Call to Order: Dr. Joseph P. Fiorellini, chair, called a regular meeting of the Commission for Continuing Education Provider Recognition (CCEPR) to order on Thursday, October 4, 2018 at 9:04 a.m. in the Executive Conference Room of the ADA Headquarters Building in Chicago.

Roll Call

Commissioners present: Dr. Jeffrey D. Bennett, Dr. Elizabeth Ann Bilodeau, Dr. Monica H. Cipes, Dr. Gary M. DeWood, Dr. Debra Dixon, Dr. Bertram J. Hughes, Dr. Mark C. Hutten, Dr. Karl Keiser, Dr. Mitchell J. Lipp, Mr. Conor McNulty, Dr. Steven E. Parker, Dr. Susan G. Reed and Dr. Nancy R. Rosenthal.

Dr. Barry Hammond was unable to attend.

In addition, Dr. Linda K. Himmelberger, Third District Trustee, Board of Trustees liaison, attended the meeting.

Guest of the Commission: Incoming members of the Commission Dr. John D. Ball and Dr. Mitra Sadramelli attended as observers. Ms. Kate Regnier, executive vice president, Accreditation Council for Continuing Medical Education (ACCME) and Ms. Dimitra Travlos, assistant executive director, Accreditation Council for Continuing Pharmacy Education (ACPE), attended a portion of the meeting.

Commission staff: Ms. Mary Borysewicz, director; Mr. Alejandro Lerma, coordinator.

ADA staff present for all or portions of the meeting: Dr. Anthony J. Ziebert, senior vice president, Education/Professional Affairs; Ms. Paula Tironi, Esq., senior associate general counsel; Dr. Alonso Carrasco Labra, director, Center for Evidence Based Dentistry.

Preliminary Business

Adoption of Agenda and Disclosure of Relationships: The Commission approved the agenda and authorized the chair to alter the order of agenda items as necessary to expedite business.

Dr. Fiorellini directed the Commission’s attention to the ADA Conflict of Interest Policy and reminded commissioners of their obligation to make disclosures as appropriate. Commissioners disclosed the following affiliations during the course of the meeting:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Commission Member</th>
<th>Affiliation Disclosed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jeffrey Bennett</td>
<td>Officer of American College of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgeons; Member, American Association of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgeons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monica Cipes</td>
<td>Consultant for American Board of Pediatric Dentistry and College of Diplomates of the American Board of Pediatric Dentistry; executive committee, American Board of Pediatrics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gary DeWood</td>
<td>Employee, Spear Education</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Fiduciary Duty and Other Legal Topics: Ms. Paula Tironi gave a short presentation regarding topics such as fiduciary duty and conflicts of interest.

Minutes of the April 12-13, 2018 CCEPR Meeting: Minutes of the Commission’s April 12-13, 2018 meeting, previously approved by the Commission via email ballot, were acknowledged as part of the Commission’s official record.

Consent Agenda: A consent calendar was prepared to expedite the business of the Commission. Dr. Fiorellini reminded Commission members that any report, recommendation or resolution can be removed from the consent calendar for discussion. The following reports were accepted by the Commission on consent.

Future Meeting Dates
Results of Spring 2018 CERP Applicant Survey
CERP Participation and Approval Data

ADA Board of Trustees Liaison: Dr. Himmelberger commended the Commission on its growth in the four years since it was created and oversight of ADA CERP transferred from the CERP Committee to the Commission.

ADA Senior Vice President, Education/Professional Affairs: Dr. Ziebert provided an update on activities in the ADA Division of Education, noting that the division was meeting year-to-date budget targets. Dr. Ziebert also informed the Commission about several resolutions to be considered at the October 2018 ADA House of Delegates meeting related to governance of the Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA). The resolutions have been advanced by the CODA/ADA workgroup in order to revise governance documents to standardize relationships. If approved, similar changes to governance documents related to the other ADA commissions may be considered.

Dr. Ziebert also provided updates on other education-related initiatives being conducted by the ADA, including the formation of a National Coalition on Dental Licensure to advance portability of licensure, and to develop an Objective Structured Clinical Examination (OSCE) for dental licensure that could replace a patient-based examination.

