America's leading advocate for oral health

Page 1 of 6 CDEL Minutes December 2019

COUNCIL ON DENTAL EDUCATION AND LICENSURE AMERICAN DENTAL ASSOCIATION HEADQUARTERS BUILDING, CHICAGO DECEMBER 11, 2019

Call to Order: Dr. Linda C. Niessen, chair, called a meeting of the Council on Dental Education and Licensure to order on Wednesday, December 11, 2019 at 6:00 p.m. via teleconference call.

Roll Call: Dr. David F. Boden, Dr. Rekha C. Gehani, Dr. Daniel A. Hammer, Dr. Uri Hangorsky, Dr. Willis Stanton Hardesty Jr., Dr. Steven M. Lepowsky, Dr. Jun S. Lim, Dr. William Litaker, Dr. Maurice S. Miles, Dr. James D. Nickman, Dr. Linda C. Niessen, Dr. Joan Otomo-Corgel, Dr. Jacqueline Plemons and Dr. Donna Thomas-Moses were present. Dr. GeriAnn DiFranco, Dr. Bruce Donoff, and Dr. David L. Nielson were unable to participate in the call.

Dr. John F. Harrington, ADA Board Liaison to the Council and Mr. Craig McKenzie, the American Student Dental Association representative, were unable to join the call.

The following ADA staff members attended the meeting: Mr. Thomas Elliott, Deputy General Counsel and Director, Council on Ethics, Bylaws and Judicial Affairs, Ms. Karen M. Hart, Director, Council on Dental Education and Licensure, Ms. Annette Puzan, Manager, Dental Education and Licensure, and Dr. Meaghan Strotman, Manager, Dental Licensure and Education. Dr. Anthony J. Ziebert, Senior Vice-President, Education and Professional Affairs was unable to join the call.

Adoption of Agenda and Disclosure of Business or Personal Relationships: The Council approved the agenda. Dr. Niessen directed the Council's attention to the ADA Disclosure Policy. There were no disclosures.

Review of American Dental Board of Anesthesiology Application for National Certifying Board Recognition: The Council reviewed the Summary Report of the CDEL Committee on Recognition, noting that the American Dental Board of Anesthesiology (ADBA) submitted an application to the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards (NCRDSCB) requesting recognition as the national certifying board for Dental Anesthesiology. The NCRDSCB announced receipt of the application and invited comment from the communities of interest on whether the application satisfies the ADA Requirements for Recognition of Dental Specialties and National Certifying Boards for Dental Specialists. The Council reviewed the Recognition Committee's Summary Report and discussed whether the application meets each of the Requirements.

Organization of Boards:

In regard to Organization of Boards Requirement 1, the Council noted that the American Dental Board of Anesthesiology (ADBA) Board of Directors consists of 10 directors in total who are all required to be ADBA Diplomates, nine (9) voting members and one (1) non-voting member, who is the ASDA Immediate Past President serving in an ex officio capacity. The nine (9) voting members are elected by the ADBA Diplomates to serve a three (3) year term in office, with the limitation of two (2) consecutive terms for a possible six (6) years of service in total. The ASDA ex officio member is rotated out pending completion of the ASDA's biennial election process.

America's leading advocate for oral health

Page 2 of 6 CDEL Minutes December 2019

ADBA's application states that ADBA was originally founded in 1994 under the sponsorship of the
American Society of Dentist Anesthesiologists (ASDA). On March 11, 2019, the National Commission
on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards recognized dental anesthesiology as a
dental specialty. The Council believes that the close working relationship between the ASDA and the
ADBA is not only clearly established within the ASDA's application for specialty recognition, but also
evident within the governing documents (Constitution and Bylaws) for each respective organization.
The Council believes Organization of Boards Requirement 1 is met.

