

**AMERICAN DENTAL ASSOCIATION
COUNCIL ON SCIENTIFIC AFFAIRS MEETING MINUTES
CHICAGO, IL
JANUARY 24-25, 2023**

Call to Order: Dr. Sharukh Khajotia, chair, called the meeting of the Council on Scientific Affairs (CSA) to order at 8:34am CST, on Tuesday, January 24, 2023, in the Board Room of the ADA Headquarters Building in Chicago. Some of the members attended via teleconference (Zoom).

ROLL CALL

Members: Council members in attendance for all or part of the meeting included: Dr. Sharukh Khajotia (chair), Dr. Juliana da Costa, Dr. Ellyce Clonon (via Zoom), Dr. Vineet Dhar, Dr. Ashraf Fouad, Dr. Violet Haraszthy (via Zoom), Dr. Hatice Hasturk, Dr. Jennifer Holtzman, Dr. Effie Ioannidou, Dr. Deepak Kademani (via Zoom), Dr. Purnima Kumar (vice-chair), Dr. William MacDonnell, Dr. Radi Masri, Dr. Marcelle Nascimento, Dr. Jacob Park, Dr. Kevin Schwartz (via Zoom), Dr. Livia Tenuta, and Dr. Alessandro Villa. A quorum was present.

ADA Science & Research Institute (ADASRI) Staff: The following ADASRI staff members attended all or part of the meeting: Dr. Marcelo Araujo, Ms. Kristy Azzolin, Mr. Roger Connolly, Ms. Hillary DeLong, Ms. Christine Dillon, Dr. Simone Duarte, Dr. Prerna Gopal, Dr. Ruth Lipman, Mr. Jim Lyznicki, Dr. Spiro Megremis, Ms. Mariam Siddiqui, Mr. Derek Smith, Ms. Mary Swick, Mr. Rashad Vinh, Ms. Tyharrie Woods, and Ms. Kathleen Ziegler.

ADA Staff: The following ADA staff attended all or part of the meeting: Dr. George Shepley, ADA president; Dr. Raymond Cohlmi, ADA executive director; Ms. Paula Tironi, senior associate general counsel; and Dr. Dave Preble, ADA chief strategy officer.

Invited Guests (for all or part of the meeting): Dr. Randall Markarian (BOT liaison), Ms. Jenna Chun (ASDA liaison); Dr. Najia Usman, vice chair, CDEL (via Zoom).

Summary of Special Appearances (in order of appearance): Dr. Raymond Cohlmi, ADA executive director; Dr. Brett Kessler, chair, ADASRI Board of Directors; Dr. Dave Preble, ADA chief strategy officer; Dr. Leigh Kent, vice chair, CGA (via Zoom); Dr. Deb Peters, vice-chair, CEBJA (via Zoom); Dr. Manish "Manny" Chopra, chair, CDP (via Zoom); Dr. Jim Nickman, chair, CDEL (via Zoom).

PRELIMINARY BUSINESS

Disclosure of Business or Personal Relationships: Before consideration of business, Dr. Khajotia called attention to the ADA Disclosure Policy included on the meeting agenda. No disclosures were made.

Approval of Agenda and Consent Calendar: No new items of business were requested, nor was any item removed from the consent calendar. The following resolutions were adopted as presented:

01/23. Resolved, that the agenda be approved as the official order of business for the January 24-25, 2023, meeting of the Council on Scientific Affairs except that the Chair may alter the order of the agenda when necessary to expedite business.

02/23. Resolved, that the resolutions contained on the Consent Calendar for consideration at the January 24-25, 2023, CSA meeting be approved and reports be filed.

ADA Professional Conduct Policy and Fiduciary Duty: Ms. Tironi provided an oral report to the Council regarding professional conduct, fiduciary duty of Council members, and other general legal topics.

ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS

Resolutions Adopted by E-Ballot: In accordance with the American Dental Association Standing Rules for Councils and Commissions, all business transacted by ballot without a meeting shall be recorded in the minutes of the next regular session of the council. Accordingly, the Council's non-confidential electronic ballots (e-ballot) actions which were posted between June 2022 and January 2023 are presented below in reverse chronological order (all were approved):

E28/22. Resolved, that the CSA approve use of any or all of the April 2020 ACE Panel Report survey questions, as outlined in the December 13, 2022 e-ballot report "Request to Use ACE Panel Survey Questions," by Dr. Lauren Feldman, Director, Advanced Education Program in Pediatric Dentistry, NYU Dentistry.

