Call to Order: Dr. Susan G. Reed, chair, called a regular meeting of the Commission for Continuing Education Provider Recognition (CCEPR) to order on Thursday, October 3 at 9:03 a.m. in the Executive Conference Room of the ADA Headquarters Building in Chicago.

Roll Call

Commissioners present: Dr. John D. Ball, Ms. Karen Burgess, Dr. Monica H. Cipes, Dr. Maria Cuevas-Nunez, Dr. Carlotta A. Evans, Dr. Karl Keiser, Dr. David M. Kim, Dr. Daniel Joseph Meara, Dr. Steven E. Parker, Dr. Marcus K. Randall, Dr. Susan G. Reed, Dr. Mitra Sadrameli, and Ms. Carol Trecek.

Dr. Gary M. DeWood, Dr. Edwin Del Valle Sepulvede, and Dr. Arpana Verma were unable to attend. In addition, Dr. Paul Leary, Second District Trustee, Board of Trustees liaison, attended the meeting.

Commission staff present: Ms. Mary Borysewicz, director; Ms. Kelli Cousins, coordinator.

ADA staff present for all or portions of the meeting: Dr. Anthony J. Ziebert, senior vice president, Education/Professional Affairs; Ms. Paula Tironi, Esq., senior associate general counsel; and Dr. Kathleen O’Loughlin, executive director.

Preliminary Business

Adoption of Agenda and Disclosure of Relationships: The Commission approved the agenda and authorized the chair to alter the order of agenda items as necessary to expedite business.

Dr. Reed directed the Commission’s attention to the ADA Conflict of Interest Policy and reminded commissioners of their obligation to make disclosures as appropriate. Commissioners disclosed the following affiliations during the course of the meeting:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Commission Member</th>
<th>Affiliation Disclosed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Karen Burgess</td>
<td>Executive Director, Michigan Dental Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monica Cipes</td>
<td>Member, Connecticut Dental Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karl Keiser</td>
<td>Adjunct faculty, University of Texas Health Sciences San Antonio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mitra Sadrameli</td>
<td>Residency, University of Texas Health Sciences San Antonio</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fiduciary Duty and Other Legal Topics: Ms. Tironi gave a short presentation regarding topics such as fiduciary duty and conflicts of interest.

Consent Agenda: A consent calendar was prepared to expedite the business of the Commission. Dr. Reed reminded Commission members that any report, recommendation or resolution can be removed from the consent calendar for discussion. The following reports were accepted by the Commission on consent.
Appointments to the Commission
Update on Appeal Board Appointments
Results of Fall 2019 CERP Applicant Survey
CERP Participation and Approval Data
Future Meeting Dates

Approval of April 2019 and July 2019 Meeting Minutes: Drafts of the minutes of the Commission's April 25-26, 2019 meeting and a special meeting on July 30, 2019, were circulated to Commission members for review.

Action: The Commission approves the minutes of its April 25-26, 2019 meeting and a special meeting on July 30, 2019.

Reports from Other Agencies

ADA Board of Trustees Liaison: Dr. Leary acknowledged the important role the Commission performs, and the difficult decisions it sometimes needs to make in conducting its work. In his role as liaison to the ADA Board of Trustees, Dr. Leary will facilitate two-way communications and share background information needed to help support the Commission in fulfilling its functions.

Senior Vice President Education and Professional Affairs: Dr. Ziebert reported on activities at the 2019 ADA House of Delegates relevant to the ADA Division of Education, in particular a resolution adopted by the House granting the ADA’s commissions the authority to revise and adopt their own Rules without approval by the ADA House of Delegates. In addition, the Commission’s self-assessment report, submitted in May, was accepted by the Board of Trustees and transmitted to the House with the Board’s comment that the report contained a thorough assessment of the Commission’s effectiveness since being established in 2014.

Dr. Ziebert also provided updates on several ongoing ADA initiatives managed by departments within the Division of Education, including the formation of the Coalition for Modernizing Dental Licensure to advocate for the portability of dental licensure and the elimination of single encounter, procedure-based patient examinations. The department of testing services plans to pilot an Objective Structured Clinical Exam (OSCE) for dental licensure in 2020. Dr. Ziebert also drew the Commission’s attention to the recent recognition of dental anesthesiology as a specialty of dentistry by the ADA National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards. Public comments have been requested on two other applications for specialty recognition.

Dr. Ziebert also reported that the American Association of Dental Boards has announced plans to develop a program for approving continuing education activities. No additional information about the program was yet available.