Commission Business, Administration and Governance

Finance Committee Report: Dr. Mark Hutten presented the Committee’s comments and recommendations to the Commission. Noting that a revised CERP provider fee structure was being launched in 2019, the Commission agreed that it would be appropriate to monitor participating providers’
acceptance of the higher annual fees for a year. The Commission therefore approved a preliminary budget for 2020 that did not include any increases in CERP provider fees over 2019.

Action: The Commission approves the preliminary 2020 CCEPR budget (Appendix 1) for submission to the ADA Budget & Finance Committee.

Planning and Assessment Committee Report: Dr. Rosenthal presented the Committee’s proposal for conducting a self-assessment in 2018-2019. The process will fulfill the ADA Board of Trustees request, pursuant to Res 6H-2014, for an assessment of CCEPR’s effectiveness, as well as the requirement that all ADA Councils and Commissions complete a periodic self-assessment. The Committee’s proposal includes a detailed survey of current and former Commissioners, a review of the Commission’s strategic plan, and a survey of a sample of ADA members regarding their perceptions of ADA CERP.

Action: The Commission approves the plan outlined in Appendix 2 for conducting the Commission’s self-assessment, pursuant to Res. B-99-2018 and Res. 1H-2013, and directs the Planning and Assessment Committee to prepare a draft self-assessment report for the Commission’s consideration at its April 2019 meeting.

Technology Update: The Commission received an informational report that funds for development of an online application platform and portal for conducting reviews have been included in the 2019 budget for technology services submitted to the 2018 ADA House of Delegates. If approved, staff will begin working with developers in early 2019 to outline requirements for the project.

CERP Provider Education and Outreach: The Commission received an update on planned educational presentations for CE providers, including the CERP provider workshop scheduled for presentation during the ADA annual meetings in 2019 and 2020, and a live webinar in November. Staff also provides CERP updates at the Association for Continuing Dental Education annual meeting.

Joint Accreditation: The Commission reviewed information about Joint Accreditation Interprofessional Continuing Education as an associate member, and discussed the potential advantages and disadvantages of participating as an associate member in Joint Accreditation. The Commission noted that the surgeon general has emphasized the importance of oral health to overall health, and that dental schools are incorporating interprofessional education within their curricula. Supporting dentists’ ability to obtain continuing education credits by participating in CE activities developed for a health care team could help integrate oral healthcare with healthcare in general. The Commission also noted that providers approved through joint accreditation may also offer CE activities for single healthcare disciplines, in addition to interprofessional team-based activities. The Commission agreed that it would be important to assess Joint Accreditation criteria and requirements to determine whether a provider approved through that process would substantively meet ADA CERP requirements. The Commission also noted that a comparative review of the CERP Standards with the Joint Accreditation criteria would be a valuable benchmarking activity.

Action: The Commission approves the appointment of an ad hoc committee to review the Joint Accreditation criteria for Interprofessional Continuing Education for the purpose of assessing the comparability between the Joint Accreditation criteria and the CERP Recognition Standards, and that the committee report its findings to the Commission at its April 2019 meeting.

Action: The Commission requests staff to review the draft Joint Accreditation Associate memorandum of understanding, identify questions and concerns, including information on the projected financial impact of participating in Joint Accreditation, for the Commission’s consideration at its April 2019 meeting.
Conjoint Committee for Continuing Education (CCCE): The Commission is a member of the Conjoint Committee on Continuing Education (CCCE), a coalition of organizations with an interest in leveraging improvements in health care through continuing professional education. The Commission received a copy of the agenda for the CCCE meeting occurring at the same time as the Commission’s meeting. The meeting will focus on activity assessments that meet the requirements of the FDA Opioid Analgesia Risk Evaluation and Mitigation Strategies (REMS). The Commission will continue to monitor CCCE activities and assess on a case by case basis whether staff or a CCCE member should participate in future meetings.

FDA Opioid Analgesia REMS: The Commission received information that in September 2018 the U.S. Food and Drug Administration approved an expanded Opioid Analgesic Risk Evaluation and Mitigation Strategy (REMS), with an expanded blueprint for continuing education activities to include information about immediate release opioids. The Commission also considered information on the requirements for participating as an accreditor of providers offering REMS compliant CE activities. These include data collection regarding participants in REMS activities for reporting to the FDA, as well as a commitment to conduct audits of 10% of REMS activities offered by providers approved by the accrediting agency to ensure compliance with the FDA approved educational blueprint.

