Harrington attended as the ADA Board Liaison to the Council. Mr. Craig McKenzie attended as Student Liaison of the American Student Dental Association.

The following guests attended portions of the meeting: Ms. Mary Borysewicz, Director, Commission for Continuing Education Provider Recognition, Dr. Daniel J. Klemmedson, President-elect, American Dental Association, Dr. Benoit Soucy, Director, Clinical and Scientific Affairs, Canadian Dental Association, Dr. Denice Stewart, Chief Policy Officer, American Dental Education Association, Dr. Sherin Took, Director, Commission on Dental Accreditation, Dr. David Waldschmidt, Director, Testing Services and Director, Joint Commission on National Dental Examinations and Dr. Robert Zena, President, American Association of Dental Boards.

In addition to the Council staff, the following ADA staff members attended all or portions of the meeting: Mr. Thomas Elliott, Deputy General Counsel and Director, Council on Ethics, Bylaws and Judicial Affairs, Ms. Heidi M. Nickisch Duggan, Director, ADA Library & Archives, Dr. Kathleen T. O’Loughlin, Executive Director, Ms. Nicole Strayhorn, Data Informationist, ADA Library & Archives and Dr. Anthony J. Ziebert, Senior Vice-President, Education and Professional Affairs.

Adoption of Agenda, Disclosure of Business or Personal Relationships, and ADA Professional Conduct Policy: The Council approved the agenda, and authorized the chair to alter the order of the agenda items as necessary to expedite business. Dr. Niessen directed the Council’s attention to the ADA Disclosure Policy. No personal, professional or business relationships were disclosed.

Affirmation of E-mail Ballots: The Council acknowledged e-mail ballots since the January 2020 meeting:

a. Minutes: January 16-17, 2020 Meeting (Ballot 2020-1)

Consent Calendar: A consent calendar was prepared to expedite the business of the Council. Dr. Niessen reminded Council members that any report, recommendation or resolution could be removed from the consent calendar for discussion. The following reports in their entirety were placed on the consent calendar and adopted as received:

Reports to the Council:
Dental Education Committee:

- Update on Activities of the Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA)
- Consideration of Proposed Revision to the Accreditation Standards for Dental Laboratory Technology Education Programs (all Standards)
- Consideration of Proposed Revision to the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Endodontics (all Standards)
- Consideration of Proposed Revision to the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery (all Standards)
- Consideration of ADA Policy, Communication Strategies for Increasing Awareness of Issues in Dental Education (Trans.2002:404)
- Consideration of ADA Policy, Trade Agreements (Trans.1993:711)
- Discussion on Additional Courses/Opportunities Encouraging Dentists to Consider Dental Education as a Career Option

Licensure Committee:

- Update on Bills and Changes in State Regulations
- Consideration of ADA Policy on Trade Agreements
- Consideration of ADA Policy on Support for Constituent Societies Dealing with Dental Mid-Level Provider Proposals
- Review of the CEBJA Statement “Ethical Considerations When Using Patients in the Examination Process”

Dental Admission Testing Committee:

- Dental Admission Test (DAT) Program Activities
- Advanced Dental Admission Test (ADAT) Program Activities
- Reports from Committee Liaisons
- Consideration of Nominations for a Vacancy on the Dental Admission Testing Committee
- Approval of Test Constructors to Serve in Test Constructor Pools 2021

Recognition of Specialties and Interest Areas in General Dentistry Committee:

- Update on Activities of the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards (NCRDSCB)
- Consideration of Nominations for a Vacancy on the Recognition of Dental Specialties and Interest Areas in General Dentistry Committee
Anesthesiology Committee:

Summary of Findings Morbidity and Mortality Rates Under One-operator Sedation Model

Update on Actions by the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards

Continuing Education Committee:

Discussion of Standardization of Speaker Biographies

ADA Continuing Education Department Report

Update on Council and Committee Planned Continuing Education

Reports of Related Groups

ADA President-elect Greetings: Dr. Daniel J. Klemmedson brought greetings to the Council, noting his interest in the important matters considered by this agency. He stated his intent to observe as many portions of the Council meeting as possible.

