REPORT OF THE REVIEW COMMITTEE ON PERIODONTICS EDUCATION TO THE COMMISSION ON DENTAL ACCREDITATION

Committee Chair: Dr. James Katancik. Committee Members: Dr. Linda Hatzenbuehler, Dr. Georgia Johnson, Dr. Paul Luepke, Dr. Charles Powell, and Dr. Jaqueline Sobota. Guests (Open Session Only): Dr. Nico Geurs, education consultant, American Academy of Periodontology (AAP); Ms. Eileen Loranger, associate executive director, Governance, Advocacy and Education, AAP; Ms. Jodi Sassana, manager of governance and education, AAP; and Ms. Tameisha Williams, project specialist, Governance, Advocacy and Education, AAP attended the policy portion of the meeting. Staff Members: Ms. Jennifer Snow, manager, Advanced Dental Education and Mr. Christopher Castaneda, senior project assistant, Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA). The meeting of the Review Committee on Periodontics Education (PERIO RC) was held on January 9, 2020 via telephone conference call.

CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS RELATED TO PERIODONTICS EDUCATION

Report on Periodontics Programs Annual Survey Curriculum Section (p. 1300): The Review Committee on Periodontics Education (PERIO RC) noted that the Annual Survey Curriculum Section is reviewed during the Winter Review Committee meeting in the year the survey will be distributed; which will next occur in 2020. The PERIO RC considered its discipline-specific Annual Survey Curriculum Section (Appendix 1, Policy Report p. 1300).

Following discussion at its Winter 2020 meeting, the PERIO RC noted items in the Curriculum Section that necessitated updating to be consistent with current terminology and the Accreditation Standards. The Committee determined that Question 25 regarding Advanced Cardiac Life Support (ACLS) should be removed. A new question regarding implants was added as the PERIO RC believed this is an important data element, noting that it is included in the Site Visitor Evaluation Report.

In summary, the PERIO RC recommended that the Periodontics Annual Survey Curriculum Section be revised to include the changes noted in Appendix 1 for use in Fall 2020.

Recommendation: It is recommended that the Commission on Dental Accreditation adopt the proposed revisions to the Periodontics Annual Survey Curriculum Section for periodontics programs noted in Appendix 1 and direct implementation of the revised Annual Survey Curriculum Section in Fall 2020.

According to the Commission’s Policy on Assessing the Validity and Reliability of the Accreditation Standards, “the validity and reliability of accreditation standards will be assessed after they have been in effect for a period of time equal to the minimum academic length of the accredited program plus three years.” Thus, the validity and reliability of the standards for a three-year program will be assessed after six (6) years. In accordance with this policy, the Validity and Reliability Study for Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Periodontics was initiated in Summer/Fall 2019 with the results to be reviewed at the Winter 2020 meeting of the Commission. At the February 2, 2018 meeting of the Commission, revised Standards were adopted for implementation July 1, 2019. Therefore, the survey instrument used for this Study was developed using the July 1, 2019 Standards in order to provide the communities of interest with an opportunity to comment on all standards adopted by the Commission.

At this meeting, the Periodontics Review Committee (PERIO RC) reviewed the results of the survey, as well as written comments gathered (Appendix 2, Policy Report p. 1301). It was noted that a total of 2,467 individuals were invited by email to complete the online survey on October 7, 2019. In order to increase the response rate, follow-up mailings were administered to all non-respondents on October 17 and 29, 2019. Data collection ended on November 5, 2019, yielding 252 respondents, for an overall adjusted response rate of 10.5% (excluding those whose email addresses were invalid).

The PERIO RC conducted an initial review of the report, noting the Standards identified by the communities of interest as “too demanding” and “not demanding.” The Review Committee noted the disappointing response rate and high abandonment rate, believing that it is too long of a survey. The PERIO RC noted that the Commission may wish to consider whether there is a more efficient way to summarize standards within the Survey that won’t be overwhelming to respondents.

Following review of the report, the PERIO RC concluded that, because of the amount of data provided in the report, and to ensure a thorough review of data and the comments received, further study of the survey data is warranted. Further, the PERIO RC believed the six (6) members of the PERIO RC should further study the report and identify Accreditation Standards, if any, which warrant revision. The Committee believed assignment of one (1) of each of the six (6) Standards sections to each of the six (6) Review Committee members would provide an effective method to review the Standards. In particular, the Committee believed that standards related to program director time commitment could warrant discussion.

The PERIO RC noted that the committee would conduct meetings by tele-/web-conference; therefore, there would be no financial impact to the Commission. A report would be submitted for consideration at the Summer 2020 meeting of the PERIO RC and Commission.

