

# MINUTES

#### COMMISSION ON DENTAL ACCREDITATION ADA HEADQUARTERS BUILDING, CHICAGO

### THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 7, 2019 (CLOSED SESSION)

<u>Call to Order</u>: In accordance with the *Rules* of the Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA), if the Chair is unable to attend any given meeting of the Board of Commissioners, the Vice Chair shall preside at the meeting. The Vice Chair, Dr. Arthur Chen-Shu Jee, called a regular meeting of the Commission on Dental Accreditation to order at 10:00 A.M. on Thursday, February 7, 2019, in the Executive Board Room of the American Dental Association (ADA) Headquarters Building, Chicago, in closed session for the purpose of reviewing educational programs by the Commission.

**Roll Call:** Dr. John Agar, Dr. Susan Callahan Barnard, Mr. David Cushing, Dr. Catherine Flaitz, Dr. Steven Friedrichsen, Dr. James Geist, Dr. Christopher Hasty, Dr. Kevin Haubrick, Dr. Monica Hebl, Dr. John Hellstein, Dr. H. Garland Hershey, Jr., Dr. Jeffery Hicks, Dr. Adolphus Jackson, Dr. Tariq Javed, Dr. Arthur Chen-Shu Jee (vice chair), Dr. Bradford Johnson, Dr. James Katancik, Dr. Bruce Kinney, Dr. Steven Levy, Mr. Charles McClemens, Ms. Nancy Mo, Dr. William Nelson, Dr. Bruce Rotter, Dr. Marybeth Shaffer, Dr. Alan Stein, Ms. Deanna Stentiford, Mr. Glenn Unser, and Dr. Lawrence Wolinsky.

Dr. Linda Casser was not in attendance.

The Commission recognized and honored Dr. Loren Feldner, chair, CODA, through a moment of silence.

**Trustee Liaison:** Dr. Cesar Sabates, Board of Trustees Liaison to CODA, Seventeenth District Trustee, ADA, was in attendance.

**CODA Staff:** Dr. Sherin Tooks, *ex-officio* (director), Ms. Doreen Johnson, Mr. Gregg Marquardt, Ms. Michelle Smith, Ms. Jennifer Snow, and Ms. Peggy Soeldner were in attendance. Ms. Cathryn Albrecht, senior associate general counsel, CODA was also in attendance.

Adoption of the Agenda: The agenda of the meeting was adopted.

<u>Commissioner Fiduciary Duties and Conflict of Interest Obligations</u>: Ms. Cathryn Albrecht, ADA/CODA Senior Associate General Counsel, reminded the Commission of its fiduciary responsibilities and the Conflict of Interest policy.

<u>Policy Reminder of Confidentiality</u>: Dr. Sherin Tooks, CODA Director, read the Commission's Reminder of Confidentiality, noting the confidential nature of the Commission's materials and deliberations related to the accreditation of programs.



<u>Accreditation Mail Ballots Since Last Commission Meeting</u>: The Commission approved for the record, twelve (12) mail ballots related to program accreditation actions, which had been considered since the Summer 2018 Commission meeting.

<u>Consideration of Site Visitor Nominations</u>: Site Visitors are appointed annually for one-year terms but for no more than six (6) consecutive years. Some members of the Commission's Review Committees are also considered site visitors; they serve one (1) four-year term. The Commission considered the names of individuals recommended by the 14 Review Committees for a one-year appointment as site visitors for 2019-2020.

<u>Commission Action</u>: The Commission on Dental Accreditation approves the site visitor appointments for 2019-2020 (Appendix 1).

<u>Consideration of Matters Relating to Accreditation Actions</u>: The Commission reviewed site visit evaluations, progress reports, and other requested reports on predoctoral dental education programs, advanced dental education programs, and allied dental education programs.

<u>Commission Action</u>: Accreditation status was granted to programs evaluated since the Summer 2018 meeting. Accreditation actions are summarized in the "Report on the Accreditation Statuses of Educational Programs." (Appendix 2).

#### New Business:

**Discussion of Vacancy of CODA Chair:** Noting the immediate vacancy of the Chair of the Commission, the Board of Commissioners discussed whether a special election should occur in open session the following day in order to elect a new CODA Chair. Following discussion of its options to address the chair vacancy, the Commission a motion was made and approved to conduct an election of chair and, as needed, a vice chair during the Commission's open session meeting on Friday, February 8, 2019.

Adjournment: The Commission adjourned the closed session at 3:27 P.M.



# MINUTES

#### COMMISSION ON DENTAL ACCREDITATION ADA HEADQUARTERS BUILDING, CHICAGO

#### FRIDAY, FEBRUARY 8, 2019 (OPEN SESSION)

<u>Call to Order</u>: In accordance with the *Rules* of the Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA), if the Chair is unable to attend any given meeting of the Board of Commissioners, the Vice Chair shall preside at the meeting. The Vice Chair, Dr. Arthur Chen-Shu Jee, called a regular meeting of the Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA) to order at 8:00 A.M. on Friday, February 8, 2019, in the Executive Board Room of the American Dental Association (ADA) Headquarters Building, Chicago, in open session.

**Roll Call:** Dr. John Agar, Dr. Susan Callahan Barnard, Dr. Linda Casser, Mr. David Cushing, Dr. Catherine Flaitz, Dr. Steven Friedrichsen, Dr. James Geist, Dr. Christopher Hasty, Dr. Kevin Haubrick, Dr. Monica Hebl, Dr. John Hellstein, Dr. H. Garland Hershey, Jr., Dr. Jeffery Hicks, Dr. Adolphus Jackson, Dr. Tariq Javed, Dr. Arthur Chen-Shu Jee (vice chair), Dr. Bradford Johnson, Dr. James Katancik, Dr. Bruce Kinney, Dr. Steven Levy, Mr. Charles McClemens, Ms. Nancy Mo, Dr. William Nelson, Dr. Bruce Rotter, Dr. Marybeth Shaffer, Dr. Alan Stein, Ms. Deanna Stentiford, Mr. Glenn Unser, and Dr. Lawrence Wolinsky.

The Commission recognized and honored Dr. Loren Felder, chair, CODA, through a moment of silence.

**Trustee Liaison:** Dr. Cesar Sabates, Board of Trustees Liaison to CODA, Seventeenth District Trustee, American Dental Association (ADA) was in attendance.

