AMERICAN DENTAL ASSOCIATION

MINUTES OF THE COUNCIL ON MEMBERSHIP

June 16-17, 2023

CALL TO ORDER

The June 16-17, 2023 Council on Membership (CM or Council) meeting was called to order by Council Chair, Dr. Nipa Thakkar, at 8:00 a.m. CDT of ADA Headquarters in Chicago, IL. The meeting was convened in the Hillenbrand Auditorium on the 2nd Floor on June 16 and in the Boardroom on the 22nd Floor on June 17.

ROLL CALL

The following members of the Council were present for all or part of the meeting: Drs. Nipa Thakkar, chair; Aruna Rao, vice chair; Ensy Atarod; Wallace Bellamy; Renuka Bijoor; Giancarlo Ghisalberti, new dentist member; Keith Jones; Nathaniel Kunzman; Janis Moriarty; Robin Nguyen; Cate Nelson; Meenal Patel; Mehrdad Safavian; Susan Sergie; Kerri Simpson (via video conference); Thomas Sniscak; Rhoda Sword; Terri Tiersky

Dr. George Shepley, ADA President; Dr. Linda Edgar, ADA President-Elect and Dr. Michele Tulak-Gorecki, Board of Trustees’ liaison to the Council were also in attendance.

Not present for the meeting: Ms. Justina Anigbo, ASDA Consultant

Council staff members present: Ms. Sandy Eitel, senior director, Council on Membership; Ms. Nicole Subick, manager, Council on Membership; Wendy J. Wils, Esq., deputy general counsel, Division of Legal Affairs

Staff members present for all or part of the meeting were: Dr. Ray Cohlmia, executive director, Ms. April Kates-Ellison, chief client services & tripartite relations officer, Member & Client Services; Ms. Cathy Haibach, senior manager, Dental Service Organization & Group Practice Membership

PRELIMINARY

The Chair referenced the ADA Disclosure Policy on Conflict of Interests printed in the agenda and asked for disclosures at the appropriate time. The Chair also reminded Council members of the ADA Confidentiality Policy and referenced the Confidentiality Statement printed in the agenda.

Adoption of Agenda and Consent Calendar: The Council approved the agenda as presented, with the stipulation that the chair could change the order of the agenda to expedite the business of the Council. The Consent Calendar was also approved as presented.

4/2023. Resolved, that the Council on Membership approve the agenda for its June 2023 meeting as presented.

5/2023. Resolved, that the following informational report be filed and the following resolution contained on the consent calendar be approved:

ITEM 17: ASDA REPORT

Approval of the March 2023 Council on Membership Meeting Minutes:

6/2023. Resolved, that the Council on Membership approve its March 2023 meeting minutes.

2023-2024 Chair and Vice Chair Elections: The Council elected Dr. Nipa Thakkar (District 3) as chair and elected Dr. Ensy Atarod (District 15) as vice chair for the 2023-2024 term.
OPENING REPORTS

Council Chair: Dr. Nipa Thakkar welcomed the Council and reminded the group of the leadership concept that she previously presented at the March 2023 meeting regarding “airplane emergency exit row seating requirements.” As ADA leaders, Council members should be ready, willing, and able to commit to the ADA and everything it stands for, and to provide leadership with the support they need.

ADA President: Dr. George Shepley, addressed the Council and provided opening remarks, sharing updates from the recent Board of Trustees meeting and the conversations regarding the California Dental Association Board’s proposal for optional ADA membership.

Board Liaison: Dr. Michele Tulak-Gorecki greeted the Council and reiterated the importance and strength of the tripartite and moving membership forward.

Executive Director: Dr. Ray Cohlmia welcomed the Council and provided an update on the ADA’s five customer groups and how they’re working together to reimagine the future of the ADA.

Chief Client Services & Tripartite Relations Officer, Member and Client Services: Ms. April Kates-Ellison updated the Council on the focused work within the tripartite, including onboarding a substantial number of new state executive directors, preparing for Conference Week in July 2023, and continuing work with the newly established tripartite partnership principles.

STRATEGIC DISCUSSION

District Lightning Round: Council members were asked to further engage their informal membership district cabinets for group discussion. These cabinets were formed earlier in the year by each Council member and are comprised of personal contacts that can be tapped throughout the year to provide input and insight on discussion topics. During a lightning round, Council members shared responses they received from the cabinets on the following questions/topics:

1. Early career/new graduate strategies that are being implemented within their districts
2. The most effective and ineffective ADA communications
3. Any district resolutions for this year’s HOD

Review and Discussion of Council Responsibilities: Through conversations in small breakouts, groups identified roles and responsibilities of the Council. Responses were collected and discussed as a full Council, and a workgroup was established to continue discussion and development of the responsibilities and report back to the full Council.