The Commission noted that it has not been notified of any CERP recognized providers developing an Opioid REMS activity, nor has it received any inquiries from providers regarding reporting REMS activities. The majority of REMS CE activities funded through REMS product company grants have been awarded to medical education companies and health care networks; to date, 65-75% of REMS CE activities have been reported to the FDA by the Accreditation Council for Continuing Medical Education (ACCME). The Commission noted that the need to develop processes for capturing information about REMS activities offered by CERP recognized providers that are not also accredited by other agencies is uncertain at this time. In light of the staff and volunteer time needed to develop and implement REMS data collection and activity audit processes, the Commission requested that staff continue to monitor developments on Opioid Analgesic REMS, and to share information with CERP recognized providers on opportunities to apply for REMS grants. Noting the importance of continuing professional education on appropriate opioid prescribing practices, and to monitor these types of activities more closely to help ensure they are aligned with regulatory requirements, the Commission approved a requirement that CERP providers that offer CE activities on opioid prescribing be required to document these in their periodic applications for continued recognition.

Action: The Commission requests staff to modify CERP application forms to require that providers that offer continuing education activities on opioid analgesic prescribing include full documentation for one of these activities as part of the CERP application.

Appeal Board Appointments: The Commission received an information report regarding appointments to the CCEPR Appeal Board. The Appeal Board provides a mechanism for CE providers to appeal adverse actions taken by the Commission. The composition of the CCEPR Appeal Board is defined by the CCEPR Rules. Current Appeal Board members’ terms will expire in September 2019. The organizations represented on CCEPR have each been requested to appoint representatives to a new 4-year term beginning in September 2019.


Action: The Commission appoints the following consultants to participate in the CERP application review process in 2019: Dr. Brian Beitel, Dr. Hardeep Chehal, Dr. Debra Dixon, Dr. Joseph Fiorellini, Dr. Timothy Kirkpatrick, Dr. Eugene McGuire, Mr. Conor McNulty and Dr. Ann Steiner. Appointments are for a one year term beginning with the close of the 2018 ADA House of Delegates.
Election of 2019 Officers: In accordance with the Rules of the Commission for Continuing Education Provider Recognition, the Commission elects a Chair and Vice-Chair who are active, life or retired member of the American Dental Association. The officers’ terms will be effective beginning with the close of the ADA House of Delegates in October 2018 through the close of the House of Delegates in September 2019.


Action: The Commission elects Dr. Bertram J. Hughes to serve as its Vice Chair for 2018-2019.

Acknowledgement of Service: The Commission acknowledged the following Commissioners whose terms will expire in October 2018: Dr. Joseph P. Fiorellini (chair), Dr. Debra Dixon, Dr. Mark Hutten, and Mr. Conor McNulty.

Future Meeting Dates: The Commission received an informational report listing the Commission’s next meeting dates, scheduled for April 25-26 and October 3-4, 2019 (consent calendar item).

ADA CERP Standards, Policies and Procedures

Standards Revision: The process of revising the CERP Standards was put on hold pending discussions regarding the CERP Eligibility Criteria. Changes to the Eligibility Criteria, if approved, could have an impact on revisions to CERP Standards related to managing commercial conflicts of interest.

CERP Eligibility Committee Report: The Commission heard a report from the Committee on its review of literature on commercial conflicts of interest in medical education, and considered a proposal from the Committee to revise the CERP Eligibility Criteria so that commercial entities would no longer be eligible for recognition. The CERP Glossary defines commercial entities as: “Any entity producing, marketing, re-selling or distributing health care goods or services consumed by, or used on, patients.”

