Joint Commission Policy Update and Update on Progress on the Integrated National Board Dental Examination

Dr. David M. Waldschmidt
Secretary of the Joint Commission on National Dental Examinations

AADB Mid-Year Meeting
April 22, 2013
This is an informational session intended to provide an update on the National Board Dental Examinations.

- The Joint Commission on National Dental Examinations
- Policy updates
- Examination trends
- The Integrated National Board Dental Examination (INBDE)
- Additional information and resources
- Lunch reception cosponsored by the Joint Commission and AADB
“The JCNDE develops and conducts highly reliable, state of the art cognitive examinations that assist regulatory agencies in making valid decisions regarding licensure of oral health care professionals, develops and implements policy for the orderly, secure, and fair administration of its examinations, and is a leader and resource in assessment for the oral health care profession.”
# Composition of the JCNDE

## Appointing Organizations and Current Appointees

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Members</th>
<th>Chair/Representative</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **AADB (6)** |         | Guy Shampaine, DDS, Chair  
               |         | Jerri Ann Donahue, DDS  
               |         | Conrad P. McVea, III, DDS  
               |         | LeeAnn Podruch, DDS, JD  
               |         | Michael Reggie VanderVeen, DDS  
               |         | Open |
| **ADEA (3)** |         | Connie Drisko, DDS  
               |         | Birgit J. Glass DDS, MS  
               |         | Marc E. Levitan, DDS |
| **ADA (3)**  |         | Lorin D. Peterson, DDS, Vice-Chair  
               |         | Robert A. Hersh, DDS  
               |         | Peter S. Trager, DDS |
| **ADHA (1)** |         | Mary Lou Gerosky, RDH, MEd |
| **ASDA (1)** |         | Ian R. Murray, BS |
| **Public (1)** |       | Ms. Kelley Shannon |
| **Liaisons & Observers** |       | Kenneth J. Versman, DDS, MS (ADA Board Liaison)  
                               |       | Jiwon Lee (ASDA Observer)  
                               |       | Liaisons and observers do not participate in voting |
JCNDE Policy Updates: Reminders

- Application eligibility period is now 6 months.
- Score reports now include a history of scores for all examination attempts.
- As of January 1, 2012, candidates are limited to successful completion of an examination within five years of testing or five examination attempts, whichever comes first.
  - Adminstrations prior to 2012 do not count as part of the five.
- Candidates are prohibited from taking the examination to practice or to obtain an advance review of the content.
Examination results may be withheld or reported when forensic analyses provide compelling information indicating the presence of an irregularity.

Adopted the findings of the 2011 practice analysis. These findings resulted in very slight modifications to existing NBDE Part II test specifications (results were highly consistent with the previous practice analysis).

At its 2013 meeting, the Joint Commission will be reviewing the criteria for selecting dental hygiene test constructors.
The goal of the IDEA Grant Program is to enhance the Joint Commission’s testing program with respect to the evaluation of those seeking licensure to practice dentistry or dental hygiene.

The Joint Commission adopted new procedures and timeframes for reviewing and approving proposals (e.g., letter of intent to precede formal submission), in hopes of receiving proposals that are more closely aligned with the goals of the Joint Commission and its IDEA Grant Program.
National Board examination fees are currently as follows:

- NBDE Part I: $355
- NBDE Part II: $400
- NBDHE: $390

Score report request fees are currently $32.50.
The Joint Commission’s existing applications, scoring, and score report processing systems were fragmented, difficult to maintain, and inefficient.

To better serve stakeholders and communities of interest, in 2005 an IT request was submitted to initiate an upgrade project.

Our existing systems are incredibly complex to program. The Joint Commission in its history has never undertaken a data/program conversion effort of this magnitude.

A large number of issues (over 350) were identified and required substantial effort to address.

On April 3, 2013 the new system was implemented.