E27/22. Resolved, pursuant to the request from CDEL to develop a clinical practice guideline for the use of sedation and general anesthesia in dentistry, that the scope and format be modified to change the format from "Clinical Practice Guideline" to "Scoping Review" and to change the scope from "Light, Moderate, and Deep Sedation in Adults" to "Moderate Sedation in Adults"; and be it further

Resolved, that the CSA's decision concerning this modification be transmitted to the CDEL Anesthesiology Committee for review at its meeting on December 13, 2022, with a request for response regarding interest in this deliverable as modified.

E21/22. Resolved, that the 2022 clinical practice guideline titled "Evidence-based clinical practice guideline on restorative treatments for caries lesions" is approved for publication.

E24/22. Resolved, that Ms. Mickie Aerne-Bowe be invited to serve as a member of the Guideline Panel appointed to oversee the development of updated clinical recommendations on dental radiographic examinations and cone beam computed tomography; and be it further

Resolved, that the CSA approves the addition of Ms. Mickie Aerne-Bowe to the CSA Consultant List for the 2022-2023 term.

E22/22. Resolved, that the Standards Subcommittee and Research Priorities Subcommittee be merged and renamed as the Policies, Priorities and Standards Subcommittee effective immediately, with the charge and duties defined in Attachment 2 to this ballot; and be it further

Resolved, that Resolutions 27/16 (standards authority), 03/18 (approval of annual dental standards priorities) and 03/21 (approval of SCDP observer assignments) be rescinded.

E23/22. Resolved, that the CSA approves the addition of Dr. Scott Howell, Dr. Roy Rockman and Dr. Kim Capehart to the CSA Consultant List for the 2022-2023 term.

E20/22 Resolved, that the minutes of the June 21-22, 2022 meeting be approved.

E17/22. Resolved, that the ACE Panel Report entitled "Intraoral Appliance Use in Dental Practice" is approved by the Council for publication in the "CSA Corner" section of JADA.

E15/22 Resolved, that the August 2022 revision of the ADA Seal of Acceptance Requirements for Fluoride Rinses (effective August 20, 2022) be adopted.

E12/22. Resolved, that the ACE Panel Report entitled "Oral Health Care Practice Patterns for Geriatric Patients" is approved by the Council for publication in the "CSA Corner" section of JADA.

CSA Consultant Nominations (2023-2024): The Council was provided a brief update on the selection process of CSA consultants for the 2023-2024 term on consent.

CSA Nomination Categories for 2024-2028 Term: Dr. Khajotia presented a report on the CSA member nomination categories for 2024. Following discussion, the Council adopted the following resolution, as amended (deletions ~~stricken~~, additions underlined):

03/23. Resolved, that the CSA recommends that Board of Trustees consider as priorities the following areas of expertise for the nomination and selection of new CSA members for the 2024-2028 term:

- Pediatric dentistry
- Prosthodontics
- Oral medicine
- ~~General d~~Dentist (preference for standards or digital technology expertise)

Update on Proposed New CSA Members for 2023-2027: The Council was provided a brief update on consent regarding the individuals the CSA selected as preferred nominees for Council membership for the 2023-2027 term.

Future CSA Meeting Dates: Dr. Khajotia outlined the following scheduled Council meeting dates through the year 2024:

- 2023 Summer Meeting (in-person): July 11-12, 2023
- 2023 New Member Orientation (in-person): August 21, 2023 (tent.)
- Winter Meeting 2024 (in-person): January 23-24, 2024
- Summer Meeting 2024 (in-person): July 10-11, 2024

ADA Strategic Alignment: Dr. Preble provided a brief update to the Council on organizational alignment under strategic forecasting. A discussion followed regarding the ways in which the CSA could align its work across relevant Councils.

STANDING REPORTS

Report of the Chair, CSA: Dr. Khajotia outlined activities undertaken since the June 2022 CSA meeting, including the establishment of the Policies, Priorities, and Standards (PPS) Subcommittee and related changes in the ADA Standards program; as well as priority areas of interest during the 2022-2023 term, including continuing the dissemination of high-quality clinical research and tools to ADA members, growth opportunities for current CSA programs, and exploring opportunities to collaborate and grow the dental research pipeline.

Report of the Executive Director, ADA: Dr. Cohlmia delivered a presentation on efforts by his leadership team to advocate for a customer-focused governance system, promote collegiality and synergy across the profession, and transform the ADA's digital presence.

Report of the Chief Executive Officer, ADA Science and Research Institute, LLC: Dr. Araujo provided a brief update on ADASRI activities since the June 2022 CSA meeting, including key 2022 metrics and operational updates.