ADA Executive Director’s Update: Dr. Kathleen O’Loughlin discussed several Association matters including alignment of the 2020 Operational Plan to the ADA’s new Strategic Plan – Common Ground 2025. She reviewed the four goals of Common Ground 2025 and outlined the objectives, key strategies and programs supporting each goal. Dr. O’Loughlin noted that the Association has made excellent progress supporting members in addressing the COVID-19 Pandemic, including underscoring ADA science, practice and advocacy missions, reaffirming digital communication and continuing education, highlighting the need for client services and technical support for state and local dental societies, and accelerating new processes to change how ADA works for the better.

ADA Board of Trustees Liaison: On behalf of the Board of Trustees, Dr. Jay Harrington provided the Council with an update on ADA Board activities. Dr. Harrington discussed events related to COVID-19 describing that the Board has had to react quickly via many virtual meetings. He emphasized the work ADA has accomplished to assist members in managing the COVID-19 crisis. He noted the quality work produced by staff under work at home conditions and reported that the Association’s Business Continuity Plan was implemented effectively; it continues to work very well. Dr. Harrington also stated that programs such as the Clinical Data Warehouse Registry continue; the ADA has selected an entity to build the warehouse registry. Initial program rollout is scheduled for late 2020. He reminded the Council that the ADA Foundation has been reorganized (focused solely on science and research), including a new board of directors. Two endowments remain with the Foundation, i.e., the Relief Fund and Samuel Harris Fund. The newly established Science and Research Institute now has an operating agreement with the ADA and a new board of directors. Dr. Harrington noted his appreciation for the opportunity to serve as the board liaison to the Council this year.

American Association of Dental Boards (AADB): Dr. Robert Zena, shared a reflection on the history of AADB. He stated that AADB supports collaboration between dental organizations including the ADA, ADEA and ASDA and is exploring a new reduced-rate membership category for students. He also expressed support for newly released examinations that provide alternatives to licensure examinations on patients.
American Dental Education Association (ADEA): Dr. Stewart highlighted recent ADEA events and activities. ADEA Connect was launched six months ago and via this platform, ADEA has been able to establish an online COVID-19 Response Community, currently with over 5,000 members, where faculty and administrators in dental education can share resources and information addressing the COVID-19 Pandemic. In addition, to assist ADEA members in their response to COVID-19, ADEA developed the Pandemic Resource Guide—a guide that provides information and lists of resources related to student affairs and enrollment management. Dr. Stewart announced that due to the uncertainty surrounding the COVID-19 Pandemic, the ADEA 2021 Annual Session and Exhibition will be offered virtually.

Dr. Stewart shared that ADEA is offering a Just in Time CCI Webinar Series focused on topics related to e-learning, exam creation, and exam proctoring to assist dental educators transitioning into a virtual teaching environment. ADEA Advocacy and Government Relations staff continue to advocate for funding to assist dental education in navigating today’s changing landscape including matters related to licensure. ADEA released the Faculty Diversity Toolkit, a resource to assist dental schools and allied dental programs in evaluating and designing programs to improve their faculty diversity recruitment and retention efforts. ADEA Deans Town Hall meetings, open to all dental school deans, advanced education institute directors and federal service program deans and leadership, are being held to address critical and timely issues and updates on ADEA actions and resources. ADEA conducted an online informal poll regarding the usage of Teledentistry. Dr. Stewart shared that respondents indicated that 72% currently use teledentistry, 21% plan to do so and 97% of those currently using teledentistry indicated that they will continue to use it.

Dr. Stewart concluded her presentation by discussing top concerns including budget, PPE, testing, re-engineering clinic spaces, re-opening overall (state-by-state), providing an overview of the various surveys being conducted by ADEA and addressing the positive changes that have been fast tracked due to the pandemic. A Council member asked for an update on the status of dental school openings. Dr. Stewart informed the Council that many dental schools have opened in some variation and that this is largely dictated by state regulations.

