REPORT OF THE REVIEW COMMITTEE ON ORTHODONTICS AND DENTOFACIAL ORTHOPEDICS EDUCATION TO THE COMMISSION ON DENTAL ACCREDITATION

Committee Chair: Dr. Eladio DeLeon. Committee Members: Mr. David Cushing, Dr. Patrick Foley, Dr. James Hartsfield, Dr. Steven Lindauer, and Dr. Wendy Woodall. Guest (Open Session Only): Dr. Steve Segal, board of trustees member, American Association of Orthodontists attended the policy portion of the meeting. Staff Members: Ms. Jennifer Snow, manager, Advanced Dental Education and Mr. Christopher Castaneda, senior project assistant, Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA). The meeting of the Review Committee on Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Education (ORTHO RC) was held on January 10, 2020 at the ADA Headquarters, Chicago, Illinois.

CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS RELATED TO ORTHODONTICS AND DENTOFACIAL ORTHOPEDICS EDUCATION

Report on the 2019 Validity and Reliability Studies of the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics and the Accreditation Standards for Clinical Fellowship Training Programs in Craniofacial and Special Care Orthodontics (p. 1100): The Accreditation Standards for Advanced Education Programs Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics (Appendix 1, Policy Report p. 1100) were adopted by the Commission on Dental Accreditation at its January 31, 2013 meeting for implementation January 1, 2014. The Accreditation Standards for Clinical Fellowship Training Programs in Craniofacial and Special Care Orthodontics were adopted and implemented by the Commission on Dental Accreditation at its August 7, 2015 meeting (Appendix 2, Policy Report p. 1100).

According to the Commission’s Policy on Assessing the Validity and Reliability of the Accreditation Standards, “the validity and reliability of accreditation standards will be assessed after they have been in effect for a period of time equal to the minimum academic length of the accredited program plus three years.” Thus, the validity and reliability of the standards for a two-year program will be assessed after five (5) years and the validity and reliability of the standards for a one-year program will be assessed after four (4) years. In accordance with this policy, the Validity and Reliability Studies of the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics and the Accreditation Standards for Clinical Fellowship Training Programs in Craniofacial and Special Care Orthodontics were initiated in Summer/Fall 2019 with the results to be reviewed at the Winter 2020 meeting of the Commission. At the August 1, 2019 meeting of the Commission, revised residency Standards were adopted for implementation January 1, 2020. Therefore, the survey instrument used for the residency Study was developed using the January 1, 2020 Standards in order to provide the communities of interest with an opportunity to comment on all standards adopted by the Commission.
At this meeting, the Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Review Committee (ORTHO RC) reviewed the results of the surveys, as well as written comments gathered (Appendix 3 and Appendix 4, Policy Report p. 1100). It was noted that a total of 2,534 individuals were invited by email to complete the online residency survey on October 7, 2019. In order to increase the response rate, follow-up mailings were administered to all non-respondents on October 17 and 29, 2019. Data collection ended on November 5, 2019, yielding 198 respondents, for an overall adjusted response rate of 8.1% (excluding those whose email addresses were invalid). It was also noted that a total of 259 individuals were invited by email to complete the online fellowship survey on October 7, 2019. In order to increase the response rate, follow-up mailings were administered to all non-respondents on October 17, 29, and November 5, 2019. Data collection ended on November 13, 2019, yielding 48 respondents, for an overall adjusted response rate of 19% (excluding those whose email addresses were invalid).

The ORTHO RC conducted an initial review of the reports, noting the Standards identified by the communities of interest as “too demanding” and “not demanding.” The Committee voiced its concern with the abandonment rate and the low response rate, noting that the Commission may wish to study the Validity and Reliability Survey format.

Following review of the report, the ORTHO RC concluded that, because of the amount of data provided in the report, and to ensure a thorough review of data and the comments received, further study of the survey data is warranted. Further, the ORTHO RC believed a small workgroup composed of at least four (4) Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Review Committee members and no more than two (2) additional individuals representing the American Association of Orthodontists (AAO) should be formed to further study the reports and identify the residency and fellowship Accreditation Standards, if any, which warrant revision. The ORTHO RC believed that it would be beneficial to include individuals from the AAO’s Society of Educators as its selected members of the workgroup. The ORTHO RC noted that the workgroup would conduct meetings by tele-/web-conference; therefore, there would be no financial impact to the Commission. A report of the workgroup would be submitted for consideration at the Summer 2020 meeting of the ORTHO RC and Commission.