**CODA Staff:** Dr. Sherin Tooks, *ex-officio* (director), Ms. Doreen Johnson, Mr. Gregg Marquardt, Ms. Michelle Smith, Ms. Jennifer Snow, and Ms. Peggy Soeldner were in attendance. Ms. Cathryn Albrecht, senior associate general counsel, CODA was also in attendance.

Adoption of Agenda: The agenda of the meeting was adopted.

<u>Conflict of Interest Statement, Fiduciary Reminder, and Reminder of Professional Conduct</u> <u>Policy and Prohibition Against Harassment</u>: Dr. Jee, CODA Vice Chair, reminded the Commissioners of their fiduciary responsibilities and the CODA Conflict of Interest policy. The Commissioners were also reminded of the Professional Conduct Policy and Prohibition Against Harassment.

<u>Approve the Minutes from Summer 2018 Meetings</u>: The minutes of the Summer 2018 Commission meetings were approved.



**<u>Consent Calendar</u>**: The following mail ballots and reports in their entirety were placed on the consent calendar and were adopted as received:

# Mail Ballots

- Proposed Revision to CODA *Rules* Regarding Special Meetings
- Commission on Dental Accreditation Revision to CODA *Rules* and Evaluation and Operational Policies and Procedures (EOPP) Manual to Align with Actions of the 2018 ADA House of Delegates

# Review Committee Reports

- Report of the Review Committee on Advanced Education on General Dentistry, General Practice Residency, Dental Anesthesiology, Oral Medicine and Orofacial Pain Education (**Appendix 3**).
- Report of the Review Committee on Dental Public Health Education (Appendix 4)
- Report of the Review Committee on Oral and Maxillofacial Pathology Education (Appendix 5)
- Report of the Review Committee on Oral and Maxillofacial Radiology Education (Appendix 6)
- Report of the Review Committee on Pediatric Dentistry Education (Appendix 7)
- Report of the Review Committee on Prosthodontics Education (**Appendix 8**)

### **Report of the Review Committee on Predoctoral Dental Education (PREDOC RC):**

<u>Committee Chair</u>: Dr. Bruce Rotter. <u>Committee Members</u>: Dr. Carla Evans, Dr. Charlotte Royeen, Dr. William Akey, Dr. Marsha Pyle, Dr. Susan Long, Dr. Thomas McConnell, and Dr. Karl Self. Dr. Abby Brodie attended by telephone conference call. <u>Guests (Open Session Only)</u>: Ms. Ann Lynch, director, Advocacy and Education, American Dental Hygienists' Association (ADHA) and Dr. Anthony Palatta, chief learning officer, American Dental Education Association (ADEA) attended the policy portion of the meeting. <u>Staff Members</u>: Dr. Sherin Tooks, director, and Ms. Danielle Patrick-Wade, temporary senior project assistant, Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA). Ms. Peggy Soeldner, manager, CODA and Ms. Cathryn Albrecht, senior associate general counsel, CODA attended a portion of the meeting.

The meeting of the Review Committee on Predoctoral Dental Education (PREDOC RC) was held on January 7-8, 2019 at the ADA Headquarters, Chicago, Illinois. The PREDOC RC report is found in **Appendix 9**.

#### <u>Consideration of Proposed Revisions to Standard 6-Research of the Accreditation Standards for</u> Dental Education Programs: The Commission considered the proposed revisions to the

<u>Dental Education Programs</u>: The Commission considered the proposed revisions to the Definition of Terms and Standard 6-Research, along with the comments received through the one (1) year period of public comment. A member of the Commission proposed a friendly amendment to the intent statement of Standard 6-2 (noted below in blue), which was adopted by the Commission. Following discussion and adoption of the modified intent statement to



Standard 6-2, the Commission adopted a resolution that the revisions to the Definition of Terms and Standards 6-1, 6-2 and 6-3 be adopted with an implementation date of January 1, 2020.

**6-2** The dental school faculty, as appropriate to meet the school's purpose/mission, goals and objectives, **must** engage in research or other forms of scholarly activity.

# Intent:

Schools should establish focused, significant, and sustained programs to recruit and retain research intensive faculty suitable to the institution's research themes, and or scholarly activity. The program should employ an adequate number of full-time faculty with time dedicated to the research mission of the institution. Financial resources should ensure that the program will be in a position to recruit and retain qualified faculty.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: The Commission on Dental Accreditation adopts the proposed revisions to the Definition of Terms and Standard 6-Research of the Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs, found in **Appendix 9** with amendment of the intent statement for Standard 6-2 as noted above, with an implementation date of January 1, 2020.

<u>Consideration of Proposed Revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Dental Education</u> <u>Programs Related to Health Literacy</u>: The Commission considered the proposed revisions to the Definition of Terms and Standard 2-17 related to Health Literacy, along with the comments received through the one (1) year period of public comment. Following consideration, the Commission adopted the proposed revisions with implementation January 1, 2020.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: The Commission on Dental Accreditation adopts the proposed revisions to the Definition of Terms and Standard 2-17 related to Health Literacy of the Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs, found in **Appendix 9**, with an implementation date of January 1, 2020.

<u>Consideration of Proposed Revisions to Standards 2-18 through 2-20 and Standard 2-24 of the</u> <u>Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs</u>: The Commission considered the proposed revisions to the intent statements for Standards 2-20 and 2-24 and the new intent statement for Standard 2-9 of the Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs. In accordance with the PREDOC RC's recommendation, the Commission noted that the intent statement below Standard 2-20 is intended to apply only to Standard 2-20. Further, the intent statement of Standard 2-20 should be revised to clarify the expectation that students will attain competence in communicating and collaborating with other members of the health care team to facilitate the provision of health care. With regard to Standard 2-24, the PREDOC RC recommended that the last sentence of the intent statement be revised to clarify that a program should define overall competence in support of the "must" statement that graduates be competent in providing oral health care within the scope of general dentistry. The Review Committee



believed that the student is deemed to have overall competence through attainment of the competencies required in Standard 2-24 and other requirements within Standard 2, and in accordance with the program's definition of overall competence. Additionally, the PREDOC RC recommended that the portion of the intent statement of Standard 2-24, which states "The comprehensive care experiences provided for patients by students should be adequate to ensure competency in all components of general dentistry practice" is best suited as an intent statement for Standard 2-9 related to the availability of adequate patient experiences.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: The Commission on Dental Accreditation adopts the proposed revisions to the intent statements for Standards 2-20 and 2-24 and the new intent statement for Standard 2-9 of the Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs, found in **Appendix 9**, with immediate implementation.

