

**AMERICAN DENTAL ASSOCIATION  
COUNCIL ON SCIENTIFIC AFFAIRS MEETING MINUTES  
CHICAGO, IL  
July 11, 2023**

**Call to Order:** Dr. Sharukh Khajotia, chair, called the meeting of the Council on Scientific Affairs (CSA) to order at 8:33am CST, on Tuesday, July 11, 2023, in the Board Room of the ADA Headquarters Building in Chicago. Some of the members and guests attended via teleconference (Zoom).

**ROLL CALL**

**Members:** Council members in attendance for all or part of the meeting included: Dr. Sharukh Khajotia (chair), Dr. Ellyce Clonan, Dr. Vineet Dhar, Dr. Ashraf Fouad, Dr. Violet Haraszthy, Dr. Hatice Hasturk, Dr. Jennifer Holtzman, Dr. Effie Ioannidou, Dr. Deepak Kademani, Dr. Purnima Kumar (vice-chair), Dr. William MacDonnell, Dr. Radi Masri, Dr. Marcelle Nascimento (via Zoom videoconference), Dr. Jacob Park, Dr. Kevin Schwartz, Dr. Livia Tenuta (via Zoom videoconference), Dr. Alessandro Villa. Dr. Juliana da Costa did not attend. A quorum was present.

**ADA and ADA Science & Research Institute (ADASRI) Staff:** Dr. Raymond Cohlma, ADA Executive Director; Dr. Dave Preble, Interim ADASRI CEO; Mr. Roger Connolly, Ms. Hillary DeLong, Ms. Christine Dillon, Dr. Simone Duarte (via Zoom videoconference), Dr. Prerna Gopal, Dr. Ruth Lipman, Mr. Jim Lyznicki, Dr. Spiro Megremis, Ms. Mariam Siddiqui, Ms. Mary Swick, Ms. Paula Tironi, Ms. Tyharrie Woods, Mr. Rashad Vinh, Ms. Kathleen Ziegler.

**Invited Guests (for all or part of the meeting):** Dr. George Shepley, ADA president; Dr. Linda Edgar, ADA President Elect; Dr. Randall Markarian, BOT liaison; Ms. Jenna Chun, ASDA liaison; and ADA staff: Dr. Hana Alberti, Ms. Sharon Stanford, Dr. Meaghan Strotman, and Ms. Sandy Eitel.

**PRELIMINARY BUSINESS**

**Disclosure of Business or Personal Relationships:** Before consideration of business, Dr. Khajotia called attention to the ADA Disclosure Policy included on the meeting agenda. No disclosures were made.

**Approval of Agenda:** Upon presentation of the meeting agenda, the following resolution was adopted:

**12/23. Resolved**, that the agenda be approved as the official order of business for the July 11, 2023, meeting of the Council on Scientific Affairs except that the Chair may alter the order of the agenda when necessary to expedite business.

**Approval of Consent Calendar:** The consent calendar was presented to the Council for consideration, at which time Report 7.7 was removed from the consent calendar. The revised consent calendar was adopted via the following resolution:

**13/23. Resolved**, that the resolutions contained on the Consent Calendar, as amended, for consideration at the July 11, 2023, CSA meeting be approved and reports be filed.

**Approval of Voting Rules for Contested Elections:** Before considering nominations for the CSA chair and vice chair positions for the 2022-2023 term, the Council reviewed voting rules for resolving contested elections. After discussion, the Council adopted the following resolution:

**14/23. Resolved**, that for 2023 contested chair or vice-chair elections, the CSA will adhere to the following rules:

- Two nominations: When two candidates have been nominated and no candidate receives a majority of the votes cast, one or more runoffs shall be held, as necessary, until one candidate receives a majority of the votes cast.
- Three or more nominations: When three or more candidates have been nominated, and no candidate receives a majority of the votes cast, the candidate having the lowest vote shall be removed from the ballot for a successive vote.
  - One or more runoff ballots shall be held, as necessary, until one candidate receives a majority of the votes cast.
  - On each runoff ballot, the name of the candidate who received the lowest vote on the previous ballot will be eliminated.