In regard to Organization of Boards Requirement 2, The ADBA's application demonstrates there is sufficient evidence that the certification program in place is sufficiently comprehensive in scope to meet the requirements established by the ADA for the operation of a certifying board. The ADBA is sponsored by the American Society of Dentist Anesthesiologists (ASDA), which has satisfactorily met all the elements of Requirement (1) of the NCRDSCB Requirements for Recognition of Dental Specialties as ultimately evident by the announcement on March 11, 2019 accepting the ASDA's application and request for recognition of dental anesthesiology as a dental specialty. Furthermore, the relationship between ADBA and ASDA is clearly established and documented within the ASDA and the ADBA governing documents, specifically their respective Constitutions and Bylaws. The Council believes Organization of Boards Requirement 2 is met.

In regard to Organization of Boards Requirement 3, the application provides ample evidence that ADBA has adequate financial support to conduct its program of certification. The Council referenced Chapter VII: Finances, found within the ADBA Constitution and Bylaws, which provides the organizational guidance that governs the finances of the Certifying Board. The ADBA has established a general fund as well as a reserve fund which adequately support all business activities of the organization. As of December 31, 2018, the ADBA has \$116,769.91 in its general fund and \$142,363.21 in its reserve fund, for a total asset value of \$259,133.12. The ADBA has \$0.00 total liabilities, and therefore, has a total net asset value of \$259,133.12.

In reviewing ADBA's financial statement, generated by the accounting firm Holland and Company, the Council noted that as of December 31, 2018, the ADBA's yearly revenue was \$140,276.65, yearly functional expenses were \$101,194.27, for a net annual revenue gain of \$39,082.38. ADBA's application states that all financial support for the organizational activities of the ADBA originates completely within the organization. The vast majority of the organization's income is derived from the collection of annual Diplomate registration dues and examination fees (Written Exam, Oral Exam, and In-Training Exams), with a smaller fraction derived from investments. The Council believes Organization of Boards Requirement 3 is met.

 In regard to Organization of Boards Requirement 4, the Council reviewed ADBA's Constitution and Bylaws, Chapter II, Section 80, and Chapter IV, noting that the examination content is overseen and developed primarily by the Vice-Presidents of the Written and Oral Exams, who serve as Chairpersons of their respective exam committees. All content for the Written and Oral Exams is developed exclusively within the ADBA, and anyone serving on the aforementioned examination committees is required to be a Diplomate of the ADBA. ADBA's application states that all examiners that administer the Oral Exam are required to be ADBA Diplomates, consisting of members of the current ADBA Board of Directors as well as invited members selected from the pool of ADBA Diplomates in good standing. All examiners are trained and calibrated according to the testing standards established by the Oral Exam Committee. The Council believes Organization of Boards Requirement 4 is met.

America's leading advocate for oral health

Page 3 of 6 CDEL Minutes December 2019

Operation of Boards:

In regard to Operation of Boards Requirement 1, the Council discussed and agreed that the ADBA application provides sufficient narrative and supporting documentation that evidences that the ADBA only certifies qualified dentists as ADBA Diplomates within the special area of dental practice defined as Dental Anesthesiology. As described in the ADBA mission statement and the ADBA Constitution and Bylaws, a qualified dentist is defined as an individual who has completed the requisite training in Dental Anesthesiology. In reviewing the Certification Requirements, the Council noted that a dentist with training in other areas or specialties within dentistry would only qualify to be an eligible candidate for the ADBA if they also successfully completed an accredited program in dental anesthesiology. There are no other recognized certifying boards with the same explicit training requirements within the specialty of Dental Anesthesiology. The Council believes Operation of Boards Requirement 1 is met.

 In regard to Operation of Boards Requirement 2, in reviewing the ADBA Constitution and Bylaws, specifically Chapter VI, Section 40.A, the Council noted that the ADBA offers the Written Exam and the Oral Exam one (1) time each per calendar year. The Written Exam is offered and administered annually on the day prior to the start of the ASDA Annual Scientific Session, which is held each spring. The Oral Exam is offered and administered annually as well, typically each June. The dates for the Written and Oral Exams are published on the ADBA website well in advance, at least six (6) months in advance. Dates for the upcoming 2020 Written (4/29/2020) and Oral (5/30-31/2020) Exams are already available and published on the ADBA website. The Council believes Operation of Boards Requirement 2 is met.