**Recommendation:** It is recommended that the six (6) members of the Periodontics Review Committee further study the findings of the Periodontics Validity and Reliability Study and identify Accreditation Standards, if any, which warrant revision with a report
for consideration by the Periodontics Review Committee and Commission in Summer 2020.

Consideration of Proposed Revision to Standard 4-12e of the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Periodontics (p. 1302): At its Summer 2018 meeting, the Review Committee on Periodontics Education considered the National Council on Disability (NCD) Issue Brief “Neglect for Too Long: Dental Care for People with Intellectual and Developmental Disabilities” and related communications. The PERIO RC concluded, and the Commission concurred, that the periodontics program director community should first discuss the potential addition of a requirement under either Periodontics Standard 4-9.2 with regard to clinical training to a level of competency in the treatment of patients with disabilities, or under Periodontics Standard 4-12e with regard to management of patients with disabilities to a level of understanding.

At its Winter 2019 meeting, the PERIO RC considered a proposed revision to Standard 4-12e of the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Periodontics, which would require programs to provide instruction in the management of patients with disabilities to a level of understanding. The PERIO RC concluded, and the Commission concurred, that the proposed revision to Standard 4-12e of the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Periodontics, found in Appendix 1, Policy Report p. 1302 be circulated to the communities of interest for review and comment for a period of one (1) year, including Hearings during the March 2019 American Dental Education Association (ADEA) and September 2019 American Dental Association (ADA) annual meetings, with comments reviewed at the PERIO RC and Commission meetings in Winter 2020.

At its Winter 2020 meeting, the Review Committee carefully considered two (2) written comments received during the comment period (Appendix 2, Policy Report p. 1302). The PERIO RC discussed the comments at length, including the comment submitted by the Special Care Dentistry Association (SCDA) requesting the Commission to consider the standardization of a definition for “Special Needs” across the various Accreditation Standards under the Commission’s purview instead of using different iterations of the definition of special needs.

The Committee noted that the advanced dental education standards currently include a common philosophical statement in the Preface that is similar to the language proposed by the SCDA within its written comment. The periodontics standards Preface states:

The profession has a duty to consider patients’ preferences, and their social, economic and emotional circumstances when providing care, as well as to attend to patients whose medical, physical and psychological or social situation make it necessary to modify normal dental routines in order to provide dental treatment. These individuals include, but are not limited to, people with developmental disabilities, cognitive impairments, complex medical problems, significant physical limitations, and the vulnerable elderly. The Standards reconfirm and emphasize the importance of educational processes and
goals for comprehensive patient care and encourage patient-centered approaches in teaching, research and oral health care delivery.

Following discussion, the PERIO RC determined that no further changes to the standards are warranted at this time related to the SCDA’s request. Therefore, the Committee concluded that the proposed revision to Standard 4-12e was appropriate as proposed in Appendix 2.

In summary, the PERIO RC recommended the proposed revision to Standard 4-12e of the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Periodontics noted in Appendix 2 be adopted by the Commission and implemented on January 1, 2021.

**Recommendation:** It is recommended that the Commission on Dental Accreditation adopt the proposed revision to Standard 4-12e of the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Periodontics found in Appendix 2, with an implementation date of January 1, 2021.

**Consideration of the Use of the Term “Should” Within the Accreditation Standards (p. 1303):** At its Summer 2019 meeting, the Commission directed the revision or addition, as applicable, of the definition of “Should,” as noted below, within the Definition of Terms used by the Commission in the Accreditation Standards for all disciplines within the Commission’s purview, with consideration of this change in Winter 2020, and application within a time frame to correlate with other revision activities.

At this meeting, the Review Committee on Periodontics Education (PERIO RC) discussed the review of the use of the term “Should” within the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Periodontics (Appendix 1, Policy Report p. 1303) and considered whether additional revisions to the Accreditation Standards are warranted as a result of the revised definition of “Should” within the Definition of Terms, as follows: 

*Should: Indicates a method to achieve the standard; highly desirable, but not mandatory.*

The PERIO RC concluded that, because of the amount of data provided in the validity and reliability report, and to ensure a thorough review of the instances of “Should,” it would be beneficial to combine this exercise with the validity and reliability study review. The PERIO RC noted that it would conduct meetings by tele-/web-conference; therefore, there would be no financial impact to the Commission. A report would be submitted for consideration at the Summer 2020 meeting of the PERIO RC and Commission. Per the Commission’s directive, the revised definition of “Should” will be incorporated into the standards resulting from the validity and reliability study.

**Recommendation:** This report is informational in nature and no action is required.
CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS RELATING TO MORE THAN ONE REVIEW COMMITTEE

Matters related to more than one review committee are included in a separate report.