Meeting of U.S. Health Professions CE Accreditors Group: The Commission received a verbal report from staff who attended a meeting of the accreditors for continuing education in the health professions at the Accreditation Council for Continuing Medical Education’s (ACCME) offices in July 2019. The accreditors discussed issues related to managing commercial conflicts of interest, and reviewed feedback from a recent call for comments on the ACCME’s Standards for Commercial Support (SCS) as part of that organization’s periodic review of its accreditation criteria and policies, which may ultimately result in revisions to the SCS.
Commission Business, Administration and Governance

Joint Accreditation Committee Report: Committee chair, Dr. Monica Cipes, summarized the Committee’s activities over the course of the last two years with respect to participation in Joint Accreditation. In conducting a side-by-side comparison of CERP Recognition Standards and Joint Accreditation Criteria, the Committee noted that although in most respects the two sets of criteria appear comparable, the JA criteria and policies did not address patient protection requirements for providers that offer courses in which patients are treated. The Commission requested the Committee to explore options for better aligning JA and CERP requirements in this area. Subsequent discussions between CCEPR and Joint Accreditation staff regarding this difference resulted in Joint Accreditation adopting a Patient Safety policy in 2019 that will be required of CE providers applying for Joint Accreditation. The Commission agreed with the Committee’s assessment that the new Joint Accreditation Patient Safety policy establishes requirements for CE providers with respect to compliance with applicable professional and regulatory standards that are comparable to CERP Standard XIII: Patient Protection, although less prescriptive. The Commission observed that in general, the Joint Accreditation criteria are broader, and less prescriptive than CERP requirements. The Commission discussed whether less prescriptive criteria could place greater emphasis on factors that contribute to effective education, such as outcomes, rather than administrative details.

The Committee also reported that the cost to the Commission to participate in Joint Accreditation could be offset by revenues from providers applying for CERP recognition through Joint Accreditation. More importantly, participation in this program may help foster interprofessional continuing education and better align CERP recognition standards and procedures with those of accreditors in other health care professions. As a result of its discussion, the Commission concurred with the Committee’s recommendation to move forward with an agreement with Joint Accreditation.

Action. The Commission approved participation in Joint Accreditation for Interprofessional Continuing Education as an associate member.

Finance Committee Report: Ms. Burgess presented the Finance Committee’s report and recommendations for a preliminary 2021 budget, including a proposal to increase CERP provider fees approximately 4% over 2019 levels. The proposed increase would help offset the cost of an additional FTE, identified in the Commission’s self-assessment as necessary to maintain efficient and timely operations and growth of ADA CERP, in support of the Commission’s mission. The Commission also reviewed a report of 2019 revenues and expenses through August. After considering the information presented, the Commission took the following action.

Action: The Commission approves the 2021 schedule of CERP provider fees and preliminary budget as shown in Appendix 1.

The preliminary budget will be forwarded to the ADA Budget and Finance Committee for consideration as part of the Division of Education’s budget.

Technology Update: The Commission received a verbal report from staff on the status of the project to develop a web-based CERP application and review platform. Functional and technical requirements for the project have been identified. The first phase of the project will entail building a CERP provider database in Aptify. It is anticipated that data mapping and transfer from the existing database to the new database, and user acceptance testing will proceed in the first quarter of 2020. The second phase of the project will entail developing and testing a web-based portal linked to the database that will support online submissions and reviews.
CCEPR Rules, Policies and Procedures: Dr. Ziebert informed the Commission that as a result of changes to the ADA Bylaws and Governance and Organizational Manual approved by the 2019 House of Delegates, the ADA’s four Commissions have been granted the authority to adopt their own Rules. This includes establishing the full composition of the Commission, in addition to the membership mandated in the ADA’s Governance and Organizational Manual.

In reviewing the composition of the Commission set forth in its Rules, the Commission noted that CCEPR does not currently have a public member, unlike the ADA’s other three commissions. The Commission supported the concept of adding a public member in order to align with best practices and to help ensure the public interest is represented. The Commission also supported the addition of a member appointed by the American Society of Dental Anesthesiologists, the sponsoring organization for the new dental specialty of dental anesthesiology.

**Action.** The Commission approves amending the composition of the Commission as set forth in the Rules of the Commission for Continuing Education Provider Recognition to include a public member, pursuant to policies and procedures to be developed by the Commission.

And further

The Commission approves amending the composition of the Commission as set forth in the Rules to include a board member appointed by the American Society of Dental Anesthesiologists.

The Commission considered a draft revision of the CCEPR Rules incorporating these and other changes designed to conform with the revised ADA governance documents, and, where appropriate, to be consistent with the other ADA Commissions (Appendix 2; additions underscored; deletions stricken).

**Action.** The Commission adopts the Rules of the Commission for Continuing Education Provider Recognition attached as Appendix 2.