The Joint Commission appreciates your patience as we make this transition.
Test Administration and Security

- A high level of security is maintained on all examination materials.
- Strict precautions are in place at the Joint Commission’s offices and at testing centers to ensure that test content is not compromised.
- Administrations are monitored for irregularities.
- The Joint Commission offers the NBDE Part I and Part II at Prometric Testing Centers.
- The Joint Commission offers the NBDHE at Pearson Testing Centers.
Administration: Common Items
Administration: Security
Trends in Administration Volume and Candidate Performance
The following slides present information concerning examinee volume and performance for the 10 year period between 2003 and 2012.

Examinee volume data include all individuals (first time, repeaters, accredited, non-accredited) completing the National Board Dental Examinations (Part I and Part II) and the National Board Dental Hygiene Examination.

Performance trend data include candidates enrolled in accredited schools in the U.S and Canada who took the examination for the first time.
NBDE Part I Administrations (2003-2012)
Exam Administration Trends

** A new standard was introduced this year, based on updated standard setting activities.
NBDE Part II Administrations (2003-2012)
Exam Administration Trends

NBDE Part II Monthly Volumes (2008—2012)
A new standard was introduced this year, based on updated standard setting activities.
NBDHE Administrations (2003-2012)

NBDHE Administrations (2003 - 2012)

- Total
- Accredited
- Non-Accredited

© 2013 Joint Commission on National Dental Examinations. All rights reserved.
Exam Administration Trends

NBDHE Monthly Volumes (2010-2012)
NBDHE Failure Rates

* A new standard was introduced this year, based on updated standard setting activities.
### Summary of Irregularities and Appeals (2012)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Irregularity or Appeal (2012)</th>
<th>Violation Notification, Warning Letter or Appeal to Waive Examination Rule</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>NBDE Part I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appeal to waive examination rule (e.g., request to retest prior to 12 month waiting period).</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Examination rule violation</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>18</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© 2013 Joint Commission on National Dental Examinations, All rights reserved.
## Summary of Appeal Decisions (2012)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Granted</th>
<th>Denied</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012*</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*3 cases were still pending as of the date of tabulation of this report.*
The Integrated National Board Dental Examination (INBDE) and the Committee for an Integrated Examination (CIE)
What is the INBDE?

• In 2009, the JCNDE appointed a Committee for an Integrated Examination (CIE) to develop and validate a new examination instrument for dentistry that integrates basic, behavioral and clinical sciences to assess entry level competency in dental practice to supplant Part I and Part II.

• The integrated examination retains the same fundamental examination purpose; to assist state boards of dentistry in making licensure decisions.
How did the CIE and INBDE come about?

• A convergence of factors led to the INBDE, all intent upon finding better ways of serving stakeholders and communities of interest.

• Specific opportunities were seen to:
  – Better assist regulatory agencies
  – Increase the appropriateness of test content and align content with contemporary dental education
  – Improve processes and the experience of candidates

• There was also recognition of examination content trends and a zeitgeist directed towards integration.
Opportunities Seen To Better Assist Regulatory Agencies

• Mission of the JNCDE and NBDE: “assist regulatory agencies in making valid decisions regarding licensure of oral health care professionals.”
• Two comprehensive examinations appear to be somewhat redundant and unnecessary for the purpose of licensure.
• State boards need a comprehensive, summative assessment indicating whether an applicant at the time of licensure has the requisite cognitive knowledge, skills, and abilities to safely practice dentistry.
• State boards are interested in the application of knowledge as it relates to dental practice. This includes assessment of higher level cognitive skills (e.g., problem solving, critical thinking, information processing, synthesis, and evaluation).
Members of the CIE are all well acquainted with the mission and policies of the Joint Commission.

**Mark Christensen, DDS (Chair) (AADB 2006-2009)**
Vice-Chair – JCNDE 2009
Chair - Administration (2008)
Chair – Dental Hygiene (2006 & 2007)

**Bruce D. Horn, DDS (AADB 2007-2010)**
Chair – JCNDE (2010)
Chair – Administration (2009)
Chair – Dental Hygiene (2008)

**B. Ellen Byrne, DDS, Ph.D. (ADEA 2009-2012)**
Chair – Research & Development (2012)
Chair – Administration – (2011)

**Andrew Spielman, DMD, MS, Ph.D. (ADEA 2008-2011)**
Chair – JCNDE (2011)
Chair – Examination Development (2009)

**Ron J. Seeley, DDS (ADA 2007-2010)**
Chair – JCNDE (2009)
Chair - Examination Development (2008)

**Stephen T. Radack, III, DMD (ADA 2008-2011)**
Chair – Research & Development (2010 & 2011)
Vice-Chair - JCNDE (2010)
Committee for an Integrated Examination

Joint Commissioners Serving as Ex-Officio CIE Members

The Joint Commission Chair and Standing Committee Chairs serve as ex-officio members of the CIE.