**Election of Council Chair, 2023-2024:** The Chair called for nominations for the CSA chair position for the 2023-2024 term. Dr. Purnima Kumar received the only nomination, and the following resolution was adopted:

**15/23. Resolved**, that Dr. Purnima Kumar is elected as chair of the Council on Scientific Affairs for the 2023-2024 term.

**Election of Council Vice Chair, 2023-2024:** The Chair requested nominations for the CSA vice chair position for the 2023-2024 term. Dr. Ashraf Fouad received the only nomination, and the following resolution was adopted:

**16/23. Resolved**, that Dr. Ashraf Fouad is elected as vice chair of the Council on Scientific Affairs for the 2023-2024 term.

**Recognition of Outgoing Council Members:** The following outgoing Council members were recognized for their invaluable service and contribution to the CSA:

- Dr. Sharukh Khajotia (outgoing chair)
- Dr. Effie Ioannidou
- Dr. Deepak Kademani
- Dr. Radi Masri

## **ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS**

**Resolutions Adopted by E-Ballot:** In accordance with the American Dental Association Standing Rules for Councils and Commissions, all business transacted by ballot without a meeting shall be recorded in the minutes of the next regular session of the council. Accordingly, the Council's non-confidential electronic ballots (e-ballot) actions which were posted between January 2023 and July 2023 are presented below in reverse chronological order (all were approved):

**E18/23. Resolved**, that the manuscript titled "Optimizing Radiation Safety in Dentistry: Clinical Recommendations and Regulatory Considerations," is approved for publication.

**E17/23 Resolved**, that Seal of Acceptance be awarded to ORALINE FLUORIDE TOOTHPASTE BY JM MURRAY CENTER, INC., for a five-year period.

**E16/23 Resolved**, that Seal of Acceptance be awarded to ORALINE SECURE CLEAR FLUORIDE TOOTHPASTE by JM MURRAY CENTER, INC. for a five-year period.

**E15/23 Resolved**, that Seal of Acceptance be awarded to ORALINE KIDS FLUORIDE TOOTHGEL by J.M. MURRAY, for a five-year period.

**E14/23 Resolved**, that Seal of Acceptance be awarded to ORALINE KIDS FLUORIDE TOOTHPASTE by J.M. MURRAY, for a five-year period.

**E13/23 Resolved**, that Seal of Acceptance be awarded to CLÖSYS® SILVER HEALTHY TEETH ORAL RINSE by ROWPAR PHARMACEUTICALS, INC., for a five-year period

**E12/23 Resolved**, that the ACE Panel Report entitled “Teledentistry: Adoption and applications” is approved by the Council for publication in the “CSA Corner” section of JADA.

**E11/23 Resolved**, that the Council approves the document titled "Authorship Criteria for Scientific Publications Developed by the ADA Council on Scientific Affairs" for use when defining authorship of CSA-developed, peer-reviewed publications, where appropriate.

**E10/23 Resolved**, that the following CSA consultants be approved for a one-year term commencing at the adjournment of the 2023 annual session of the House of Delegates and expiring at the adjournment of the 2024 annual session of the House of Delegates:

Aerne-Bowe, Mickie; Allareddy, Veeratrishul; Benavides, Erika; Buchanan, Allison; Capehart, Kim L.; Cevidanes, Lucia; Clark, Melinda; Cordell, Kitrina; Dionne, Raymond; Elangovan, Satheesh; Espinoza, Lorena; Fontana, Margherita; Frazier, Kevin; Geisinger, Maria L.; Gonzalez-Cabezas, Carlos; Gordon, Sharon; Gurenlian, JoAnn R.; Guzman-Armstrong, Sandra; Hersh, Elliot; Howell, Scott; Huja, Sarandeep; Ionnidou, Effie; Kademani, Deepak; Kakar, Smita; Keels, Martha Ann; Khajotia, Sharukh; Khan, Asma; Malik, Anchal; Mascarenhas, Ana Karina; Masri, Radi; Pannu, Darshanjit; Patton, Lauren; Peacock, Zachary Scott; Pfeifer, Carmem; Ramos, Mario; Revilla-Leon, Marta; Rockman, Roy A.; Sarvas, Elise Watson; Schwartz, Paul; Sedghizadeh, Parish; Slayton, Rebecca; Spelic, David; Suda, Katie J.; Tinanoff, Norman; Weyant, Robert J.; Whang, Kyumin; Wolff, Mark S.; Yepes, Juan F.; Young, Douglas A.; Zero, Domenick