<u>Consideration of the Use of International Educational Activity Sites for Rotations within</u> <u>Predoctoral Dental Education Programs:</u> The Commission considered the recommendation of the PREDOC RC to develop an intent statement for Standard 2-3 related to the use of international sites as rotations within dental education. The Commission noted that the PREDOC RC believed that international sites should not be used to provide education related to program goals, objectives or educational requirements. The PREDOC RC believed that use of international sites for supplemental (non-educational) experiences, such as mission trips, to enrich a student's experience, is permissible as long as the international enrichment does not interfere with the educational program (program content or length). In other words, the supplemental/enrichment international experience should occur outside of the educational program. Additional concerns noted by the PREDOC RC related to institutional and federal regulations, including those related to financial aid, which may dictate the expectation of program length and student attendance requirements. Additional concerns include, but are not limited to, legal and regulatory requirements, oversight of the educational experience, and calibration of faculty.

The PREDOC RC affirmed the following recommendation to CODA: 1) it is the expectation that a dental education program be at least four academic years of instruction or its equivalent; 2) that international enrichment experiences not interfere with curricular content and length; and 3) that co-curricular (extracurricular) international enrichment experiences be provided in accordance with institutional and programmatic policies on attendance and applied equitably to all students within the established policies for eligibility to participate. The PREDOC RC recommended that an intent statement within Standard 2-3 be circulated to clarify the Commission's expectation related to the use of international supplemental/enrichment sites, which aligns with CODA's Policy on Reporting and Use of Sites Where Educational Activity Occurs.

The Commission discussed the recommendation of the PREDOC RC. One Commission member noted that the intent statement may not provide adequate guidance to programs and does not account for the concept of a competency-based curriculum. Another Commission member noted that there may be varied program lengths among the dental education programs accredited by CODA, which may allow for supplemental enrichment opportunities at international sites.



Concerns were noted by the PREDOC RC related to sites that may be used for educational experiences, for which CODA currently has no mechanism of oversight. The Commission was reminded that supplemental sites by CODA's definition are completely outside of the educational experience and are not monitored by the Commission. The Commission also noted that a program may determine the amount of time that a student may be permitted to be away from the program based on institutional and program policies (e.g. specific number of days away from campus for educational breaks, holiday, or approved absences); however, a rotation to an international location, even under these circumstances, cannot be completed as part of the program's goals, objectives or requirements.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs circulation of the proposed revision to Standard 2-3 of the Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs (**Appendix 9**) to the communities of interest for a period of six (6) months, with a hearing at the March 2019 American Dental Education Association (ADEA) annual meetings, with comments reviewed at the Commission's Summer 2019 meeting.

Informational Report on Predoctoral Dental Education Programs Annual Survey Curriculum Data: There was no discussion on this report.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

<u>Report of the Joint Advisory Committee on Dental Education Information</u>: There was no discussion on this report.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

<u>Report of the Standing Committee on International Accreditation</u>: There was no discussion on this report.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

<u>New Business: Consideration of "Should" Statements within Accreditation Standards:</u> The PREDOC RC reported to the Commission that some CODA site visitors use the intent statement as the requirement by which a program is evaluated, rather than the "must" statement which is the mandatory compliance requirement. It is the belief of the Review Committee that this variation in site visitor interpretation has the potential to create inconsistent reviews of educational programs, which CODA mitigates through training and calibration of site visitors. Similarly, among all disciplines under CODA's purview, there is an inconsistent definition of the word "should" as it is applied within the Accreditation Standards. The PREDOC RC believed that the definition of "should" could be revised within the Predoctoral Standards to state "Should: Indicates a method to achieve the standards, but not mandatory;" however, the PREDOC RC recommended that CODA consider this topic for all disciplines, through the Standards.



<u>Commission Action</u>: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs the Standing Committee on Documentation and Policy Review to consider the term "Should" within the Definition of Terms used by the Commission in all Accreditation Standards to ensure consistent application and interpretation of the Commission's expectation, with a report for review by the Commission in Summer 2019.

<u>New Business: Consideration of Proposed Revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Dental</u> <u>Therapy Education Programs:</u> The PREDOC RC reported that the dental and dental therapy standards include similar language and requirements related to some components of educational training. As such, the PREDOC RC recommended that CODA adopt proposed revisions to the Definition of Terms and intent statement of Standards 2-14, 2-15, 2-19 and 2-21 of the Accreditation Standards for Dental Therapy Education Programs. The PREDOC RC did not believe that circulation to the community of interest was warranted and therefore recommended that the Commission immediately adopt the proposed revisions.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: The Commission on Dental Accreditation adopts the proposed revisions to the Definition of Terms and the intent statements of Standards 2-14, 2-15, 2-19 and 2-21 of the Accreditation Standards for Dental Therapy Education Programs, found in **Appendix 9**, with immediate implementation.

**<u>Report of the Review Committee on Dental Assisting Education (DA RC)</u>: <u>Committee</u> <u>Chair</u>: Ms. Deanna Stentiford. <u>Committee Members</u>: Ms. Teresa Bailey, Ms. Julie Bera, Ms. Margaret Bowman-Pensel, Dr. James Day, Dr. Loren Feldner, Ms. Carol Johnson, Ms. Nichole Magnuson and Ms. Carol Little. Ms. Martha McCaslin was unable to participate in the meeting. <u>Guests (Open Session Only)</u>: Ms. Cindy Durley, executive director, Dental Assisting National Board and Ms. Sidonia Peto, education director, American Dental Assistants Association, attended the policy portion of the meeting. <u>Staff Members</u>: Ms. Michelle Smith, manager, Allied Dental Education, Ms. Doreen Johnson, manager, Allied Dental Education, Dr. Sherin Tooks, director, and Ms. Cathryn Albrecht, senior associate general counsel, CODA, attended a portion of the meeting.** 

The meeting of the Review Committee on Dental Assisting Education (DA RC) was held on January 10-11, 2019 at the ADA Headquarters, Chicago, Illinois. The DA RC report is found in **Appendix 10.** 

<u>Report on Dental Assisting Programs Annual Survey Curriculum Section:</u> The Commission considered the DA RC's recommendation that the curriculum section of the annual accreditation survey, which will be disseminated in Fall 2019, be retained as written.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: The Commission directs the Annual Survey Curriculum Section for dental assisting education programs (**Appendix 11**) be implemented in its current format in the Fall 2019 Annual Survey.