In an extensive discussion, the Commission considered arguments for and against the proposal to revise the CERP Eligibility Criteria. Arguments in favor of revising the Eligibility Criteria included the potential for reducing commercial conflicts of interest that may unduly influence professional judgment, compromise the objectivity of education, impact the quality of patient care, and undermine the public’s trust in the professions. Revising the CERP Eligibility Criteria so that commercial entities were no longer eligible for CERP recognition would also help align continuing dental education standards with those adopted by other health professions. Arguments against the proposal included concerns that the number of available CE activities might be reduced, and that dentists would not be able to receive CE credit for training in the use of specific products. The Commission also noted that a reduction in the number of participating providers would have an impact on the Commission’s revenues, at least in the short term.

In considering changes to the CERP Standards or Eligibility Criteria, the Commission recognizes the importance of obtaining feedback from a broad spectrum of stakeholders. The Commission therefore requested that the proposed revisions to the CERP Eligibility Criteria be published for comments from the communities of interest (Appendix 3). The Commission also planned an open hearing on the proposal on October 19, 2018 during the ADA annual meeting in Honolulu.

Action: The Commission approves releasing the proposed revisions to the CERP Eligibility Criteria, shown in Appendix 3, for comment by the communities of interest, and requests that the CERP Eligibility Committee review the comments with a report and recommendations for the Commission’s consideration at its April 2019 meeting.
ADA CERP Provider Recognition

Fall 2018 Recommended Recognition Actions: The Commission considered 12 new applications for ADA CERP recognition, 76 applications for continued recognition, 18 progress reports and three reports of substantive change. The Commission granted initial recognition to eight providers of continuing dental education, and continued recognition to 71 providers. The Commission postponed action on three applications, and issued four notices of intent to withdraw recognition. The Commission discontinued recognition of two providers at the request of the providers and withdrew three providers for failure to meet program requirements. Including the Commission’s October 2018 actions on recognition, 470 CE providers are currently ADA CERP recognized.

Action: The Commission grants recognition or continued recognition to a total of 79 providers of continuing dental education. The Commission's October 2018 actions regarding ADA CERP recognition are summarized in Appendix 4, a confidential section of these minutes.

Results of Fall 2018 CERP Applicant Survey: The Commission received an informational report summarizing survey results from providers submitting applications each cycle (consent calendar item).

CERP Participation and Approval Data: The Commission received an informational report tracking annual data on program participation, submission types and acceptance rates (consent calendar item).

Miscellaneous

ADA Center for Evidence Based Dentistry Presentation: The Commission received an informational report on evidence based clinical practice and the ADA’s role in developing and promoting evidence based clinical guidelines from Dr. Alonso Carrasco-Labra, director of the ADA’s Center for Evidence Based Dentistry.

Joint Accreditation Informational Presentation: The Commission received an informational presentation on Joint Accreditation for Interprofessional Continuing Education from Ms. Kate Regnier, executive vice president, Accreditation Council for Continuing Medical Education (ACCMCE) and Ms. Dimitra Travlos, assistant executive director, Accreditation Council for Continuing Pharmacy Education (ACPE). Joint Accreditation is a process by which CE providers that offer continuing education to an interprofessional audience may become simultaneously accredited to provide medical, physician assistants, nursing, pharmacy, and optometry continuing education through a single, unified application process, and set of accreditation standards.

ADA 2018 House of Delegates Resolutions—Education: The Commission reviewed resolutions submitted to the 2018 ADA House of Delegates related to accreditation and Commission governance. The Commission noted that resolutions advanced by the ADA/CODA Work Group propose modifications to governance documents pertaining to the Commission on Dental Accreditation that would permit CODA to approve its own Rules, remove a Commissioner for cause, and appoint its own ad interim chair. The Commission will monitor actions on these proposed changes. If approved, the Commission may consider whether to recommend similar revisions to governance documents related to CCEPR.

The Commission also reviewed a resolution (Res. 78-2018), asking the House of Delegates to urge CCEPR to develop a simplified CERP application process for CE providers that are CODA accredited. The Commission noted that ADA Board of Trustees has recommended that the House vote against the resolution.
**Action:** The Commission supports the Board’s recommendation to vote no on Resolution 78, and CCEPR representatives attending the Education Reference Committee open hearing may provide testimony if needed.

**ADA Master Brand:** The Commission received an informational report on the ADA’s new branding campaign in support of the association’s mission and vision to empower the profession of dentistry to achieve optimal health care for all.

**Adjournment:** 12:00 noon, Friday, October 5, 2018.