Commission of Dental Accreditation (CODA): Dr. Tooks shared that the Unofficial Report of Major Actions from the January 30-31, 2020, April 2, 2020, and April 13, 2020 CODA meetings are posted on the Commission’s website. Dr. Tooks reported that the Commission recognizes the impact of COVID-19 on travel and on CODA-accredited dental and dental-related education programs and as a result, has directed that any remaining site visits through 2020 be canceled and rescheduled in 2021. This will enable dental education programs time to reinstate pre-COVID-19 curricular and clinical operations and prepare for CODA accreditation site visits. Programs that submitted a site visit fee (doubling of the annual fee) in 2020 and did not undergo a “regular/reaccreditation” site visit will receive a refund on the fee, and be reassessed the fee in the year that the site visit will occur. Dr. Tooks also reported that the Commission adopted with immediate implementation, the temporary flexibility guidance document for each discipline under the Commission’s purview, related to the Class of 2020. This document addresses specific Accreditation Standards that may be temporarily flexible to address circumstances surrounding the Class of 2020 student/resident/fellow completion of educational programs due to COVID-19.

CODA continues to monitor United States Department of Education (USDE) updates related to COVID-19 and has created a COVID-19 Update Page, a webpage that monitors the impact of COVID-19 on CODA-accredited programs and provides the list of Temporary Flexibility in Accreditation Standards and Interruption of Education Guidelines. Dr. Tooks shared that USDE issued a reauthorization of the Higher Education Act (HEA), the law that establishes a framework for the regulations. The revised regulations are scheduled to go into effect on July 1, 2020 and will have an impact on accrediting
agencies. The revised regulations focus on distance education, flexibility in innovation for education programs and an accreditor’s recognition status as it works towards meeting the recognition criteria.

Dr. Tooks concluded her report by informing the Council that because accreditation site visits have been suspended until 2021, the Commission made the decision to suspend accepting applications for new programs seeking accreditation.

Joint Commission on National Dental Examinations (JNCDE): Dr. David Waldschmidt shared that COVID-19 has had a significant impact on the testing industry as a whole. Specific to dental licensure and admission testing, the closure of test administration centers, of which the Joint Commission works with Prometric and Pearson VUE, resulted in significant candidate testing appointment displacements. Additionally, clinical testing agencies (i.e., CDCA, CITA, CRDTS, SRTA and WREB) were unable to administer clinical patient-based licensure exams as dental schools were closed across the country. The JCNDE’s COVID-19 response included the fast-track release of the DLOSCE, introduction of a short-form-National Board Dental Hygiene Examination (NBDHE) anticipated July 2020, delayed discontinuation of the National Board Dental Examination Part I (NBDE I) to October 31, 2020 with expanded eligibility periods for candidates and the shift of all in-person test construction team meetings to virtual meetings. Dr. Waldschmidt provided additional details related to the release of the DLOSCE. Of note, the DLOSCE is offered at the lower fee of $800 in 2020; the fee in 2021 will be $1650. The exam will be offered in administration windows with results reported within 4 weeks of the closing of each testing window. An example of the 3-D images used on the exam was displayed along with a sample question. He provided rationale for why state dental boards should use the DLOSCE as a licensure assessment as well as some preliminary candidate feedback. The Joint Commission continues to monitor the ongoing COVID-19 situation and will make adjustments as appropriate.