**<u>Report of the Review Committee on Dental Hygiene Education (DH RC)</u>: <u>Committee Chair</u>: Dr. Susan Callahan Barnard. <u>Committee Members</u>: Ms. Laura Baus, Ms. Lynne Brodeur, Dr. Sebastian Ciancio, Ms. Tami Grzesikowski, Ms. Betty Kabel, Dr. Susan Kass, Ms. Barbara Krieg, Dr. Sally Mauriello and Dr. Sheila Vandenbush. Dr. Ronald Kosinski attended via telephone conference call. <u>Guests (Open Session Only)</u>: Ms. Ann Lynch, director, Advocacy and Education, American Dental Hygienists' Association (ADHA) and Ms. Rebecca Stolberg, senior director, Allied Dental Education and Faculty Development, American Dental Education Association (ADEA), attended the policy portion of the meeting. <u>Staff Members</u>: Ms. Doreen Johnson, manager, Allied Dental Education, Ms. Michelle Smith, manager, Allied Dental Education, CODA. Dr. Sherin Tooks, director, CODA, attended a portion of the meeting.** 

The meeting of the Review Committee on Dental Hygiene Education (DH RC) was held on January 8-9, 2019 at the ADA Headquarters, Chicago, Illinois. The DH RC report is found in **Appendix 12.** 

<u>Report on Dental Hygiene Programs Annual Survey Curriculum Section:</u> The Commission considered the DH RC's recommendation that the curriculum section of the annual accreditation survey, which will be disseminated in Fall 2019, be retained as written.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: The Commission directs the Annual Survey Curriculum Section for dental hygiene education programs (**Appendix 13**) be implemented in its current format in the Fall 2019 Annual Survey.

<u>Informational Report on the Conduct of a Validity and Reliability Study for the Accreditation</u> <u>Standards for Dental Hygiene Education Programs</u>: The validity and reliability study for dental hygiene education programs will be initiated in the spring of 2019. Survey results will be considered at the Summer 2019 meeting of the Review Committee on Dental Hygiene Education Programs and the Commission on Dental Accreditation.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

**Report of the Review Committee on Dental Laboratory Technology Education (DLT RC):** <u>Committee Chair</u>: Mr. Charles McClemens. <u>Committee Members</u>: Ms. Arax Cohen, Dr. Stan Frohlinger, Mr. Gary Gann and Dr. Alice Mehlhorn. Ms. Renata Budny substituted as needed for discipline-specific program review. <u>Guests (Open Session Only)</u>: Ms. Rebecca Stolberg, senior director, Allied Dental Education and Faculty Development, American Dental Education Association attended the policy portion of the meeting. <u>Staff Members</u>: Ms. Michelle Smith, manager, Allied Dental Education and Ms. Doreen Johnson, manager, Allied Dental Education, CODA.

The meeting of the Review Committee on Dental Laboratory Technology Education (DLT RC) was held on January 7, 2019 via telephone conference call. The DLT RC report is found in **Appendix 14.** 



<u>Report on Dental Laboratory Technology Programs Annual Survey Curriculum Section</u>: The Commission considered the DLT RC's recommendation that the curriculum section of the annual accreditation survey, which will be disseminated in Fall 2019, be retained as written.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: The Commission directs the Annual Survey Curriculum Section for dental laboratory technology education programs (**Appendix 15**) be implemented in its current format in the Fall 2019 Annual Survey.

<u>Informational Report on the Conduct of a Validity and Reliability Study for the Accreditation</u> <u>Standards for Dental Laboratory Technology</u>: The validity and reliability study for dental laboratory technology will be initiated in the spring of 2019. Survey results will be considered at the Summer 2019 meeting of the Review Committee on Dental Laboratory Technology Education and the Commission on Dental Accreditation.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

**Report of the Review Committee on Endodontics Education (ENDO RC):** Committee Chair: Dr. Bradford Johnson. Committee Members: Dr. James Johnson, Dr. William Johnson, Dr. Ankur Patel, and Dr. Roberta Pileggi. Ms. Diane Neefe was unable to participate. <u>Guests (Open Session Only)</u>: No guests attended the policy portion of the meeting. <u>Staff Members</u>: Ms. Jennifer Snow, manager, Advanced Dental Education and Mr. Christopher Castaneda, senior project assistant, Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA).

The meeting of the Review Committee on Endodontics Education (ENDO RC) was held on January 7, 2019 via telephone conference call. The ENDO RC report is found in **Appendix 16.** 

Informational Report on Endodontics Programs Annual Survey Curriculum Data: There was no discussion on this report.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

<u>Consideration of Proposed Revisions to Standard 4-8e of the Accreditation Standards for</u> <u>Advanced Dental Education Programs in Endodontics</u>: The Commission considered the proposed revision to Endodontics Standard 4-8e and the comments received during the one (1) year period of circulation to the communities of interest.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: The Commission on Dental Accreditation adopts the proposed revisions to Standard 4-8e of the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Endodontics found in **Appendix 16**, with an implementation date of July 1, 2019.



<u>Standard Informational Report on the Conduct of a Validity and Reliability Study for the</u> <u>Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Endodontics</u>: The validity and reliability study for endodontics programs will be initiated in the spring of 2019. Survey results will be considered at the Summer 2019 meeting of the Review Committee on Endodontics Education and the Commission on Dental Accreditation.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

**<u>Report of the Review Committee on Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Education:</u> Committee Chair: Dr. William Nelson. Committee Members: Dr. George Kushner, Dr. Gregory Ness, Dr. Philip Rinaudo, Dr. Martin Steed, and Ms. Cindy Stergar. Guests (Open Session Only): Ms. Mary Allaire-Schnitzer, associate executive director, American Association of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgeons (AAOMS); Dr. Thomas Indresano, president, AAOMS; Ms. Erin Killeen, executive vice president, American Board of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery (ABOMS); Dr. Victor Nannini, president-elect, AAOMS; Ms. Laurie Oddo, manager, Advanced Education and Resident Affairs, AAOMS; and Dr. B.D. Tiner, vice president, AAOMS attended the policy portion of the meeting. Staff Members: Ms. Jennifer Snow, manager, Advanced Dental Education (CODA). Dr. Sherin Tooks, director and Ms. Cathryn Albrecht, senior associate general counsel, CODA attended a portion of the meeting.** 

The meeting of the Review Committee on Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Education (OMS RC) was held on January 8, 2019 at the ADA Headquarters, Chicago, Illinois. The OMS RC report is found in **Appendix 17**.