SUBCOMMITTEE AND JOINT ACTION TEAM REPORTS

Subcommittee on Membership Policy and Trends: Dr. Kerri Simpson, Chair of the Subcommittee on Membership Policy and Trends, led discussions and voting on the 22 policies up for review per House Resolution 170H-2012, Regular Comprehensive Policy Review. The Council adopted the following resolutions:

7/2023. Resolved, that the Subcommittee on Membership Policy and Trends of the Council on Membership recommend that the following policies be maintained as written:

- Financial Hardship Dues Waivers (Trans.2002:381; 2018:300)
- Registration Fees for Members (Trans.1989:537)
- Involvement of Students in Society Activities (Trans.1979:649)
- Dues Exemption for Active-Duty Members (Trans.2004:297, 335; 2015:296)
- Parallel Membership Categories (Trans.2008:482; 2018:299)
- Administrative Process for Transferring Members (Trans.2001:422)
- Promoting the Value of Tripartite Dentistry (Trans.1995:606; 2013:365)
- Utilization of Tripartite Resources (Trans.1995:604; 2018:300)
• Collaboration with Other Organizations to Support ADA Recruitment and Retention Activities (Trans.1989:540; 1997:659; 2018:301)
• Dental Organization Membership Contingent on ADA Membership (Trans.1985:610; 1996:667)
• Dentists Retired From Federal Service (Trans.1963:285; 1996:671)
• Streamlining Membership Category Transfers (Trans.2001:426; 2018:300) [pending secondary review]
• Long-Term Dues Waivers (Trans.2002:384)
• Student Membership (Trans.1977:957; 1996:673; 2015:291)
• Transfer Nonrenews (Trans.1995:605; 2018:299)
• Requirement for Membership Maintenance in ADA for Fellows of the American College of Dentists, the USA Section of the International College of Dentists and the Pierre Fauchard Academy (Trans.1989:538; 2012:512)

8/2023. Resolved, that the ADA policy, Application Process for Direct ADA Membership (Trans.1989:539), be amended as follows (additions are underscored; deletions are stricken):

Resolved, that the American Dental Association verify eligibility of direct members on an annual basis and urge constituent societies to assist in the verification of employment status of direct members, and be it further

Resolved, that the American Dental Association encourage constituent and component societies to promote tripartite membership to ADA direct member federally employed dentists when appropriate.

9/2023. Resolved, that the ADA policy Nonmember Utilization of ADA Member Benefits (Trans.1990:532), be amended as follows (additions are underscored; deletions are stricken):

Resolved, that the ADA Board of Trustees review the policies pertaining to nonmember utilization of ADA member benefits and take whatever action is necessary to ensure that a nonmember cannot utilize ADA member benefits to imply membership and/or promote their practice to the public, and be it further

Resolved, that the pricing differential for ADA products and/or services between members and nonmembers be at the maximum the law will allow in order to increase the tangible benefits of being a member of the ADA member-nonmember price differential should demonstrate and highlight the value of ADA membership.

10/2023. Resolved, that the Subcommittee on Membership Policy and Trends of the Council on Membership recommend that the following policies be rescinded:

• Compliance With Civil Rights Laws (Trans.1997:666)  
  o Explanation for rescinding: In 2023, it is unnecessary for the ADA to urge states to follow civil rights laws they should already be adhering to. This policy is also redundant with the ADA’s Diversity and Inclusion policy (Resolution 69H-2021).

  o Explanation for rescinding: This policy is outdated and redundant with ADA policy, Nonmember Utilization of ADA Member Benefits (Trans.1990:532)
Diversity in Association Membership Marketing and Consumer-Related Materials
(Trans.1995:606)
   Explanation for rescinding: This policy is redundant with the ADA’s Diversity and Inclusion policy (Resolution 69H-2021).

The Council also approved the following recommendations to the Board of Trustees to integrate the Quarter Year Dues Pilot into ADA’s promotional incentives, as well as the recommendations for the 2024 Active Member Promotion segments. Dr. Bellamy did not participate in this discussion and vote.

11/2023. Resolved, that the Council on Membership recommends to the Board of Trustees, based on the outcomes of the 15-for-12 pilot, the program be included in the promotional incentives.

12/2023. Resolved, that the following non-member segments be approved to receive a one-time Active Member Promotion incentive of 50% dues reduction in 2024.

- New Dentists 3 to 10 years out of dental school
- Federal Dental Service Dentists
- Dentists affiliated with a multi-site group practice, including DSOs

The Council also received an update from ADA’s consulting group on DSO research, value propositions and membership models.