Senior Vice President, Education/Professional Affairs: Dr. Anthony Ziebert reported on activities within the Division of Education and Professional Affairs and reviewed what has been accomplished thus far in 2020. CDEL, the Library and Client Services staff have served on the COVID-19 Education and Licensure Response Team, answering numerous letters and emails, attending state board virtual meetings, and constantly updating the licensure maps posted on ADA.org. The Response Team meets twice each week to ensure updates are noted and posted; the team also meets weekly with ADEA and ASDA staff. He noted that the State Mandates Map created in collaboration with the Membership and Client Services Division has had over 442,000 views; the Dental Licensure Requirements by State Map has had over 24,000 views. Dr. Ziebert noted that the Joint Commission on National Dental Examinations has responded to the needs of students and state dental boards by launching the Dental Licensure Objective Structured Clinical Examination (a non-patient based exam) almost one year ahead of schedule; the first testing window is open until mid-July. Dr. Ziebert noted that due to COVID-19, the 2020 budget for the Division is likely to meet 90% of projections provided students test by the end of the year. Re-forecasting the 2020 budget continues on a monthly basis. He also noted that a senior management action team on diversity and inclusion has been established and is a goal for all senior staff, demonstrating staff’s commitment to these principles and echoing Dr. Gehani’s letter to the entire membership.

Report of Council Members Serving on Other Association Agencies/Committee Reports

Library and Archives Advisory Board: Dr. Harrington and Ms. Nickisch Duggan updated the Council on the activities and services of the ADA Library and Archives and its Advisory Board. It was noted that the department exceeded its 2019 goals for utilization of library content with over 22,000 full-text downloads and unique item investigations (the number of unique content items) investigated by a user. DynaMed, an evidence-based resource of drug information and clinical summaries intended to reduce...
time-to-answer, is available through the ADA Library & Archives website. DynaMed incorporated enhancements such as offering CE units in 2019.

Ms. Nickisch Duggan reported that the top journal title usage by article downloads for 2019 were the Journal of the American Dental Association, American Journal of Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics, Dental Clinics of North America, Dental Abstracts and The Journal of Prosthetic Dentistry. The top eBook title usage by downloads for 2019 were Cohen's Pathways of the Pulp Expert Consult, Pharmacology and Therapeutics for Dentistry, Lasers in Dentistry: Guide for Clinical Practice, Medical Emergencies in the Dental Office and Fundamentals of Operative Dentistry. She also noted that OpenAthens is an identity access management tool that allows members to access subscribed electronic content 24/7. Users access the Library from all over the globe.

The department continuously supports various information needs of the ADA Science Research Institute and COVID-19 Response Teams. Staff also support student learning in all ways, and make an effort to build relationships with dental library liaisons at dental schools across the country in order to provide research support to students. Once students graduate, they lose access to their home institution’s library collections. The ADA Library & Archives fills that information need as new member dentists transition to practice and clinical care.

The Library and Archives Advisory Board will meet later this summer.

**Dental Education Committee Summary Report**: Dr. Uri Hangorsky presented the Committee’s comments and recommendations to the Council. The following summarizes the agenda items discussed and the Council’s actions.

**Consideration of Proposed Revision to the Accreditation Standards for Dental Hygiene Education Programs (all Standards)**: The Council reviewed a written report that detailed CODA’s drafted revisions to the current Accreditation Standards for Dental Hygiene Education Programs. Although the majority of proposed changes were editorial in nature or provided clarifying language, proposed additions to Standard 3-3 and 3-6 were noted by the Council. Standard 3-3 states that a dental hygienist or dentist may serve as a program director. However, if the proposed language is adopted, in the future dentist-directors must be graduates of a dental (DDS/DMD) program accredited by the Commission on Dental Accreditation. The Council had the same concern regarding the proposed change to Standard 3-6. These changes will disqualify internationally-trained dentists in the future from serving in the capacity of program director or faculty. The Committee recommended, and the Council concurred, that the Commission be urged to modify this language so that licensed internationally-trained dentists also are qualified to be program directors or faculty.

**Action**: The Council directed that written comment be sent to the Commission on Dental Accreditation expressing general support for the proposed revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Dental Hygiene Education Programs, and urging that the proposed revisions to Standards 3-3 and 3-6 be modified so that licensed dentists who are not graduates of CODA-accredited dental education programs also may serve as dental hygiene program directors or faculty members in the future.

