Annual Survey of the Recognized Certifying Boards

Requirements for Recognition of National Certifying Boards for Dental Specialists

August 6, 2020
The purpose of the Annual Survey is to collect current information on the governance and operations of each of the national certifying boards for dental specialists and to ensure each certifying board’s adherence to the Requirements for Recognition of National Certifying Boards for Dental Specialists.

In the past, the Annual Report focused primarily on the collection of statistical data. Compliance with the Requirements for Recognition of National Certifying Boards for Dental Specialists is more than the submission of statistical data.

Requirements for Recognition of National Certifying Boards for Dental Specialists were revised October 2018. Most revisions were minor except for Operation of Boards-Requirement 4.
Requirements for Recognition of National Certifying Boards for Dental Specialists

Organization of Boards (4 requirements)
Organization of Boards - Requirement 1

- Each Board shall have no less than five or more than 12 voting directors designated on a rotation basis in accordance with a method approved by the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards. Although the Commission does not prescribe a single method for selecting directors of boards, members may not serve for more than a total of nine years. Membership on the board shall be in accordance with a prescribed method endorsed by the sponsoring organization. All board directors shall be diplomates of that board and only the sponsoring organizations of boards may establish additional qualifications if they so desire.

Examples of Evidence to meet Requirement 1:
- A list of current voting directors/officers of the board
- Current copy of the boards bylaws and/or a document outlining board members’ selection process, term length, membership criteria, and diplomate requirement.
Organization of Boards- Requirement 2

• Each Board shall submit in writing to the National Commission of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards a program sufficiently comprehensive in scope to meet the requirements established by the American Dental Association for the operation of a certifying board. This statement should include evidence of sponsorship of the board by a national organization that meets all the elements of Requirement 1 of the *Requirements for Recognition of Dental Specialties*.

Example of Evidence to meet Requirement 2:

– Copy of current Board Bylaws that provides evidence of the certifying boards close working relationship with the sponsoring organization
Organization of Boards- Requirement 3

- Each board shall submit to the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards evidence of adequate financial support to conducts its program certification.

Example of Evidence to meet Requirement 3:
- Previous end of year Financial Statement/Audit Report
Organization of Boards- Requirement 4

• Each board may select suitable consultants or agencies to assist in its operations, such as the preparation and administration of examinations and the evaluation of records and examination of candidates. Consultants who participate in clinical examinations should be diplomates.

• This requirement only applies to certifying boards that outsource administrative functions and/or the development of the examinations.

Examples of Evidence to meet Requirement 4:

– Copy of Bylaws and/or a document describing the process of selecting consultants and/or agencies and the duties these individuals/agencies fulfill for the organization.

– Copy of Annual Report from the individual(s) and/or agency
Requirements for Recognition of National Certifying Boards for Dental Specialists

Operation of Boards (8 requirements)
• Each board shall certify qualified dentists as diplomates only in the special area of dental practice approved by the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards for such certification. No more than one board shall be recognized for the certification of diplomates in a single area of practice.

Examples of Evidence to meet Requirement 1:
- Mission Statement
- Copy of Bylaws and/or documentation providing evidence that it is only certifying qualified dentists as diplomates
Operation of Boards- Requirement 2

• Each board, except by waiver of the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards, shall give at least one examination in each calendar year and shall announce such examination at least six months in advance.

Examples of Evidence to meet Requirement 2:

– Copy of announcement of examination(s) date/place posted by the certifying board
– Written description of where the information is posted
  or
– Screen shot of certifying boards website showing posting
Operation of Boards- Requirement 3

• Each board shall maintain a current list of its diplomates.

Examples of Evidence to meet Requirement 3:
  – Roster of current diplomates
Operation of Boards- Requirement 4

Each board shall submit annually to the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards data relative to its financial operations, applicant admission procedures, and examination content and results. Examination procedures and results should follow the Standards for Educational Psychological Testing, including validity and reliability evidence. A diplomate, may upon request, obtain a copy of the annual technical and financial reports of the board.