**Recommendation:** It is recommended that the Commission on Dental Accreditation, through the Chair, appoint a workgroup composed of at least four (4) members of the Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Review Committee and no more than two (2) additional individuals representing the American Association of Orthodontists (AAO), to further study the findings of the residency and fellowship Validity and Reliability Studies and identify Accreditation Standards, if any, which warrant revision with a report for consideration by the Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Review Committee and Commission in Summer 2020.

**Consideration of Proposed Revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics (p. 1101):** At its Winter 2019 meeting, the Review Committee on Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Education (ORTHO RC) considered proposed revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Advanced
Dental Education Programs in Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics from the American Association of Orthodontists.

The ORTHO RC concluded, and the Commission concurred, that the proposed revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics, found in Appendix 1, Policy Report p. 1101, be circulated to the communities of interest for review and comment for a period of one (1) year, with final review by the ORTHO RC and Commission in Winter 2020. Accordingly, comments on the proposed revisions were solicited from the communities of interest, with Hearings conducted at the March 2019 American Dental Education Association (ADEA) and September 2019 American Dental Association (ADA) annual meetings.

At its Winter 2020 meeting, the Review Committee carefully considered the proposed revisions (Appendix 1, Policy Report p. 1101) and all comments received (Appendices 2, 3 and 4, Policy Report p. 1101). The Committee engaged in thorough discussion of the proposed revisions; for example, the ORTHO RC deliberated whether faculty ratios might be best suited to a “Should” or a “Must” statement. Following careful consideration, the ORTHO RC determined that the proposed revisions warranted further study in light of the validity and reliability survey results (Policy Report p.1100) and the Commission directive to study the term “Should” within the Accreditation Standards (Policy Report p. 1103). Further, the Committee determined that it would be beneficial to study the proposed revisions in conjunction with the validity and reliability study workgroup.

In summary, the ORTHO RC recommended the proposed revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics and all comments received found in Appendices 1, 2, 3 and 4, Policy Report p. 1001, respectively, be further studied through the validity and reliability study workgroup with a report for consideration by the Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Review Committee and Commission in Summer 2020.

**Recommendation:** It is recommended that the Commission on Dental Accreditation direct the Validity and Reliability Studies workgroup to additionally study the proposed revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics and all comments received (Appendices 1, 2, 3 and 4, Policy Report p. 1001) in conjunction with its study of the findings of the residency and fellowship Validity and Reliability Studies and identify Accreditation Standards, if any, which warrant revision with a report for consideration by the Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Review Committee and Commission in Summer 2020.

**Report on Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Programs (Residency and Fellowship) Annual Survey Curriculum Sections (p. 1102):** The Review Committee on Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Education (ORTHO RC) noted that the Annual Survey Curriculum Section is reviewed during the Winter Review Committee meeting in the
year the survey will be distributed; which will next occur in 2020. The ORTHO RC considered both its residency and fellowship discipline-specific Annual Survey Curriculum Sections (Appendix 1 and Appendix 2, Policy Report p. 1102).

Following discussion at its Winter 2020 meeting, the ORTHO RC found the Curriculum Section for residency programs to be appropriate, with the addition of Question 21 to the residency Section for informational purposes as found in Appendix 1. The ORTHO RC also noted that implementation of the January 1, 2020 residency standards did not necessitate changes to the Curriculum Section.

In addition, following discussion, the ORTHO RC determined that the questions on the Curriculum Section for fellowship programs were straightforward and appropriate in relation to the Accreditation Standards for Clinical Fellowship Training Programs in Craniofacial and Special Care Orthodontics. Therefore, the ORTHO RC recommended that the Curriculum Section for fellowship programs be retained with no changes.

In summary, the ORTHO RC recommended that the Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Annual Survey Curriculum Section for residency programs be revised to include the changes noted in Appendix 1 for use in Fall 2020. It was further recommended that the Curriculum Section for fellowship programs be retained with no changes for use in Fall 2020.