<u>Report on Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Programs (Residency and Fellowship) Annual Survey</u> <u>Curriculum Sections</u>: The Commission considered the OMS RC's proposed revisions to the curriculum section of the residency annual survey, which will be disseminated in Fall 2019. The Commission also considered the OMS RC's recommendation that the curriculum section of the annual accreditation survey for fellowship programs, which will be disseminated in Fall 2019, be retained as written.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: The Commission on Dental Accreditation adopts the proposed revisions to the Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Annual Survey Curriculum Section for residency programs noted in **Appendix 17** and directs implementation of the revised Annual Survey Curriculum Section in Fall 2019.

The Commission on Dental Accreditation further directs the Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Annual Survey Curriculum Section for fellowship programs (**Appendix 18**) be retained with no changes for use in Fall 2019.



<u>Consideration of Proposed Revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental</u> <u>Education Programs in Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery</u>: The Commission considered the proposed revisions to the oral and maxillofacial surgery standards as well as comments that were received during the one (1) year period of circulation to the communities of interest.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: The Commission on Dental Accreditation adopts the proposed revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, found in **Appendix 17**, with an implementation date of July 1, 2020.

<u>Informational Report on the Conduct of Validity and Reliability Studies for the Accreditation</u> <u>Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery and</u> <u>Clinical Fellowship Training Programs in Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery</u>: The validity and reliability studies for oral and maxillofacial surgery (residency and fellowship) programs will be initiated in the summer/fall of 2019. Survey results would be considered at the Winter 2020 meetings of the Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Review Committee and the Commission on Dental Accreditation.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

## Report of the Review Committee on Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics (ORTHO

**RC):** <u>Committee Chair</u>: Dr. H. Garland Hershey. <u>Committee Members</u>: Dr. G. Frans Currier, Mr. David Cushing, Dr. Patrick Foley, Dr. James Hartsfield, and Dr. Wendy Woodall. <u>Guests</u> (<u>Open Session Only</u>): No guests attended the policy portion of the meeting. <u>Staff Members</u>: Ms. Jennifer Snow, manager, Advanced Dental Education and Mr. Christopher Castaneda, senior project assistant, Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA). Dr. Sherin Tooks, director and Ms. Cathryn Albrecht, senior associate general counsel, CODA attended a portion of the meeting.

The meeting of the Review Committee on Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Education (ORTHO RC) was held on January 11, 2019 at the ADA Headquarters, Chicago, Illinois. The ORTHO RC report is found in **Appendix 19**.

# Informational Report on Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Programs (Residency and Fellowship) Annual Survey Curriculum Data: There was no discussion on this report.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

<u>Consideration of Proposed Revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental</u> <u>Education Programs in Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics</u>: The Commission considered the ORTHO RC's report on proposed revisions to the orthodontics standards, noting that the RC recommended circulation of the revisions for a period of one (1) year to obtain comments from the communities of interest.



**<u>Commission Action</u>:** The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs circulation of the proposed revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics (**Appendix 19**), to the communities of interest for review and comment for a period of one (1) year, with Hearings conducted at the March 2019 American Dental Education Association and September 2019 American Dental Association annual meetings, with comments reviewed at the Commission's Winter 2020 meetings.

Informational Report on the Conduct of Validity and Reliability Studies for the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics and Clinical Fellowship Training Programs in Craniofacial and Special Care Orthodontics: The validity and reliability studies for orthodontics and dentofacial orthopedics (residency and fellowship) programs will be initiated in the summer/fall of 2019. Survey results would be considered at the Winter 2020 meetings of the Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Review Committee and the Commission on Dental Accreditation.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

**Report of the Review Committee on Periodontics Education (PERIO RC):** Committee Chair: Dr. James Katancik. Committee Members: Dr. Linda Hatzenbuehler, Dr. Georgia Johnson, and Dr. Jaqueline Sobota. Drs. Bryan Pearson and Charles Powell were unable to participate. <u>Guests (Open Session Only)</u>: Dr. Nico Geurs, education consultant, American Academy of Periodontology (AAP); Ms. Eileen Loranger, associate executive director, AAP; Ms. Jodi Sassana, manager, Governance and Education, AAP; and Dr. Jeffrey Rossmann, executive director, American Board of Periodontology (ABP) attended the policy portion of the meeting. <u>Staff Members</u>: Ms. Jennifer Snow, manager, Advanced Dental Education and Mr. Christopher Castaneda, senior project assistant, Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA).

The meeting of the Review Committee on Periodontics Education (PERIO RC) was held on January 10, 2019 via telephone conference call. The PERIO RC report is found in **Appendix 20**.

Informational Report on Periodontics Programs Annual Survey Curriculum Data: There was no discussion on this report.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

<u>Consideration of Proposed Revision to Standard 4-12e of the Accreditation Standards for</u> <u>Advanced Dental Education Programs in Periodontics:</u> The Commission considered the PERIO RC's proposed revision to Standard 4-12e of the Accreditation Standards, which would require programs to provide instruction in the management of patients with disabilities to a level of understanding. The Commission noted that the PERIO RC recommended circulation of the proposed revision for a period of one (1) year, with consideration of comments received in Winter 2020.



**<u>Commission Action</u>:** The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs circulation of the proposed revision to Standard 4-12e of the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Periodontics, **Appendix 20**, to the communities of interest for review and comment for a period of one (1) year, with Hearings conducted at the March 2019 American Dental Education Association and September 2019 American Dental Association annual meetings, with comments reviewed at the Commission's Winter 2020 meetings.