Subcommittee on Grants and Member Benefits: Dr. Janis Moriarty, Chair of the Subcommittee on Grants and Member Benefits, led the discussion and vote on the proposed resolution to the Board of Trustees to investigate a recognition program for members’ philanthropic efforts. The following proposed resolution was adopted:

13/2023. Resolved, that the Council on Membership urges the Board of Trustees to ask the appropriate agency to investigate recognizing dentists who have contributed significant philanthropic efforts through a member loyalty program category, acknowledging, but not limited to, their work as dentists to make people healthy. And be it further

Resolved, that the Council on Membership urges the Board of Trustees to ask the appropriate agency to create a dynamic database allowing members to post and/or search for volunteer opportunities available to all members to increase awareness of local, state, national, and global philanthropic events.

Faculty Joint Action Team: Dr. Rhoda Sword updated the Council on the Faculty Joint Action Team (JAT), which is comprised of two members from each of the following councils: Council on Membership, Council on Scientific Affairs (CSA), and Council on Dental Education and Licensure (CDEL). The JAT was created this year to identify ways the ADA can provide an easier pathway to ADA membership for dental school faculty who are foreign trained and non-U.S. licensed, as well as better value for all faculty, who are the #1 influencer of students. The Council reviewed and discussed a resolution proposed by the JAT to eliminate the barriers to membership and offer a dues discount to all full-time faculty. The resolution found in Appendix 1 was approved and will be submitted to the 2023 HOD. Support for the resolution is also being sought from CSA and CDEL. Dr. Bellamy did not participate in this discussion.

Dues Streamlining: Ms. Sandy Eitel provided an overview of the history of Dues Streamlining and the previous actions taken by the Council on Membership that preceded current Council members’ terms. The history is particularly beneficial with the proposed faculty resolution being presented to this year’s House of Delegates. Dr. Bellamy did not participate in this discussion.

INFORMATIONAL REPORTS

Report of the New Dentist Committee: Dr. Giancarlo Ghisalberti, New Dentist Committee (NDC) member, provided the Council with an overview of recent NDC updates including membership growth
opportunities, a joint session with the Board of Trustees, new dentist experience at SmileCon and NDC’s Town Hall series, *Leadership Leads*.

**Farewell to Fourth Years:** As outgoing Council members, Dr. Bellamy, Dr. Nelson, Dr. Patel and Dr. Sniscak, were celebrated and thanked for their dedication and contributions to the Council on Membership during their respective terms.

**NEW BUSINESS**

**New Business:** No new business was presented to the Council at the June 2023 meeting.

**ADJOURNMENT**

**Adjournment:** The Council adjourned its meeting at noon CDT.
Appendix 1

CM-00. Resolved, that the Council on Membership approves the following proposal on faculty membership for consideration by the 2023 House of Delegates, with a recommendation to vote "yes":

00. Resolved, that Chapter I. MEMBERSHIP, Section 20. MEMBERSHIP ELIGIBILITY, Subsection A. ACTIVE MEMBER, of the ADA Bylaws be amended to read as follows (new language underscored, deletions stricken):

A. ACTIVE MEMBER. Any person holding a D.D.S., D.M.D. or equivalent degree or qualified faculty member shall be eligible to be an active member of this Association if they meet the following qualifications:

a. Maintains membership in good standing in this Association as that term is defined in these Bylaws; and

b. Is licensed and/or registered to practice dentistry where the laws and regulations of a constituent’s jurisdiction require licensure and/or registration in order to be a member of the constituent; and

c. Is a member in good standing of the constituent and component where the member either resides, or is employed or practices; or if not a member of such constituent and component is:

1. employed by or is serving on active duty in one of the federal dental services on a full time basis and is not otherwise employed or practicing dentistry within the jurisdiction of a constituent or component; or

2. employed or practicing dentistry in a country other than the United States and is a graduate of a dental school or a graduate of a training program accredited by the Commission on Dental Accreditation; or

3. otherwise ineligible for active membership in a constituent or component where the individual resides, is employed, or practices.

An individual qualifying pursuant to subsections c.1 through 3 shall be referred to as a “direct member.”

and be it further

Resolved, that the Chapter I. MEMBERSHIP MATTERS, Subsection B. Dues, Special Assessments and Financial Related Matters, of the Governance and Organizational Manual of the American Dental Association be amended as follows (additions underscored, deletions stricken):

B. Dues, Special Assessments and Related Financial Matters.

1. Dues. Under the ADA Bylaws, the House of Delegates has the duty to annually set the dues of active members for the ensuing year. Dues are due and payable on January 1, except where a member has opted to pay dues in installments pursuant to a plan offered by the member’s constituent, in which case, dues are paid according to the plan’s requirements.

The schedule of annual dues for each of the membership categories specified in the ADA Bylaws is as

Bylaws footnotes

* As used in these Bylaws, the term “equivalent degree” means a degree that the jurisdiction involved deems sufficient to allow the degree holder to sit for a full and complete dentist’s licensure examination in the jurisdiction without any additional training.