CONSIDERATION OF SITE VISITOR APPOINTMENTS TO THE COMMISSION ON DENTAL ACCREDITATION IN THE AREA OF PERIODONTOICS EDUCATION

The Review Committee on Periodontics Education considered site visitor appointments for 2020-2021. The Committee’s recommendations on the appointments of individuals are included in a separate report.

CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS RELATED TO ACCREDITATION STATUS

Matters related to accreditation status of programs are included in a separate report.

Respectfully submitted,

Dr. James Katancik
Chair, Review Committee on Periodontics Education
Draft Annual Survey Curriculum Section for Periodontics Programs

Additions are Underlined
Strikethroughs indicate Deletions
Part II - Periodontics Curriculum Section

Part II of the survey is confidential. Any reports from this section will not identify individual programs by name.

21. Over the course of the entire program, how much time do students/residents devote to each of the following areas?

Column must add up to 100%. Do not enter percent signs.

a. Clinical (include related laboratory activity) : _______
b. Didactic (include assigned laboratory activity) : _______
c. Research : _______
d. Teaching : _______
e. Other, please specify : _______

Total : _______
22. How many **Provide the average number of** documented periodontal periodontitis patients were completed by each student/resident per case category according to year in the program during the 2017-18 academic year?

Please report the total per class year in each category, not the average per student/resident.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1st year students/residents</th>
<th>2nd year students/residents</th>
<th>3rd year students/residents</th>
<th>4th year students/residents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>a. Moderate periodontal disease periodontitis</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>b. Severe periodontal disease periodontitis</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

23. **Provide the average number of implants each student/resident placed according to the year of the program during the 2019-2020 academic year.**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Average number of implants per student/resident</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>a. 1st year</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>b. 2nd year</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>c. 3rd year</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>d. 4th year</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**243.** How many periodontal diagnostic and treatment planning conferences were conducted by the program during the 2017-18 academic year?

NOTE: The conferences included should be limited to the periodontics program and not interdisciplinary in nature.

__________________________________________________________
254. How many interdisciplinary diagnostic and treatment planning conferences were attended by the students/residents for each of the following during the 2017-18 academic year?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conferences attended</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Periodontics / Endodontics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Periodontics / Orthodontics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Periodontics / Prosthodontics</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Use this space to enter comments or clarifications for your answers on this page.

________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________

Page Break
Part II - Periodontics Curriculum Section (continued)

Part II of the survey is confidential. Any reports from this section will not identify individual programs by name.

25. How many students/residents are currently certified in advanced cardiac life support (ACLS)?

__________________________________________
26. Provide the average number of adult intravenous moderate parenteral sedation patients completed by the students/residents according to the year of the program for the 2017-18 academic year.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Average patients per student/resident</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. 1st year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. 2nd year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. 3rd year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. 4th year</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
27. How often does the program conduct formal documented evaluations of student/resident clinical performance?

- Weekly
- Monthly
- Quarterly
- Semiannually
- Annually

28. How often does the program conduct formal documented evaluations of faculty?

- Weekly
- Monthly
- Quarterly
- Semiannually
- Annually
29. How often does the program conduct faculty calibration at sites where educational activity occurs?

- Weekly
- Monthly
- Semiannually
- Annually
- Other, please specify _______________________________________________________________________

Use this space to enter comments or clarifications for your answers on this page.

_________________________________________________________________________________________
_________________________________________________________________________________________
_________________________________________________________________________________________
_________________________________________________________________________________________
_________________________________________________________________________________________

End of Block: PERIO Curriculum (Q21-29)
Commission on Dental Accreditation

At its Winter 2019 meeting, the Commission directed that the proposed revision to Standard 4-12e of the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Periodontics be distributed to the appropriate communities of interest for review and comment, with comment due December 1, 2019, for review at the Winter 2020 Commission meeting.

This document represents the proposed revisions based upon review of comment received from communities of interest from February 8, 2019 to December 1, 2019.

This document will be considered by the Commission in Winter 2020.

Additions are Underlined
Strikethroughs indicate Deletions

Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Periodontics
4-12 The educational program must provide instruction in the following interdisciplinary areas:

a. The management of orofacial pain to a level of understanding;

b. Orthodontic procedures in conjunction with periodontal therapy to a level of understanding;

c. Surgical exposure of teeth for orthodontic purposes, to a level of understanding; and

d. Management of endodontic-periodontal lesions to a level of understanding; treatment should be provided in consultation with the individuals who will assume the responsibility for the completion of the case or supervision of endodontics therapy; and

e. The management of patients with disabilities to a level of understanding.