And further,


Some sections of the revised Rules adopted by the Commission refer to Commission policies and procedures for implementing the Rules. The Commission therefore proposed establishing a new standing committee on CCEPR policies and procedures.

**Action.** The Commission approved the establishment of a standing committee on CCEPR Policies and Procedures, charged with drafting policies and procedures related to Commission operations for the Commission’s approval, and periodically reviewing and making recommendations for revision to the Commission as needed.

CERP Provider Education and Outreach: The Commission received an update from staff on past and future educational presentations for CE providers, including a workshop held during the ADA 2019 annual meeting, and one planned for the 2020 annual meeting.

Committee Appointments: The Committee reviewed an informational report of committee assignments for the 2019-2020 year.

Appointments to the Commission: The Commission was informed (on the consent calendar) that the ADA appointed Dr. Edwin Del Valle Sepulvede to the Commission. Dr. Del Valle will replace Dr. Nancy
Rosenthal whose term on the Commission ended with the close of the ADA House of Delegates on September 9, 2019.

**Appeal Board Appointments:** The Commission received an updated report (on the consent calendar) regarding appointments to the CCEPR Appeal Board for 2019-2023. The Appeal Board provides a mechanism for CE providers to appeal adverse actions taken by the Commission. The composition of the Appeal Board is defined by the CCEPR Rules. Appeal Board members are appointed to a 4-year term, and must previously have served on the Commission or its predecessor, the CERP Committee.

**New Appointments to CCEPR Appeal Board (2019-2023)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appointing Organization</th>
<th>Appeal Board Appointee</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AADB</td>
<td>TBD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AAE</td>
<td>Dr. Timothy C. Kirkpatrick</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AAO</td>
<td>Dr. Mitchell J. Lipp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AAOMP</td>
<td>Dr. Hardeep Chehal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AAOMR</td>
<td>Dr. Debra Dixon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AAOMS</td>
<td>Dr. Jeffrey D. Bennett</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AAP</td>
<td>Dr. Joseph P. Fiorellini</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AAPD</td>
<td>Dr. Brian Beitel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AAPHD</td>
<td>Dr. Mary Tavares</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACP</td>
<td>Dr. David T. Brown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADA</td>
<td>Dr. Julie Ann Bama</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADEA</td>
<td>Ms. Janice Gibbs-Reed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASCDE</td>
<td>Mr. Conor McNulty</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Future Meeting Dates:** The Commission received an informational report listing the Commission’s next meeting dates, scheduled for April 24-25 and October 3-4, 2020 (on the consent calendar).

**ADA CERP Standards, Policies and Procedures**

**Standards Revision:** Dr. Reed indicated that the process of revising the CERP Standards will resume in 2020.

**Implementation of Revised CERP Eligibility Criteria:** The Commission received an informational report on development of a screening process to identify providers that may not be eligible for participation in ADA CERP when the revised CERP Eligibility criteria are in force beginning July 1, 2023. Staff will work with the CERP Eligibility Criteria Committee to finalize a pre-application form for new providers and a survey of currently approved providers to assist in identifying those providers that are commercial interests and will not be eligible for CERP recognition under the revised CERP Eligibility Criteria. Draft surveys and an implementation timeline will be presented for the Commission’s consideration at its April 2020 meeting.

**CERP Reviewer Discussion and Calibration Exercise:** The Commission participated in an exercise and discussion to help calibrate CERP application reviews.

**ADA CERP Provider Recognition**

**Fall 2019 Recommended Recognition Actions:** The Commission considered 12 new applications for ADA CERP recognition, 74 applications for continued recognition, 10 progress reports, five requests for reconsideration of intent to withdraw and one report of substantive change.
Action: The Commission grants initial recognition to 11 providers of continuing dental education, and continued recognition to 76 providers. The Commission postpones action on one application, and issues one notice of intent to withdraw recognition. The Commission discontinues recognition of four providers at the request of the providers. Individual actions on all submissions are listed in Appendix 3, a confidential section of these minutes.

Including the Commission’s October 2019 actions on recognition, 473 CE providers are currently ADA CERP recognized.

Results of Fall 2019 CERP Applicant Survey: The Commission received an informational report summarizing survey results from providers submitting applications in Fall 2019, along with results from previous application cycles (on the consent calendar).

CERP Participation and Approval Data: The Commission received an informational report tracking annual data on program participation, submission types and acceptance rates (on the consent calendar).

Miscellaneous

ADA Executive Director Report: Dr. O’Loughlin provided an update on the ADA’s new strategic plan: Common Ground 2025. The plan represents an evolving value proposition addressing changing practice models, and a focus on promoting the health of the public.

Adjournment: 12:11 p.m., Friday, October 4, 2019