**E09/23 Resolved**, that the policy titled ADA Policy on Tooth Whitening Administered by Non-Dentists (Trans.2008:477) be rescinded; and be it further

**Resolved**, that this recommendation be transmitted to the 2023 ADA House of Delegates

**E08/23 Resolved**, that the Council on Scientific Affairs recommends that the ADA Policy on Early Detection and Prevention of Oral and Oropharyngeal Cancer (2014:506; 2019:277) be maintained without amendment; and be it further

**Resolved**, that the CSA approves transmittal of this recommendation to the 2023 House of Delegates via its Annual Report.

**E07/23 Resolved**, that the Council on Scientific Affairs recommend that the ADA Policy on Human Papillomavirus (HPV) Vaccination for the Prevention of Infection with HPV Types Associated with Oropharyngeal Cancer (2018:351) be retained without amendment; and be it further

**Resolved**, that the CSA approves transmittal of this recommendation to the 2023 House of Delegates via its Annual Report.

**E06/23 Resolved**, that Seal of Acceptance be awarded to usmile Sonic Electric Toothbrush Y1S by Guangzhou Stars Pulse Co., Ltd., for a five-year period.

**E05/23 Resolved**, that the Minutes of the January 24-25, 2023, meeting be approved.

**E04/23 Resolved**, that Council approves the collated comments on the Guideline on Nonpharmacological Behavior Guidance Techniques Used in Pediatric Dentistry, which are presented in the Attachment to this report, and be it further

**Resolved**, that the comments be transmitted to the ADA President for approval prior to submission to the American Association of Pediatric Dentists on behalf of the ADA.

**E03/23 Resolved**, that the ACE Panel Report entitled “Prevalence and applications of 3D printers in dental practice” is approved by the Council for publication in the “CSA Corner” section of JADA.

**E02/23 Resolved**, that Seal of Acceptance be awarded to EUTHYMOL TOTAL CARE TOOTHPASTE by LG H&H, USA INC. for a five-year period.

**E01/23 Resolved**, that Seal of Acceptance be awarded to EUTHYMOL CLASSIC TOOTHBRUSH by LG H&H, USA INC for a five-year period.

**Future CSA Meeting Dates:** Dr. Khajotia drew the Council’s attention to the following scheduled Council meeting dates through the year 2024:

- January 23-24, 2024 (in-person)
- July 10-11, 2024 (in-person)

## STANDING REPORTS

**Report of the Chair, CSA:** Dr. Khajotia briefly outlined activities undertaken since the January 2023 CSA meeting, including the work of the CSA leadership team and changes to the CSA meeting format.

**Report of the President, ADA:** Dr. Shepley presented a brief update on an action taken by the California Dental Association (CDA) Board of Directors.

**Report of the Executive Director, ADA:** Dr. Cohlmia delivered a presentation on the ongoing challenges facing the dental profession and efforts by his leadership team to advocate for a customer-focused governance system, promote collegiality and synergy across the profession, and transform the ADA’s digital presence.

**Report of the Interim Chief Executive Officer, ADA Science and Research Institute, LLC:** Dr. Preble led a discussion on the strategic direction of CSA programming, including potential changes to the format of scientific clinical resources developed by the Council, and to the ADA Seal of Acceptance program.

**Report of the Chair, ADA Science and Research Institute LLC Board of Directors:** Dr. Kessler provided updates on ADASRI Board activities since the January 2023 CSA meeting, including updates on ADASRI’s organizational status transition, the search process for the next CEO, and updates on the Maryland lab. He also briefly outlined some of ADASRI’s goals for 2023-2024.