Report of the Chair, ADA Science and Research Institute LLC Board of Directors: Dr. Kessler provided a report to the Council outlining activities taken since the June 2022 CSA meeting, including updates on the Maryland labs and continued collaboration efforts with CSA.

SUBCOMMITTEE AND WORKGROUP REPORTS

Report of the ACE Panel Oversight Subcommittee: Dr. Kumar, subcommittee chair, presented information on the activities of the subcommittee since the June 2022 CSA meeting, including forthcoming surveys on e-marketing, tele-dentistry, emotional dentistry, and mental health of dental care practitioners. Dr. Kumar also summarized a recent request for collaboration, following which the Council adopted the following resolution:

04/23. Resolved, that in conformance with Board Resolution B105-2009 and House Resolution 48H-2008, requests to use CSA-developed ACE Panel survey questions for research purposes are assigned to the ACE Panel Subcommittee for review and recommended action.

Report of the Clinical Excellence Subcommittee: Dr. Dhar, subcommittee chair, provided an update on activities of the subcommittee, including the completion of a clinical practice guideline on caries prevention and the restorative treatment for caries lesions. He also outlined the need for a method of determining what format might be most appropriate for future research requests, and presented a document entitled “Decision Tool for CSA Products” for consideration. Following discussion, the following resolution was adopted, as amended (deletion ~~stricken~~, addition underlined):

05/23. Resolved, that the Council approves the “Decision Tool for CSA Products,” as presented in Attachment 1 of Report 5.3 as amended at the January 2023 CSA meeting for use in responding to requests for the development of scientific materials.

A copy of the amended document is provided as an attachment to these minutes.

Report of the Policies, Priorities, and Standards Subcommittee: Dr. Fouad, subcommittee chair, provided a brief update on the subcommittee’s current activities, including review of three current ADA policies on tooth whitening, HPV vaccination, and the early detection and prevention of oral and oropharyngeal cancer; updated details on those items were provided on consent. Dr. Fouad also outlined the subcommittee’s plan to review existing ADA policies alongside CSA programs and products to identify potential areas of development.

Report of the Seal of Acceptance Subcommittee: Dr. Nascimento, subcommittee chair, provided an update on subcommittee activities since June 2022. Additional information pertaining to this agenda item is presented in the Confidential section of these minutes.

RESPONSE TO ASSIGNMENTS FROM THE HOUSE OF DELEGATES AND BOARD OF TRUSTEES

Update on Sugar Task Force: Dr. Holtzman provided a brief update on the activities of the Sugar Task Force, to which she was appointed as a CSA representative.

LIAISON ACTIVITIES

Report of the Standards Committee on Dental Products (SCDP): Dr. Park, one of three CSA subject matter experts on the SCDP, provided a brief update on recent SCDP activities, including actions taken by the ISO/TC US workgroups and the eleven International Dental Product Standards that were published in 2022.

Report of the Standards Committee on Dental Information SCDI: Dr. Fouad, CSA subject matter expert on the SCDI, presented on the recent actions taken by SCDI at its meeting at SmileCon in Houston, TX, on October 12, 2022.

The following organizations provided reports on their recent activities, which were provided to the Council on consent:

- American Student Dental Association (ASDA)
- American Dental Education Association (ADEA)
- National Dental Practice-Based Research Network (NDPBRN)
- National Institute for Dental and Craniofacial Research (NIDCR)
- American Association for Dental, Oral and Craniofacial Research/International Association for Dental Research (AADOCR/IADR)
- American Heart Association Rheumatic Fever, Endocarditis and Kawasaki Disease (RFEKD) Science Subcommittee
- New Dentist Committee (NDC)

SPECIAL ITEMS OF BUSINESS

Update on Sedation and General Anesthesia Guidance: Dr. Dhar provided an update on the sedation project, including a recent letter that was transmitted to the Council on Dental Education and Licensure in December 2022 regarding a suggested change in study format. He reported that CDEL will be reviewing the proposal at its Jan 2023 meeting.

Update on Revision of 2012 ADA/FDA Guidance Document "Dental Radiographic Examinations: Recommendations for Patient Selection and Limiting Patient Exposure": Dr. Dhar provided an update on the CSA's update of the 2012 document, including progress on manuscript development and updates to the guideline panel and consultant group.

Proposal to Submit CE to SmileCon 2023: Dr. Dhar proposed submission of a CE abstract for SmileCon 2023 in Orlando, Florida. Following discussion, the following resolution was adopted, as presented:

06/23. Resolved, that the Council approves submission of the proposed continuing education course for SmileCon 2023 entitled, "ADA 2023 Clinical Practice Guideline on the Use of Surgical Treatments for Caries Lesions", and as presented in Report 8.4 of the January 2023 CSA meeting.