In regard to Operation of Boards Requirement 3, the ADBA has a policy in place, per its Constitution and Bylaws, Chapter 1, Section 100.I, that states that a duty of the Board of Directors is to maintain a current roster of Diplomates of the American Dental Board of Anesthesiology. The ADBA publishes the list of all current ADBA Diplomates who wish to be published that can be found within the ADBA website and which is made available to the public. The Council believes Operation of Boards Requirement 3 is met.

In regard to Operation of Boards Requirement 4, the ADBA application provides sufficient data and documentation pertaining to the ADBA's financial operations, applicant admission procedures and examination content and results. The ADBA follows the Standards for Educational and Psychological Testing for examination development, evaluation of results, including validity and reliability evidence, and procedures for examination administration. ADBA Diplomates can, upon request to the ADBA Board of Directors, obtain copies of the annual technical and financial reports of the Board. The Council believes Operation of Boards Requirement 4 is met.

In regard to Operation of Boards Requirement 5, the Council noted that ADBA's Constitution and Bylaws, Chapter VI, Section 60, state that Diplomates must comply with maintenance and recertification requirements as set by the Board of Directors. These requirements are further detailed within the ADBA website which states that Diplomates are required to submit to the ADBA documentation of one hundred twenty (120) credits of continuing education every six (6) years. This recertification is designed to encourage engagement in anesthesia related continuing education at the anesthesia specialist level. Attendance at Morbidity and Mortality Conferences related to anesthesiology for dentistry is also encouraged. This is a regular feature at the Annual Scientific Meeting of the ASDA, when the ADBA Diplomate meeting also generally takes place. Accordingly, the Council believes Operation of Boards Requirement 5 is met.

America's leading advocate for oral health

Page 4 of 6 CDEL Minutes December 2019

In regard to Operation of Boards Requirement 6, the Council reviewed the Certification and Examination Summary and Historical Data provided by ADBA. Below are the statistics relative to the number of diplomates.

a. Number certified without examination from founding date through current date: 98 Diplomates

Diplomate

b. Number certified by examination through current date: 222 Diplomates

c. Total certified through current date: 320 Diplomates

- d. Number of active Diplomates as of current date: 266 Diplomates
- e. Total number that have taken the examination and number of candidates that have failed the examination for the past five (5) years: 157 candidates/27 failures (Written Exam); 157 candidates/43 failures (Oral Exam)
- f. List the sections of the examination and the total number that have passed and failed in each section for the past five (5) years: 130 pass/27 failures (Written Exam 157 total candidates); 114 pass/43 failures (Oral Exam 157 total candidates)"

The ADBA application provides sufficient evidence of its examination and certification of a significant number of additional dentists in order to warrant its continuing approval by the NCRDSCB. The Council believes Operation of Boards Requirement 6 is met.

 In regard to Operation of Boards Requirement 7, according to the ADBA Constitution and Bylaws, the ADBA bears the full weight and sole responsibility for conducting all business pertaining to the evaluation of the qualifications and competence of applicants, those it certifies as diplomates, as well as the issuance and maintenance of certificates. The ADBA is not beholden to the sponsoring organization or any other body in determining the qualifications or certification, competency of applicants, or issuance of certificates. This independence is made clear within the ADBA Constitution and Bylaws and particular responsibilities are detailed within Article III: Objectives and Responsibilities; Chapter I, Section 90: Powers, and Section 100: Duties. The Council also noted that the ADBA Certificate and Mission tab via ADBA's website provide additional evidence supporting the fact that the ADBA is the sole organization responsible for the following: establishing the qualifications for Diplomate status of the ADBA; determining the eligibility of applicants for examination; examining candidates seeking Diplomate status, and conferring Diplomate status upon those candidates who successfully complete the examination process. The Council believes Operation of Boards Requirement 7 is met.