## SUBCOMMITTEE AND WORKGROUP REPORTS

**Report of the ACE Panel Oversight Subcommittee:** Dr. Kumar, Subcommittee chair, presented information on the activities of the Subcommittee since the January 2023 CSA meeting, including progress on four ACE Panel reports on 3D printing, Tele-dentistry, E-marketing and Emotional Dentistry. Dr. Kumar also introduced new survey topics for the 2023- 2024 term, plus an additional recommendation to cease work on the previously-approved “mental health of dental care professionals.” After a brief discussion, the following resolution was adopted as written:

**19/23. Resolved**, that the Council approves the following topics for development of ACE Panel reports:

- Implants
- Caries Risk Assessment and Treatment
- Mouthrinse - Prescriptions and Recommendations
- Oral Irrigators and Power Toothbrushes
- Radiography

And be it further,

**Resolved**, that the Council will cease development of a report on “Mental Health of Dental Care Practitioners,” as was approved via Resolution 16/22.

**Report of the Clinical Excellence Subcommittee:** Dr. Dhar, Subcommittee chair, provided an update on activities of the Subcommittee since the January meeting, some of which were accomplished via e-ballot. He also outlined the Subcommittee’s efforts to develop a recommended prioritization schedule for current or future guideline projects, and presented the Subcommittee’s recommendation, which included the development of several smaller guidelines in lieu of continued work on the Caries Prevention guideline, which has been on hold since 2019. The following resolution was adopted:

**17/23. Resolved**, that the Council consider the priority recommendations, as provided in Attachment 1 of Report 5.3 at the July 2023 CSA meeting, when pursuing development of future CSA guideline projects;

and be it further,

**Resolved**, that the Council cease work on the Caries Prevention guideline.

**Report of the Policies, Priorities, and Standards Subcommittee:** Dr. Fouad, Subcommittee chair, provided a brief update on the Subcommittee’s activities since January, including status updates on the review of three ADA policies on tooth whitening, HPV vaccination, and the early detection and prevention of oral and oropharyngeal cancer. Dr. Fouad also requested discussion on two potential areas for policy development: 1) Prevention of Oral Disease and 2) Promotion of tricalcium silicates in the management of vital pulp therapies. Dr. Fouad indicated that the discussion would inform future Subcommittee deliberations on these items.

**Report of the Seal of Acceptance Subcommittee:** Dr. Nascimento, Subcommittee chair, provided an update on the consent calendar regarding Subcommittee activities since January 2023. Additional information pertaining to this agenda item is presented in the Confidential section of these minutes.

## RESPONSE TO ASSIGNMENTS FROM THE ADA HOUSE OF DELEGATES AND ADA BOARD OF TRUSTEES

**Update on Sugar Task Force:** Dr. Holtzman provided a brief update on the consent calendar regarding the activities of the Sugar Task Force, to which she was appointed as a CSA representative.

## LIAISON ACTIVITIES

**Report of the American Heart Association Rheumatic Fever, Endocarditis and Kawasaki Disease (RFEKD) Science Subcommittee:** Dr. Fouad drew the Council's attention to the report provided by Dr. Patton, and noted that an endodontist could provide important perspective on the next AHA project relevant to ADA, entitled "updating the 2012 Oral health and Periodontal Disease Statement (Circulation 2012:125:2520-44)," and suggested efforts be made to suggest inclusion of such expertise on any panel informing the work.

**Liaison Reports.** The following organizations provided reports on their recent activities, which were provided to the Council on the consent calendar:

- American Student Dental Association (ASDA)
- American Dental Education Association (ADEA)
- National Dental Practice-Based Research Network (NDPBRN)
- Standards Committee on Dental Products (SCDP) and Standards Committee on Dental Information (SCDI)
- National Institute for Dental and Craniofacial Research (NIDCR)
- American Association for Dental, Oral and Craniofacial Research/International Association for Dental Research (AADOCR/IADR)
- American Heart Association Rheumatic Fever, Endocarditis and Kawasaki Disease (RFEKD) Science Subcommittee
- New Dentist Committee (NDC)
- CSA Involvement with American Association of Hip and Knee Surgeons (AAHKS) and the American Society of Clinical Oncology (ASCO)

## SPECIAL ITEMS OF BUSINESS

**Update on Sedation Scoping Review:** Dr. Dhar provided a brief update on consent regarding a scoping review being developed on the use of moderate sedation and general anesthesia in dentistry, which noted that due to resource limitations, discussions on the future and feasibility of this project between CSA and CDEL leadership are ongoing.