**Consideration of Nominees for the CDEL Tuition Scholarship to the Academy for Academic Leadership’s Institute for Teaching and Learning**: The American Dental Association’s CDEL/Academy for Academic Leadership’s Institute for Teaching and Learning Tuition Scholarship provides an opportunity to recognize members who are pursuing careers in dental academia. This scholarship program, initiated in 2015, awards three aspiring general dentistry faculty members
interested in academic careers.

The Dental Education Committee recommended, and the Council concurred, that Dr. Dalal Alhajji, Dr. Michael Wajdowicz, and Dr. Valerie Perrine, were deserving of the 2020 scholarships. Dr. Alhajji is a graduate of the Boston University Henry M. Goldman School of Dental Medicine and works full-time at the New York University College of Dentistry. Dr. Wajdowicz graduated from the Baylor College of Dentistry and works full-time for the United States Air Force at its Post-graduate Dental School and plans to transition to predoctoral dental education. Dr. Valerie N. Perrine graduated from the West Virginia University School of Dentistry and works there as a part-time faculty member.

**Action:** The Council awarded to Dr. Dalal Alhajji, Dr. Michael Wajdowicz, and Dr. Valerie Perrine, the 2020 CDEL Tuition Scholarships to the Academy for Academic Leadership’s Institute for Teaching and Learning.

**Consideration of the Nomination for the CDEL/AAL Leadership Essentials for Advanced Programs (LEAP) Scholarship:** The Council is committed to supporting advanced dental education and new directors of CODA-accredited advanced dental education programs. Accordingly, the Council granted one scholarship to attend the Academy of Academic Leadership’s two-day Leadership Essentials for Advanced Programs workshop.

The Dental Education Committee recommended, and the Council concurred, that Dr. Sejal Thacker, was deserving of the 2020 scholarship. Dr. Thacker graduated from the Columbia University School of Dentistry and serves as program director for the advanced education program in Periodontology sponsored by the University of Connecticut School Of Dental Medicine.

**Action:** The Council awarded to Dr. Sejal Thacker the 2020 CDEL Tuition Scholarship to the Academy for Academic Leadership’s Essentials for Advanced Programs.

**Recognition Committee Summary Report:** Dr. Donna Thomas-Moses presented the Committee’s comments and recommendations to the Council. The following summarizes the agenda items discussed.

**Request to Consider an Amendment to the Requirements for Recognition of Dental Specialties and National Certifying Boards for Dental Specialists:** The Council reviewed a written report about the recent request from the chair of the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards, Dr. James Boyle, to consider an amendment to the Requirements for Recognition of National Certifying Boards for Dental Specialists. The National Commission believes that Requirement 5. Operation of the Board should be strengthened. Specifically, the specialty certifying boards should require diplomates to engage in lifelong learning and continuous quality improvement instead of only encouraging them. Requirement 5. Operation of Boards currently states, “Each board shall encourage its diplomates to engage in lifelong learning and continuous quality improvement.”

The Requirements were last updated following the 2018 House of Delegates meeting and are scheduled for a periodic review in 2023. The Council noted that ADA’s policies related to continuing education generally forego directives such as “require” in favor of terms such as “encourage” or “urge.” Additionally, it was noted that all states require licensed dentists (general dentists and specialists) to complete continuing education to maintain licensure. Further, all ten recognized certifying boards have recertification/certification maintenance policies for their diplomates.
Because the intent of the National Commission’s request is already addressed by state licensing boards and the specialty certifying boards, the Council and Recognition Committee did not believe that pursuing an amendment to the Requirements for Recognition is an urgent matter. The chair of the Council discussed the request with Dr. James Boyle prior to the Council’s June 2020 meeting and explained that this housekeeping matter will be considered by the Council in 2023 when the Requirements document is scheduled for its periodic review.