<u>Informational Report on the Conduct of a Validity and Reliability Study for the Accreditation</u> <u>Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Periodontics</u>: The validity and reliability study for periodontics programs will be initiated in the summer/fall of 2019. Survey results would be considered at the Winter 2020 meetings of the Periodontics Review Committee and the Commission on Dental Accreditation.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

# <u>Miscellaneous Affairs- Consideration of Matters Relating to More than One Review</u> <u>Committee</u>

**Informational Report of Review Committee and Commission Meeting Dates:** The Commission reviewed the meeting dates of the 2019, 2020 and 2021 meetings. The Chair reminded Commission members that they are expected to be available for CODA meetings as well as meetings of other committees on which they serve. Commissioners were also requested to emphasize with Review Committee members the importance of holding the committee meeting dates and participating in meetings, as part of their obligation once they accept an appointment on the Commission's Review Committees.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

**Reminder of Professional Conduct Policy and Prohibition Against Harassment:** The Commission was reminded of the Policy on Professional Conduct and Prohibition Against Harassment.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

<u>Consideration of Resolutions Adopted by the ADA House of Delegates and the ADA Board</u> <u>of Trustees Related to the Commission on Dental Accreditation and Dental Education</u>: The Commission reviewed the resolutions adopted by the ADA House of Delegates and ADA Board of Trustees. The Commission noted that through the work of the ADA-CODA Relationship Workgroup, and the actions of the ADA Board and House, conflict of interest safeguards were strengthened through granting CODA greater governance authority including, for example: authority to revise its own Rules, authority to develop and distribute its own annual report to its



communities of interest, and authority to remove its members for cause, should the need ever arise.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

### Miscellaneous Affairs-Matters for the Commission as a Whole

**Report of the Standing Committee on Finance:** The report of the Standing Committee on Finance can be found in **Appendix 21.** Below are actions taken by the Commission related to the Report of the Standing Committee on Finance.

<u>Review of Shared Services (Indirect Expenses)</u>: The Commission noted that in October 2018, the Commission and ADA entered into an Intercompany Memorandum of Understanding and Services Agreement, which sets forth the understanding between the two (2) agencies regarding their working relationship and certain services performed by the ADA as requested by the Commission. The Services Agreement is extended for a period of two (2) calendar years. The Finance Committee believed that monitoring of the agreement should occur at each of its meetings, in conjunction with the Winter and Summer Commission meetings. The Finance Committee recommended, and the Commission concurred, that its Charge should be updated to reflect the Committee's oversight of the Services Agreement on behalf of the Commission. The Finance Committee's Charge will be revised as follows (underline indicates an addition):

Monitor, review and make recommendations to the Commission concerning the annual budget, and provide administrative oversight of the research and development fund, and review and make recommendations regarding the Intercompany Memorandum of Understanding and Services Agreement.

<u>**Commission Action:**</u> The Commission on Dental Accreditation adopts the proposed revision to the charge of the Standing Committee on Finance, with immediate implementation.

The Commission on Dental Accreditation further directs that the charge of the Standing Committee on Finance be updated in the Commission's Evaluation and Operational Policies and Procedures, effective immediately.

<u>Timeline (Long-Term Plan) to Assume Total Expenses</u>: The Commission noted that in Summer 2018, CODA directed a formal communication to the ADA Board of Trustees requesting an update on Resolution B-92:2017, requesting that the ADA develop a mechanism to allow the Commission to establish and access a separate reserve fund to retain its annual revenue after total (direct and indirect) expenses are paid. The Finance Committee reported that it considered the ADA Board of Trustee's August 29, 2018 letter to CODA in response to CODA's request for an update on B-92:2017, noting that while a mechanism to establish a CODA Reserve Fund could be developed, the ADA would first need to resolve several financial implications. The ADA Board also believed that it would be prudent to establish indirect costs with some level of



accuracy for the Commission through the Shared Services Agreement before CODA would be allowed to retain any revenue beyond its expenses. The Commission noted that the Shared Services Agreement could be amended when the ADA Board of Trustees decides CODA is financially poised to establish a Reserve Fund. The ADA Board's letter further informed CODA that it may request funds from the ADA through the ADA long-term reserves (for projects spanning more than one year), the Capital Replacement Reserve Fund (for software, equipment or other depreciable assets), or the ADA annual operating budget (for smaller requests to cover unanticipated spending in a given year). CODA could secure these funds if adequate support and rationale for a request is submitted and approved by the ADA.

The Finance Committee recommended, and the Commission concurred, that continued dialogue with the ADA-CODA Relationship Workgroup pertaining to this matter is important, particularly so that the Commission can obtain clarification on the financial implications for the ADA that are noted within the letter received by CODA. As such, the Commission believed this matter should be brought to the attention of the ADA-CODA Relationship Workgroup in Spring 2019.

<u>Commission Action</u>: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs staff to inform the ADA-CODA Relationship Workgroup of the Commission's request for clarification of the ADA's response to CODA's request for a mechanism to establish a reserve fund, with further consideration at the Workgroup's Spring 2019 meeting and Commission's Summer 2019 meeting.

<u>Authority to Determine and Manage Annual Operating Budget</u>: The Finance Committee report indicated that CODA should develop its 2020 budget so that CODA is well-positioned to assume sole authority to set and manage its annual budget. The Finance Committee affirmed its recommendation that CODA continue monitoring this matter, and believed that the ADA-CODA Relationship Workgroup should discuss this topic to establish a timeline for the Commission to assume budget authority for its annual operational budget. The Commission concurred with the Finance Committee's recommendation, noting that the Commission's request to determine and manage its annual operating budget should be discussed by the ADA-CODA Workgroup in Spring 2019.

<u>Commission Action</u>: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs staff to inform the ADA-CODA Relationship Workgroup of the Commission's continued plan to obtain sole authority to set and manage its annual operating budget, including a discussion of a mutually agreeable timeline for the Commission to assume budget authority, with further consideration at the Workgroup's Spring 2019 meeting and Commission's Summer 2019 meeting.

<u>Annual Fees and Application Fees</u>: The Commission considered the Finance Committee's recommendations related to annual and application fees. The Commission noted that the proposed 4% increase in annual fees would ensure the Commission can continue to assume all expenses (direct and indirect) in 2020.



**<u>Commission Action</u>**: The Commission on Dental Accreditation:

- Adopts a 4% increase in annual fees for all disciplines in 2020; \$8,210 for predoctoral dental education programs, \$2,050 for dental assisting, dental hygiene, dental therapy, and advanced dental education programs, and \$1,460 for dental laboratory technology programs.
- Affirms that during the year a program is due for a regular accreditation site visit, the annual fee will be doubled.
- Maintains the application fees of \$67,400 for predoctoral dental education programs and \$16,850 for allied and advanced education programs.