**Recommendation:** It is recommended that the Commission on Dental Accreditation adopt the proposed revisions to the Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Annual Survey Curriculum Section for residency programs noted in Appendix 1 and direct implementation of the revised Annual Survey Curriculum Section in Fall 2020.

It is further recommended that the Commission on Dental Accreditation direct the Craniofacial and Special Care Orthodontics Annual Survey Curriculum Section for fellowship programs (Appendix 2, Policy Report p. 1102) be retained with no changes for use in Fall 2020.

**Consideration of the Use of the Term “Should” Within the Accreditation Standards (p. 1103):** At its Summer 2019 meeting, the Commission directed the revision or addition, as applicable, of the definition of “Should,” as noted below, within the Definition of Terms used by the Commission in the Accreditation Standards for all disciplines within the Commission’s purview, with consideration of this change in Winter 2020, and application within a time frame to correlate with other revision activities.

At this meeting, the Review Committee on Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Education (ORTHO RC) reviewed the use of the term “Should” within the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics and the Accreditation Standards for Clinical Fellowship Training Programs in Craniofacial and Special Care Orthodontics (Appendix 1 and Appendix 2, Policy Report p. 1103) and considered whether additional revisions to the Accreditation Standards are warranted as a result of the
revised definition of “Should” within the Definition of Terms, as follows: Should: Indicates a method to achieve the standard; highly desirable, but not mandatory.

The Committee did not believe that the revised definition of “Should” affected the concept of the term as already defined in the residency and fellowship standards. Upon a preliminary search of the residency standards for the instances of “Should,” the ORTHO RC noted that the term appears primarily within intent statements. However, as Standard 4-3.3 contains the term within the Standard itself, the Review Committee determined that a more thorough consideration of the term “Should” was needed. The Committee believed this in-depth review would be best accomplished through the course of the validity and reliability study review process (Policy Report p. 1100) via a small workgroup composed of at least four (4) members of Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Review Committee and no more than two (2) additional individuals representing the American Association of Orthodontics (AAO). Further, the Committee noted that it will need to carefully consider instances of the term “Should” within both the residency and fellowship Standards.

In summary, the ORTHO RC recommended that the term “Should” within the residency and fellowship Accreditation Standards be further studied through the Validity and Reliability Studies workgroup with a report for consideration by the Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Review Committee and Commission in Summer 2020. Per the Commission’s directive, the revised definition of “Should” will be incorporated into the residency and fellowship standards resulting from the validity and reliability studies.

**Recommendation:** This report is informational in nature and no action is required.

**CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS RELATING TO MORE THAN ONE REVIEW COMMITTEE**

Matters related to more than one review committee are included in a separate report.

**CONSIDERATION OF SITE VISITOR APPOINTMENTS TO THE COMMISSION ON DENTAL ACCREDITATION IN THE AREA OF ORTHODONTICS AND DENTOFACIAL ORTHOPEDICS EDUCATION**

The Review Committee on Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Education considered site visitor appointments for 2020-2021. The Committee’s recommendations on the appointments of individuals are included in a separate report.
CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS RELATED TO ACCREDITATION STATUS

Matters related to accreditation status of programs are included in a separate report.

Respectfully submitted,

Dr. Eladio DeLeon
Chair, Review Committee on Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Education
Draft Annual Survey Curriculum Section for Orthodontics Residency Programs

Additions are Underlined
Strikethroughs indicate Deletions
**Start of Block: ORTHO Curriculum (Q21-32)**

**Part II - Orthodontics & Dentofacial Orthopedics Curriculum Section**

*Part II of the survey is confidential. Any reports from this section will not identify individual programs by name.*

21. What percentage of time do students/residents devote to each of the following areas during the entire program?

Column must add up to 100%. Do not enter percent signs.

a. Clinical (include related laboratory activity) : _______
b. Didactic (include assigned laboratory activity) : _______
c. Research : _______
d. Teaching : _______
e. Other, please specify : _______

Total : _______

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------
22. In which of the following interdisciplinary approaches did students/residents receive instruction or gain clinical consultation experience during the past 24-month period for the management of dental patients?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Case history</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Cephalometric analysis</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Intraoral radiographs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Model Analysis</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d1. Model Analysis: Plaster cast</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d2. Model Analysis: Digital models</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Photographic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f. Cone beam imaging</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>g. Other, please specify</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

23. What percentage of all patients are managed by the students/residents in each of following treatment mechanisms?
Column must not exceed 100%. Do not enter percent signs.
a. Begg Appliance : _______
b. Edgewise : _______
c. Functional: Fixed : _______
d. Functional: Removable : _______
e. Universal : _______
f. Aligners : _______
g. Other, please specify : _______
Total : _______
24. What clinical procedures exist to ensure program objectives are met? Check all that apply. At least one item must be checked.