**Guy Shampaine, DDS**  
Chair – JCNDE 2013  
Chair – Examination Development (2012)

**Jerri Ann Donahue, DDS**  
Chair - Administration (2013)

**Lorin D. Peterson, DDS**  
Vice-Chair – JCNDE 2013  
Chair – Research & Development (2013)  
Chair - Administration (2012)

**Connie Drisko, DDS**  
Chair – Examination Development (2013)
### Twelve Steps for Test Development*

*(Downing, 2006)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Content Definition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Test Specifications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Item Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Test Design and Assembly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Test Production</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Test Administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Test Scoring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Standard Setting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Reporting Test Results</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Item Banking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Technical Reports/Validation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Bolded steps indicate areas of current focus for the CIE.*
Current Conversations

- Test content framework and test specifications
- Developing model items
- Specifying test construction committee structure
- Test length and number of items
- Psychometric scoring models
- Communication
- Alignment
- Project management
- Budgeting and resources
- Stakeholder and community of interest analysis
Stakeholder and Community of Interest Analysis

Why do a stakeholder and community of interest analysis?

• Identify groups that have an impact on project success

• Understand concerns
  – How does the project affect members of each group?
  – How can each group affect the project?
  – Identify risks and manage them.

• Understand opportunities
Stakeholder and Community of Interest Analysis

• Distinction: Stakeholder vs. Community of Interest

• Highlights
  – 5 primary groups identified, each with multiple subgroups to consider
    • State boards
    • Educational community
    • Joint Commission
    • ADA
    • Vendors
  – 13 additional groups (current dentists, specialty groups, associations, clinical testing agencies, the public, etc.)
### Stakeholder Analysis: Dental Boards

#### American Association of Dental Boards

#### Dental Boards (States, Districts, Territories)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>State</th>
<th>State</th>
<th>State</th>
<th>State</th>
<th>State</th>
<th>State</th>
<th>State</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alabama</td>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>New Mexico</td>
<td>Michigan</td>
<td>South Dakota</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alaska</td>
<td>Hawaii</td>
<td>New York</td>
<td>Minnesota</td>
<td>Tennessee</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arizona</td>
<td>Idaho</td>
<td>North Carolina</td>
<td>Mississippi</td>
<td>Texas</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arkansas</td>
<td>Illinois</td>
<td>North Dakota</td>
<td>Missouri</td>
<td>Utah</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>California</td>
<td>Indiana</td>
<td>Ohio</td>
<td>Montana</td>
<td>Vermont</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colorado</td>
<td>Iowa</td>
<td>Oklahoma</td>
<td>Nebraska</td>
<td>Virginia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connecticut</td>
<td>Kansas</td>
<td>Oregon</td>
<td>Nevada</td>
<td>Virgin Islands</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delaware</td>
<td>Kentucky</td>
<td>Pennsylvania</td>
<td>New Hampshire</td>
<td>Washington</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District of</td>
<td>Louisiana</td>
<td>Puerto Rico</td>
<td>Rhode Island</td>
<td>West Virginia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Columbia</td>
<td>Maine</td>
<td>Maryland</td>
<td>South Carolina</td>
<td>Wisconsin</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Florida</td>
<td>New Jersey</td>
<td>Massachusetts</td>
<td>South Carolina</td>
<td>Wyoming</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Identified concerns (preliminary):

- Need evidence supporting the use of the INBDE for making licensure decisions.
- Need information concerning the correspondence/comparability between Part I, Part II, and the INBDE (e.g., exam content, anticipated failure rates).
- Exam administration date should be as close as possible to the licensure decision date.
Identified concerns (preliminary):

- Concerns around how written examination requirements may be represented in rules/statutes, etc.
- Concerns around whether the INBDE will be “Part III.”