**Update on Revision of 2012 ADA/FDA Guidance Document "Dental Radiographic Examinations: Recommendations for Patient Selection and Limiting Patient Exposure":** Dr. Dhar provided an update on the consent calendar regarding the CSA's efforts, including progress on the development of manuscripts on the following topics: 1) Safety and Regulatory (completed); 2) Diagnostic Test Accuracy (delayed); 3) Indications and Frequency (delayed).

**Public/Professional Roundtable Discussion: Restorative Materials:** Representatives from the Councils on Government Affairs (CGA), Dental Practice (CDP) and Dental Education and Licensure (CDEL) engaged with CSA in a roundtable discussion on the findings of the CSA's recently-published clinical practice guideline on restorative materials, including ways to improve impact, and identification of adoption and implementation barriers.

**Standards Program Changes:** Ms. Stanford presented proposed updates to the ADA Standards program, including changes to their operating procedure and composition. After a brief discussion on the role of the CSA within the program, the following resolution was adopted:

**18/23. Resolved**, that the following recommendation be transmitted to the ADA Board of Trustees on behalf of the Council on Scientific Affairs with a recommendation to vote "yes":

- That the restructure of the American Dental Association Standards Program be approved and that the Operating Rules for the restructured program be adopted.

- That the newly established ADA Standards Program Oversight Committee be authorized to monitor and adopt changes to the Operating Rules, in compliance with the ANSI Essential Requirements

**Update on Membership Joint Action Team:** Dr. Thakkar presented a proposal from the Council on Membership regarding development of an ADA faculty membership tier. The proposal was developed in response to work done by the Membership Joint Action Team, of which CSA was a participant. Dr. Thakkar indicated that the Council on Membership would be transmitting this recommendation to the ADA House of Delegates, and sought support from Council on this effort. Following a brief discussion, the following resolution was adopted:

**20/23. Resolved**, that the CSA recommends that the ADA House of Delegates approves the recommendations, as outlined by the Council on Membership in Attachment 1.

**Proposal to Consider ADA Endorsement of Pediatric Acute Pain Guidelines:** Dr. Dhar briefly outlined the Council's involvement in the development of a clinical practice guideline for the management of acute dental pain in children. He noted that the manuscript was developed under a shared grant between ADASRI, University of Pittsburgh and the University of Pennsylvania, and that the first manuscript under this grant had been approved for ADA endorsement. He then presented a recommendation to Council regarding ADA endorsement of the pediatric publication. After a brief discussion, the Council adopted the following resolution:

**21/23. Resolved**, that the Council on Scientific Affairs recommends that the American Dental Association endorse the manuscript entitled "Evidence-based clinical practice guideline for the pharmacological management of acute dental pain in children: A report from the American Dental Association Science & Research Institute, the University of Pittsburgh School of Dental Medicine, and the Center for Integrative Global Oral Health at the University of Pennsylvania", and its accompanying conversation aids as presented here; and be it further

**Resolved**, the Council on Scientific Affairs recommends transmittal of this recommendation to the ADA Board of Trustees.

## CLOSING ITEMS

**Proposed New Business:** One new item of business was requested and approved following the approval of the agenda.

**CDT Code for Ceramic Materials:** The Council discussed development of Current Dental Terminology (CDT) codes for computer-aided design/manufacturing (CAD/CAM) materials, such as ceramics. The Council determined that CDT code development is not within the purview of the Council, but that individuals could recommend development in their personal capacity as members via a CDT development request form.

## ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 2:47 p.m. on Tuesday, July 11, 2023.

## CONFIDENTIAL ITEMS

The following items are confidential from the July 2023 CSA Meeting:

**Report of the Seal of Acceptance Program Subcommittee (Confidential):** Dr. Nascimento, Subcommittee chair, provided brief updates on consent regarding Subcommittee activities since the January 2023 meeting. She provided updates on Seal product submissions, 2022 growth metrics, and progress related to the development of category requirements for two areas approved by the Council at the January 2023 meeting: OTC management of acute dental pain; and suction-enabled toothbrushes.