ADA Council Updates: The following councils provided reports on their recent activities via their chairs or vice-chairs:

- Dr. Manish "Manny" Chopra, chair, Council on Dental Practice
- Dr. Leigh Kent, vice-chair, Council on Government Affairs
- Dr. Jim Nickman, chair, Council on Dental Education and Licensure

- Dr. Deb Peters, vice-chair, Council on Ethics, Bylaws and Judicial Affairs

Strategic Discussion of CSA Projects and Priorities: Dr. Khajotia presented on the need to review and prioritize the Council's list of current projects. Following discussion, the Council adopted the following amended resolutions (deletion ~~stricken~~, addition underlined):

07/23. Resolved, that the Council assign review of the list of its published clinical practice guidelines (as listed in Attachment 1 of Report 8.5 at the January 2023 CSA meeting) to the Clinical Excellence Subcommittee with a response back to the Council at no later than the July 2023 meeting including recommendations regarding a prioritization/review schedule for existing guidelines.

08/23. Resolved, that the following projects are Council priorities for completion in 2023: Sedation and Anesthesia guideline review; and revision of the 2012 radiographic guidelines.

CLOSING ITEMS

Items Pulled from Consent: No motions were made to remove items from consent.

Proposed New Business: No motions were made to add items of new business to the agenda.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 9:35 a.m. on Wednesday, January 25, 2023.

Attachment

Decision Tool for CSA Products

Purpose: The purpose of this draft Decision Tool is to provide a framework of CSA products/resources that can guide the Council’s response to requests for scientific materials, both internal and external.

Request Criteria:

- 1) Is this topic an ADA priority?*
- 2) Does this request fall within the CSA’s Bylaws and subject-matter responsibilities?
- 3) Is this topic a CSA research priority?*
- 4) Is this intended to provide clinical support?
- 5) What is the highest level of project requirements that can be met?

Clinical Support Tools (in order of project requirements)				
Product	Product Description	Project Requirement(s)	Est. Project Duration	Project Considerations
Clinical Practice Guideline (CPG)	Provides evidence-based, clinical recommendations using a panel of experts who review scientific data comparing specific interventions	<p>Defined PICO question</p> <p>Peer-reviewed research (e.g., RCTs, non-randomized studies, observational studies)</p> <p>Existing or <i>de novo</i> systematic reviews</p> <p>Establishment of expert panel or guideline panel (typically including CSA members and/or consultants).</p>	12 – 36 months	If <i>de novo</i> SR(s) are required, project duration will be longer.
Systematic Review (SR)	Addresses a defined research question using critical appraisal of available and relevant study data	<p>Clearly articulated objectives or research question(s) to be addressed (<u>e.g., PICO question</u>)</p> <p>Comprehensive search to identify all relevant studies. Appraisal and synthesis of evidence that meets pre-specified eligibility criteria.</p> <p>May include establishing an expert panel or writing group (volunteers and/or staff)</p>	9-20 months	

Rapid or Scoping Review	Provides a summary of the available data/research on a specific topic	Clearly articulated objectives or research question(s) to be addressed (e.g., PICO question) Peer-reviewed studies	6 – 12 months, depending on topic	
Expert Consensus Statement	Provides clinical guidance where supporting data is limited or non-existent, leveraging clinical opinion or expertise	Use of published data (where available) preferred Establishment of a writing group (volunteers and/or staff)		
ACE Panel Report	Provides a snapshot of clinical trends using peer-reported survey data alongside relevant clinical insight	CSA approval ACE Panel survey data	4 months (exclusive of CSA approval process)	
Informational Resources and Educational Tools				
Deliverable	Product Description	Project Requirement(s)	Estimated Project Duration	Project Considerations
Commentary/Editorial or White Paper	Brief summary of what is known on the topic, typically with a call to action, often published in a scientific journal.	May include identification of lead CSA member(s) [and/or an internal writing group composed of CSA members/consultants] to prepare draft commentary or white paper	3 to 5 months	
Oral Health Topic (OHT) page on ADA.org	Provides a summary of known information on a given subject, including relevant policies or resources; published on ADA.org	ADASRI staff support to research and develop new or updated OHT content based on best available evidence	1 to 3 months (depending on OHT topic; availability of research evidence, staff support)	

* Requests that are not a current ADA or CSA priority will require additional consideration/approval.