<u>International Fees (For CODA Accreditation Process)</u>: The Commission considered the recommendations related to international fees, as noted within the Finance Committee's report.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: The Commission on Dental Accreditation:

- Increases the international predoctoral dental education application fee by 5% to \$76,660 in 2020.
- Increases the 2020 international predoctoral dental education annual accreditation fee by 10% to \$19,283.
- Affirms that in 2020 international predoctoral dental education programs pay all site visit expenses (actual expenses) for all site visits during the application and regular site visit schedule.
- Affirms that in 2020 international predoctoral dental education programs pay an administrative fee of 25% of the total site visit cost for coordination of each site visit.
- Maintains the International Consulting Fee (outside of PACV process) of \$5,000.
- Affirms that all international fees must be paid in U.S. Dollars.

<u>Other Accreditation Fees</u>: The Commission considered the Finance Committee's recommendations related to other accreditation fees, including the R & D Fund administrative fee, special focused site visit administrative fee, the HIPAA policy violation fee, the electronic conversion of paper documents fee, and the email/contact distribution fee.

<u>**Commission Action:**</u> The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs that in the budget year 2020, the Commission:

- Increases the Special Focused Site Visit Administrative Fee to \$5,000.
- Maintains the CODA Administrative Fee Regarding the Policy on HIPAA of \$4,000 per program per submission.
- Discontinues the Electronic Conversion of Paper Documents Fee, noting that all program submissions must be provided electronically.
- Maintains the Email/Contact Distribution List Fee of a \$200 minimum.
- Maintains the Research and Development Fund administrative fee of \$35.



<u>International Fees (For International Consultation and Accreditation PACV Process)</u>: The Commission noted the Finance Committee's recommendation to retain current international consultation fees.

<u>Commission Action</u>: The Commission on Dental Accreditation maintains the current PACV International Consultation and Accreditation Fees (**Appendix 21**).

<u>Commission Policies Related to Fees</u>: The Commission considered the Finance Committee's recommended proposed revision to policies on fees. A motion was made, and adopted, to change the Commission's terminology related to its privacy and data security (HIPAA) fee from a "penalty fee" to an "administrative processing fee," effective immediately.

<u>Commission Action</u>: The Commission on Dental Accreditation adopts, with immediate implementation, the proposed revision to policies on fees, as noted in **Appendix 21**, with further modification to the terminology used for the CODA Privacy and Data Security Administrative Processing Fee, as noted in **Appendix 22**.

**Report of the Standing Committee on Quality Assurance and Strategic Planning (QASP):** The report of the Standing Committee on Quality Assurance and Strategic Planning can be found in **Appendix 23.** Below are actions taken by the Commission related to the Report of the Standing Committee on Quality Assurance and Strategic Planning.

<u>Consideration of 2017-2021 CODA Strategic Plan Tracking Sheet and Operational Effectiveness</u> <u>Tracking Sheet</u>: There was no discussion on this report.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: This report is informational in nature and no action is required.

<u>Development of Annual Web-Based Mandatory Site Visitor Training</u>: There was no discussion on this report.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: This report is informational in nature and no action is required.

ADA-CODA Relationship Workgroup, Actions of ADA Board and House Related to CODA Governance, and CODA Request for Mechanism to Establish a Reserve Fund: The Commission again noted the progress made related to governance as a result of the resolutions adopted by the 2018 ADA Board of Trustees and ADA House of Delegates. The QASP recommended that CODA continue to monitor its request for a mechanism to establish a reserve fund for CODA (B-92:2017) and CODA's long-term goal to assume sole authority to set and manage CODA's annual budget (Strategic Plan Goal 2, Objective 2). The QASP believed, and the Commission concurred, that it is a "best practice" and integral for the Commission to have a reserve fund in the future so that it can conduct its business and engage in strategic planning initiatives, including such things as CODA's needs for facility and technology improvements. The Commission's revenue is generated through fees to programs and should be retained by the Commission once annual expenses are paid. Although the CODA and ADA very recently



engaged in a Services Agreement, CODA has covered its direct and indirect expenses since 2015, based on a formula consistent with the current Services Agreement. The ADA's letter provided no timeline for re-consideration of its decision beyond noting that the shared services agreement will serve as a baseline for CODA's operation as an agency within the ADA. As such, QASP recommended, and the Commission concurred, that CODA should continue to monitor this matter and encourage further discussion of this topic through the 2019 ADA-CODA Relationship Workgroup.

<u>Commission Action</u>: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs staff to forward CODA's perspective related to Resolution B-92:2017 (Reserve Fund Request) to the 2019 ADA-CODA Relationship Workgroup for further discussion, with further consideration by the Standing Committee on Quality Assurance and Strategic Planning and the Commission in Summer 2019.

Discussion of Trends in Dental Education, Practice, Research and Higher Education (Strategic Plan Goal 1 and Goal 3 Objective 3) Pertaining to the Use of International Educational Activity Sites of U.S.-Based CODA-Accredited Dental Education Programs: There was no discussion on this report.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: This report is informational in nature and no action is required.

**Report of the Standing Committee on Documentation and Policy Review:** The report of the Standing Committee on Documentation and Policy Review can be found in **Appendix 24**. Below are actions taken by the Commission related to the Report of the Standing Committee on Documentation and Policy Review.

Consideration of Definition of "Distance Education" in CODA Policy on Distance Education: In Summer 2018, and following review of a recommendation submitted by the Dental Assisting Review Committee, which indicated there is confusion among allied disciplines related to the definition of distance education, the Commission directed that the Standing Committee on Documentation and Policy consider this topic. The Standing Committee noted the USDE's distance education definition found in the regulations for recognition of accreditation agencies is currently being considered for revision in accordance with reauthorization of the Higher Education Act. The Standing Committee believes the USDE's expectation is that the use of some technology, such as document repository technology, is not in itself distance education. However, should the same technology be used to conduct online discussions, testing and grading in which a student's efforts in the course are assessed, then the educational platform becomes distance education. Further, some programs may use hybrid educational methods within a single course. In light of the fact that CODA's scope of recognition with the USDE includes programs offered via distance education, the Standing Committee recommended no change at this time and continued monitoring of the USDE regulations related to distance education for consideration at a future meeting. While a motion was made to retain the distance education policy as written, CODA elected to receive this request as an informational action and affirmed that there will be no change to the policy at this time.