In regard to Operation of Boards Requirement 8, the ADBA Constitution and Bylaws, Chapter VI, Section 70: Annual Registration Fee state that each diplomate is required to submit an annual registration along with the associated registration fee, unless otherwise deemed exempt. The annual registration fee as currently established by the Board of Directors is \$275 and is evidenced by the blank invoice included as part of the supporting documentation. The recertification process, which is required every six (6) years, has no associated fee as that is covered by the annual registration fee. The Council also noted the 2018 Financial Statement which further evidences the collection of the registration fee. Registration income, per the 2018 Financial Statement, is \$68,929.44. The Council believes Operation of Boards Requirement 8 is met.

Certification Requirements:

In regard to Certification Requirements Requirement 1, the Council discussed and agreed that the

America's leading advocate for oral health

Page **5** of **6** CDEL Minutes December 2019

ADBA application narrative and supporting documentation provide sufficient evidence that ADBA meets Requirement 1. The ADBA Constitution and Bylaws outline the basic requirements for board eligibility in Chapter VI: Board Certification, Section 20.A. The eligibility criteria for individuals interested in applying to become a candidate for the ADBA Written and Oral Board Exams are made available in several locations on the ADBA website. Additionally, the ADBA application forms also make abundantly clear to applicants the necessary documentation required to gain entrance to the Written and Oral Exams. The Council believes Requirement 1 of the Certification Requirements is met.

In regard to Certification Requirements Requirement 2, the ADBA application states that although different dental specialties may have exposure to anesthesiology for varying lengths of time during training, only graduates of a CODA accredited Dental Anesthesiology residency program or individuals within six (6) months of graduation from a CODA accredited Dental Anesthesiology residency program, with written permission from their program director, may become eligible to take the Written Exam. Candidates must successfully pass the Written Exam prior to becoming eligible to take the Oral Exam. In addition to successful completion of the Written Exam, the ADBA requires candidates to have a minimum of six (6) months of independent anesthesia practice prior to gaining eligibility to sit for the Oral Exam.

The Council noted that the eligibility criteria for individuals interested in applying to become a candidate for the ADBA Written and Oral Board Exams are made available in several locations on the ADBA website. Additionally, the ADBA application forms also make abundantly clear to applicants the necessary documentation required to gain entrance to the Written and Oral Exams. The Council believes Requirement 2 of the Certification Requirements is met.

In regard to Certification Requirements Requirement 3, the ADBA, with cooperation and support from its sponsoring organization, has published its recommendations on the educational program and experience requirements that candidates are expected to meet in several areas on its website. The ADBA Board of Directors, along with the ASDA which provides recommendations, guidance, and input as the sponsoring organization via the ASDA Immediate Past President, have established, perpetually reviewed, and periodically revised the didactic and clinical educational requirements expected of board eligible candidates.

To help guide prospective candidates, the ADBA publishes on its website an outline of the content of the Written Exam, as well as overviews of the examination processes for the Written and Oral Exams. Additionally, the ADBA meets annually with the Dental Anesthesiology program directors to review and discuss items of interest including recommendations on the educational program and experiences candidates are expected to meet prior to taking the ADBA Exams. Finally, the ADBA sends a letter each year after the Oral Exams to each of the candidates who failed to successfully complete the Oral Exam as well as to each of the Dental Anesthesiology program directors, that details several common areas of weakness or general trends noted during the Oral Exam. The Council believes Requirement 3 of the Certification Requirements is met.

Action: The Council directed that written comment be sent to the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards noting its conclusion that the application submitted by the American Dental Board of Anesthesiology meets the ADA Requirements for Recognition of Dental Specialties and National Certifying Boards of Dental Specialists and urging that the American Dental Board of Anesthesiology be recognized as the national certifying board for Dental Anesthesiology.

America's leading advocate for oral health

Page 6 of 6 CDEL Minutes December 2019

- 1 Reminders: The Council was reminded that the next in-person meeting of the Council will be January
- 2 16-17, 2020 at ADA Headquarters in Chicago.

3 4 **Adio**

4 Adjournment: 6:19 PM, Wednesday, December 11, 2019