  NOTE: The INBDE is intended to replace NBDE Part I and Part II, and as such it retains the same purpose (i.e., the INBDE is not a ‘Part III’ examination).

- Communication challenges (e.g., rotating membership within state boards).
Stakeholder Analysis: Dental Boards

- Efforts to help address concerns:
  - Presenting information concerning examination content and specifications.
  - Providing technical reports with validity evidence.
  - Obtaining an understanding of references to required written examinations in existing legislative and regulatory verbiage.
  - Continued communication.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stakeholder Analysis: Dental Boards</th>
<th>Location of State Provisions Regarding Exam Requirements for Dental Licensure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Administrative Regulations</strong></td>
<td>Alabama, Arkansas, Florida, Georgia, Guam, Indiana, Iowa, Kentucky, Maine, Maryland, Massachusetts, Michigan, Minnesota, Missouri, Montana, New Hampshire, New Jersey, New York, North Carolina, Oklahoma, Oregon, Pennsylvania, Rhode Island, South Carolina, South Dakota, Texas, Vermont, Virginia, Washington, Washington DC, West Virginia, Wisconsin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Legislative Code</strong> (i.e., state statute).</td>
<td>Alaska, Arizona, California, Colorado, Connecticut, Delaware, Hawaii, Idaho, Illinois, Kansas, Mississippi, Nevada, New Mexico, Ohio, Puerto Rico, Tennessee, Utah, Wyoming</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Administrative Codes and Statutes contain roughly equivalent provisions</strong></td>
<td>Louisiana, Nebraska, North Dakota</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The INBDE and the Cone of Uncertainty*

* Downloaded from: http://www.microsoft.com/china/technet/images/itsolutions/techguide/innsol/images/msfpmd07.gif
The 2017 implementation date is no longer in effect.

Subsequent to its April 24, 2013 meeting, the Joint Commission will provide additional information concerning how it will approach notifications concerning the launch timeframe.
• The impetus for the INBDE was environmental change and the need to find a better way of serving stakeholders and communities of interest.

• The INBDE emerged through a carefully planned process that reflected the needs of those stakeholders and communities.

• The Joint Commission recognizes that the development of the INBDE affects and must actively involve numerous groups.

• While much has been done, much work also remains.

• Communication, participation, and feedback are critical to the success of the effort.
Summary

• The Joint Commission continues to work to improve National Board Examinations.
• These efforts are focused in multiple areas such as the following:
  • Program monitoring
  • Updating policies
  • Updating procedures
• A major effort underway involves the development of an integrated examination.
• On behalf of the Joint Commission, thank you for the opportunity to provide this update.
Additional Information and Resources

Joint Commission on National Dental Examinations
http://www.ada.org/JCNDE.aspx

Integrated National Board Dental Examination
http://www.ada.org/5553.aspx

National Boards (Examination Guides, FAQ’s, DENTPIN® Information, Score Report Requests)
  - Part I: http://www.ada.org/2667.aspx
  - Part II: http://www.ada.org/2665.aspx
  - Dental Hygiene: http://www.ada.org/2662.aspx

Test Construction Committee Information
http://www.ada.org/2291.aspx

Technical Reports, ADEA Presentations, Item Development Guides
http://www.ada.org/2287.aspx
Contact Information

David M. Waldschmidt, Ph.D.
Secretary, Joint Commission on National Dental Examinations and Director, Department of Testing Services
waldschmidtd@ada.org

Kathleen J. Hinshaw, L.D.H., Ed.D.
Senior Manager, Test Administration
hinshawk@ada.org

Ellen Ryske, MBA
Manager, Client Services and Special Projects
ryskee@ada.org

Joint Commission on National Dental Examinations
211 E. Chicago Ave., Suite 600
Chicago, Illinois 60611
Fax: (312) 587-4105
http://www.ada.org/JCNDE.aspx
Thank You
The Joint Commission and the American Association of Dental Boards invite you to attend a Lunch Reception

12:00 – 1:30pm