<u>Commission Action</u>: The Commission on Dental Accreditation directs monitoring the proposed revisions to the USDE regulations related to its Distance Education definition and criteria for recognized accrediting agencies, and consider the impact of changes at a future Commission meeting, with a report through the Standing Committee on Documentation and Policy Review.

#### Consideration of Criteria for Accreditation of Programs in Areas of Advanced Dental

*Education:* At its Summer 2018 meeting, through new business, the Commission discussed the process by which an individual or organization may request that CODA establish an accreditation process for an educational area in dentistry. The Commission directed that the Documentation and Policy Committee review the criteria for accrediting areas of advanced dental education with a report to be considered by the Commission in Summer 2019. In review of the Criteria, the Standing Committee noted considerable redundancy in the required elements. Following lengthy discussion, the Standing Committee believed further study of the criteria and process is warranted to ensure criteria are clear, redundancy is eliminated, and that the process for establishing an accreditation process in areas of advanced dental education is clearly described and user friendly. A draft revision will be available to the Commission in Summer 2019.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: This report is informational in nature and no action is required.

<u>Consideration of Proposed Revisions to Other Policies</u>: The Commission considered several proposed policy revisions that were submitted by the Standing Committee.

Within its report to CODA, the Standing Committee noted, in particular, a discussion related to site visitor training as a result of a request from the American Association of Orthodontists (AAO) related to the Policy on Site Visitor Training. The Standing Committee believed the additional costs for training site visit observation, and the amount of time and effort required to arrange this observation, as well as additional costs to the educational program in providing a self-study and other accommodations, do not warrant the addition of this component to CODA's site visitor process and policy.

The Standing Committee also discussed the Policy on Application for Initial Accreditation for Developing Programs, specifically the timing of the review of the findings of the pre-graduation site visit. The Standing Committee noted that scheduling site visits prior to May 1 or November 1 has been widely accepted and that only recently has an assigned site visit date been questioned. Following discussion, the Standing Committee concluded that changing the language with specific dates could be more confusing to educational programs. Therefore, the Standing Committee recommended that the policy language be retained and that staff continue the practice in scheduling the visits to allow for consideration of the report at the next closest CODA meeting date associated with the program's graduation date.



<u>Commission Action</u>: The Commission on Dental Accreditation adopts and implements immediately the proposed revisions to policies found in **Appendix 24**.

The Commission on Dental Accreditation further directs that the policies in **Appendix 24** be updated in the Commission's Evaluation and Operational Policies and Procedures and in all appropriate Commission documents.

**Report of the Standing Committee on International Accreditation:** The Commission reviewed the Standing Committee on International Accreditation report (**Appendix 25**), without comment.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: This report is informational in nature and no action is required.

**<u>Report of the Standing Committee on Nomination:</u>** The report of the Standing Committee on Nomination can be found in **Appendix 26.** Below are actions taken by the Commission related to the Report of the Standing Committee on Nomination.

<u>**Commission Action**</u>: The Commission on Dental Accreditation appoints the following individual, nominated by the sponsoring organization, to the relevant review committee to fill a discipline-specific vacancy:

Oral Medicine Educator (one (1) vacancy) for the Review Committee on Advanced Education in General Dentistry, General Practice Residency, Dental Anesthesiology, Oral Medicine and Orofacial Pain Education (AGDOO RC), nominated by the American Academy of Oral Medicine

• Dr. Michael Brennan Alternate: Dr. Michael Siegel

### **Update on United States Department of Education (USDE)/Update on Higher Education:**

The Commission noted that the Higher Education Act (HEA) continues to be reviewed, with an anticipated revision expected in late 2019. The United States Department of Education (USDE) criteria for recognition of accrediting agencies will be revised in accordance with the HEA, and CODA will be expected to comply with the new regulations in order to maintain its recognition with the USDE. The Commission learned about the negotiated rulemaking sessions that are scheduled for spring 2019. The Commission noted that there may be revisions to the USDE Criteria for Recognition related to "Separate and Independent" which could affect CODA's organizational structure as an agency of the American Dental Association (ADA).

The Commission believes that its current conflict of interest policies and procedures mitigate concerns related to the separate and independent clause. Further, the Commission and ADA have made numerous changes related to governance, to further reduce any perceptions of undue influence from the ADA. The Commission also noted the significant impact that a change in the "separate and independent" requirement would have on the Commission, including but not limited to: staff (employment, pension, salary and insurance); accrediting agency insurance



(agency and director and officer insurance); access to shared services (e.g. accounting, legal, human resources, information technology, conference services); CODA's facility; access to startup costs to transition CODA to an independent agency since there is no reserve fund available to CODA at this time; and a potential increase in cost to programs as a result of the necessary changes for CODA to become separate and independent. Following discussion, the Commission believed that CODA staff should share CODA's perspective with the Association of Specialized and Professional Accreditors (ASPA) as this agency requested information on this topic from its member organizations, including CODA.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: The Commission directs CODA staff to reply to the Association of Specialized and Professional Accreditors (ASPA) call for information and to share CODA's perspective and concerns related to potential universal application of the Separate and Independent clause within the USDE Criteria for Recognition of Accrediting Agencies.

**Survey of Meeting:** Commissioners were reminded to complete the electronic post-meeting survey following the meeting. The survey is important for determining whether the Commission is achieving its goals for the year.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: This report is informational in nature and no action is required.

<u>Consideration of Chair Vacancy</u>: As a result of an immediate vacancy in the office of the Chair of the Commission, the Commission conducted a special election of its leadership to complete terms ending in Fall 2019. As the Commission elected the current vice-chair, Dr. Arthur Chen-She Jee as chair, the Commission conducted an election for the vice-chair position and elected Dr. Jeffery Hicks as vice-chair. The Commission further noted that its annual elections will take place at the Summer 2019 meeting.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: The Commission elects Dr. Arthur Chen-Shu Jee Chair of the Commission on Dental Accreditation, with a term ending in Fall 2019.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: The Commission elects Dr. Jeffery Hicks Vice-Chair of the Commission on Dental Accreditation, with a term ending in Fall 2019.

New Business: There was no new business discussed at the meeting.

**<u>Commission Action</u>**: This report is informational in nature and no action is required.

Adjourn: The Commission adjourned the open session at 9:40AM