**Licensure Committee Summary Report:** Dr. Jacqueline Plemons presented the Committee’s comments to the Council.

**Update on the Progress of the DLOSCE:** Summarized elsewhere in the minutes.

**Update on the Coalition for Modernizing Dental Licensure:** Dr. Strotman provided an update on the activities of the Coalition for Modernizing Dental Licensure. In light of the COVID-19 Pandemic, the Coalition Executive Committee met on March 16, 2020, April 7, 2020 and again on April 28, 2020. The Executive Committee initially drafted a letter intended for governors or legislatures to encourage the use of non-patient examinations for licensure and to address the immediate needs of the dental and dental hygiene graduating class of 2020. As the COVID-19 response progressed, many organizations affiliated with the Coalition sent communications to state governors urging them to take action. The Executive Committee determined at its April 28, 2020 meeting that the needs of the graduating class of 2020 had been addressed repeatedly by other organizations and that the Coalition would focus on the goal of eliminating the patient from the licensure process. The May Coalition meeting was postponed and the Executive Committee is exploring future dates and alternative platforms for hosting the meeting.

**Consideration of Licensure Map Updates:** In response to the COVID-19 Pandemic, the ADA launched the State Mandate Map which visualizes state updates on dental procedure requirements and/or restrictions across the country. Additionally, COVID-19 updates related to licensure have been added to the Dental Licensure Map that was launched in early January 2020. A map highlighting state specific requirements related to licensure renewal is scheduled for launch in summer 2020. Ms. Nicole Strayhorn provided a demonstration of the Dental Licensure dashboard that allows a user to toggle between all ADA licensure-related maps.

**Anesthesiology Committee Summary Report:** Dr. R. Bruce Donoff summarized the agenda items discussed by the Committee.

**Consideration of Proposed ADA Guidelines for Teaching Pediatric Pain Control and Sedation to Dentists and Dental Students Draft:** A draft developed by the Committee, *Guidelines for Teaching Pediatric Pain Control and Sedation for Dentists and Dental Students* and comments received from the communities of interest were discussed over two meetings. The Committee discussed the definition of pediatric age and acknowledged that it varies across many organizations and state dental boards. The Committee also discussed patient monitoring and titration of drugs. ADA staff were directed to update the draft to include all agreed upon edits with subsequent distribution of the draft to all the Committee members who would review it with and seek comment from their respective organizations. Submitted comments and suggestions will be collected and shared with the Committee for further consideration, with a meeting scheduled to finalize a draft that will be transmitted to the Council for review.

**Update on Plans for 2020 Invitational Consensus Conference:** The Invitational Consensus Conference to discuss the proposed “ADA Guidelines for Teaching Pain Control and Sedation to Dentists and Dental Students” is scheduled to be hosted by the Council with funding provided by the
American Dental Society of Anesthesiology on Tuesday, November 10, 2020. A letter was sent on behalf of CDEL Chair, Dr. Linda Niessen and Vice-chair, Dr. Jacqueline Plemons on March 9, 2020 to the dental anesthesiology communities of interest inviting them to send representatives, preferably one educator and one practitioner, to the conference.

Emerging Issues, Trends and Miscellaneous Affairs

Selection of 2020-2021 Chair and Vice-chair:

**Action:** The Council elected Dr. Jacqueline Plemons to serve as its chair and Dr. Donna Thomas-Moses to serve as vice chair for 2020-2021.

**Update on the Council's 2021 Budget:** Dr. Niessen reviewed the Council’s proposed 2021 budget, reminding the Council that its committees conduct business via teleconference and electronically on an ongoing basis. The proposed budget for 2021 reflects one (rather than two) in-person Council meetings; electronic and virtual meetings will be held as needed throughout the year to expedite and support the Council’s business. She noted that previously the Council has supported dental education by offering workshops for and scholarships to practitioners pursuing careers in academia and new advanced education program directors. These scholarships will be suspended in 2021 to support the Association’s efforts to reduce expenses in 2021. The Academic Dentistry Workshop: Promoting Careers in Academia may be presented as a webinar in 2021.

**Reminder: CDEL Call Prior to ADA House of Delegates Meeting:** Ms. Hart reminded all that a virtual meeting of the Council will be scheduled for an evening in September to review resolutions of interest to be considered by the 2020 House of Delegates.

**Adjournment:** 6:43 PM, Thursday, June 18, 2020