- Experience with pre-surgical orthopedics for infants born with cleft lip and palate
- Orthodontic therapy for craniofacial deformities patients from the primary through adult dentition
- Orthodontic management of patients with cleft or craniofacial anomalies
- Surgical/orthodontic treatment planning
- Pre- and post-surgical orthodontic management
- Surgical splint design and construction and observation of surgical fixation splints in the operating room to assure appropriate placement
- Orthodontic treatment for patients who are medically compromised, have disabilities and/or special needs
- Participation in interdisciplinary dental care, clinical support and appropriate guidance for dentists who provide restorative services for Craniofacial Anomalies and Special Care (CFA&SC) patients
- Exposure to Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, Pediatric Dentistry, Plastic and Craniofacial Surgery, Sleep Disorders, Genetics, and Speech and Language Pathology for additional exposure to management of CFA&SC patients
- Supervised participation in craniofacial team activities
- Participate in craniofacial team meetings

245. How many surgical orthodontic cases were managed with the active participation of the students/residents during the 2017-18 academic year?
256. How many patients were managed by the students/residents during the 2017-18 academic year?

________________________________________________________________

Use this space to enter comments or clarifications for your answers on this page.

________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________

Page Break
Part II - Orthodontics & Dentofacial Orthopedics Curriculum Section (continued)

Part II of the survey is confidential. Any reports from this section will not identify individual programs by name.

267. What is the total number of patients with craniofacial abnormalities managed with the active participation of the students/residents during the 2017-18 academic year?

Must be equal to or less than the number of patients reported in Question 25 ($\text{CNUMPAT}/\text{ChoiceTextEntryValue}$).

278. Identify the total number of patients initiating active treatment that were assigned to the students/residents during the 2017-18 academic year.

Total must be equal to or less than the number of patients reported in Question 25 ($\text{CNUMPAT}/\text{ChoiceTextEntryValue}$).

a. 1st year students/residents : _______
b. 2nd year students/residents : _______
c. 3rd year students/residents : _______
Total : _______

289. How many patients completed active treatment by the students/residents during the 2017-18 academic year?
Total must be equal to or less than the number of patients reported in Question 25 \((\text{ChoiceTextEntryValue})\).  
\[
\begin{array}{ll}
\text{a. 1st year students/residents : } & \underline{\text{_______}} \\
\text{b. 2nd year students/residents : } & \underline{\text{_______}} \\
\text{c. 3rd year students/residents : } & \underline{\text{_______}} \\
\text{Total : } & \underline{\text{________}} \\
\end{array}
\]

**2930.** How many transferred active treatment and active retention patients were assigned to the students/residents during the 2017-18 academic year?  

Sum of lines a through c in each column must not exceed the number of patients reported in Question 25 \((\text{ChoiceTextEntryValue})\).  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Active Treatment</th>
<th>Active Retention</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. 1st year students/residents</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. 2nd year students/residents</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. 3rd year students/residents</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------
301. Indicate the number of faculty positions and total number of hours per week devoted to the clinical supervision of the students/residents.

For example, if there are three clinical faculty members who each devote 30 hours per week to clinical supervision, the number of positions would be 3 and the total number of hours per week would be 90.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Number of faculty positions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Total number of hours per week</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

312. How often does the program conduct formal documented evaluations of student/resident clinical performance?

- Weekly
- Monthly
- Quarterly
- Biannually
- Annually
323. How often does the program conduct formal documented evaluations of faculty?

- [ ] Weekly
- [ ] Monthly
- [ ] Quarterly
- [ ] Semiannually
- [ ] Annually

Use this space to enter comments or clarifications for your answers on this page.

________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________

End of Block: ORTHO Curriculum (Q21-32)