** As used herein, the term “qualified faculty member” means a dentist holding a D.D.S., D.M.D. or a degree in dentistry conferred by a school outside of the United States and who submits annually an affidavit attesting that they are employed by a dental school located in the United States on at least eighty percent (80%) of a full-time equivalent basis.

*** As used herein, the term “constituent” means a dental association organized in a state or territory of the United States or in Washington, D.C. that is chartered by the ADA House of Delegates. The term “component” means a local dental association that may be created within the boundaries of a constituent by the constituent.

**** The term “federal dental services” as used herein shall mean the dental departments of the Air Force, the Army, the Navy, the Public Health Service, the department of Veterans Affairs and other federal agencies.
follows:

a. **Active Members.**
   i. From degree award through conclusion of the first full year following an award of a D.D.S. or D.M.D. degree: The member is exempt from the payment of dues.
   ii. Second full year following degree award: Fifty percent (50%) of active member dues as set by the House of Delegates pursuant to the ADA Bylaws.
   iii. Third full year following degree award and thereafter: One hundred percent (100%) of active member dues as set by the House of Delegates pursuant to the ADA Bylaws.
   iv. **Eligible faculty members**: Fifty percent (50%) of the active member dues as set by the House of Delegates pursuant to the ADA Bylaws.
   iv.v. Members becoming active members after July 1, except for those whose membership has lapsed for failure to pay the current year’s dues and/or any special assessment, shall pay fifty percent (50%) of any annual dues then in effect. Those members becoming active members after October 1, except for those whose membership has lapsed for failure to pay the current year’s dues and/or any special assessment, shall be exempt from the payment of any annual dues then in effect.

2. **Special Assessments.** Pursuant to the ADA Bylaws, the House of Delegates has the power to levy special assessments. Any special assessment for a calendar year is due and payable on January 1, except where a member has opted to pay in installments pursuant to a plan offered by the member’s constituent; in which case, the special assessment is paid according to the plan’s requirements.

   The schedule of special assessment allocation for each of the membership categories specified in the ADA Bylaws is as follows:

   a. **Active Members.**
      i. From degree award through conclusion of the first full year following an award of a D.D.S. or D.M.D. degree: the member is exempt from the payment of any special assessment then in effect.
      ii. Second full year following degree award: Fifty percent (50%) of any special assessment then in effect.
      iii. Third full year following degree award and thereafter: One hundred percent (100%) of any special assessment then in effect.
      iv. **Eligible faculty members**: Fifty percent (50%) of any special assessment then in effect.
      iv.v. On a one-time only basis, those members becoming active members after July 1, except for those whose membership has lapsed for failure to pay the current year’s dues and/or any special assessment, shall pay fifty percent (50%) of any annual dues then in effect. On a one-time only basis, those members becoming active members after October 1, except for those whose membership has lapsed for failure to pay the current year’s dues and/or any special assessment, shall be exempt from the payment of any special assessment then in effect.

and be it further

**Resolved**, that Chapter VIII. COUNCILS, Subsection B. Eligibility, of the Governance and Organizational Manual of the American Dental Association be amended as follows (new language underscored; deletions stricken):

**B. Eligibility.**

1. **All members of councils must be active, life or retired members in good standing of this Association except as otherwise provided in the Bylaws or this Governance Manual.**

2. **No member of a council may serve concurrently as a member of another council or commission.**

3. **A member shall not be eligible for appointment to another council or commission for a period of two (2) years after completing a previous council or commission appointment, except that a member who serves no more than fifty percent (50%) of their maximum tenure of four (4) one-year terms of council service while they are serving as the nominee of the New Dentist Committee will be exempted from the requirement to wait two years before being eligible to serve on another council.**

* As used in the Governance Manual, the term “eligible faculty member” is as defined in Chapter I. of the ADA Bylaws.
4. The elective and appointive officers and the trustees of this Association shall not serve as members of councils.

5. A member of the Council on Dental Education and Licensure who was selected by the American Association of Dental Boards or the American Dental Education Association but ceases to be an active member of that body may continue as a member of the Council for the balance of that member’s term.

6. A member of the Council on Dental Education and Licensure who was selected by the American Dental Education Association but ceases to be a member of the faculty of a member school of that body shall cease to be a member of the Council on Dental Education and Licensure and the President shall declare the position vacant.

7. To be eligible to serve on the Council on Scientific Affairs, the current recipient of the Gold Medal Award for Excellence in Dental Research shall be an active, life or retired member in good standing of this Association if that individual qualifies for membership in the Association.

8A. A member of a council who holds a degree in dentistry conferred by a school outside of the United States and who ceases to be employed at a dental school in the United States shall remain eligible to serve on that council for the remainder of the membership year.

***