Examples of Evidence to meet Requirement 4:

- Candidate Brochure/Guidelines/Procedures for Certification Examination
- Policy and/or public statements demonstrating diplomates ability, upon written request on information of the boards annual financial and technical reports
  - Could simply state this is information is available upon written request
Examples of Evidence for Requirement 4

- Current Examination Content, Guidelines and Procedures, if Candidate Guide is not submitted
  - How many parts to the examination
  - Description of the examination sections
  - Examination content outline
  - Examination policies and procedures
  - Eligibility and maintenance requirements
Examples of Evidence for Requirement 4 cont:

• Validity and Reliability Evidence
  – Examination Technical Report, should include
    • Content, criterion and construct validity
    • Evidence the examination is operating as intended
    • Evidence there are minimal errors and measures the examinees true score
    • Describing the statistical analysis that is completed on the scores

Please do not submit raw data. Instead provide a summary of the raw data

• Test Development and Revision
  – Explain the process for writing, evaluating and revising the examination
  – Monitoring of content, quality, difficulty of the questions
  – Expert input into the criterion standard that candidates are measured against
  – Maintenance of a pool of examinations/questions
Examples of Evidence for Requirement 4 cont:

- **Test Administration, Scoring and Reporting**
  - Cut score (pass/fail) and how it is determined and if the results are checked for consistency
  - Develop and implement procedures for ensuring confidentiality of scores
  - Procedures, materials and guidelines for scoring examinations for accuracy
  - Calibration of examiners
  - Rational, procedures and evidence for setting performance standards for establishing passing scores

- **Policy on Fairness in Testing and Test Use**
  - Description of how the exam content was selected
  - Indicate what the exam measures
  - Provide guidance on the level skill, knowledge and training required to take the exam
  - Provide evidence that the technical quality (validity and reliability) meets its intended purpose
  - Sample questions

Examples of Evidence for Requirement 4 cont

• Policy on Rights and Responsibilities of Test Takers
  – Review organization website for information
  – Provide appropriate documentation
  – Register for the examination
  – Review the Guidelines for Certification
  – Review any materials provided by the organizations
  – Be prepared to respond to questions regarding treatment and gamut of current discipline specific knowledge

• Policy on Testing Individuals of Diverse Linguistic Backgrounds
  – Simple statement that the test is conducted in English

• Policy on Testing Individuals with Disabilities
  – Accommodations must be submitted in writing with proof of professional evaluation
  – Requests the organization can accommodate (extra time, wheelchair accessible, distraction free rooms, physical prompts for hearing impaired)
Operation of Boards- Requirement 5

• Each board shall encourage its diplomates to engage in lifelong learning and continuous quality improvement

Examples of Evidence to meet Requirement 5:
  – Recertification/Certification Maintenance Policies
  – Continuing Education Policies

In March 2020, National Commission sent communication to CDEL requesting this requirement be revised. Instead of “encouraging” lifelong learning and continuous quality improvement it should be required.
Operation of Boards- Requirement 6

• Each board shall provide periodically to the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards evidence of its examination and certification of a significant number of additional dentists in order to warrant its continuing approval by the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards.

Example of Evidence to meet Requirement 6:
  - Completion of statistical forms in survey
Operation of Boards- Requirement 7

• Each board shall bear full responsibility for the conduct of its program, the evaluation of the qualifications and competence of those it certifies as diplomates, and the issuance of certificates.

Examples of Evidence to meet Requirement 7:

– Copy of incorporation certificate
  or
– Copy of Bylaws showing organization is an independent entity that has the authority to act autonomously as the certification body
Operation of Boards- Requirement 8

- Each board shall require an annual registration fee from each of its diplomates intended to assist in supporting financially the continued program of the board.

Examples of Evidence to meet Requirement 8:
  - Copy of Financial Statement and fee schedule
Requirements for Recognition of National Certifying Boards for Dental Specialists

Certification Requirements (3 requirements)
Certification Requirements-Requirement 1

• Each board shall require, for eligibility for certification as a diplomate, the successful completion of an advanced education program accredited by the Commission on Dental Accreditation of two or more academic years in length, as specified by the Commission.

• Although desirable, the period of advanced study need not be continuous, nor completed within successive calendar years. An advanced educational program equivalent to two academic years in length, successfully completed on a part-time basis over an extended period of time, as a graduated sequence of educational experience not exceeding four calendar years, may be considered acceptable in satisfying this requirement. Short continuation and refresher courses and teaching experience in specialty departments in dental schools will not be accepted in meeting any portion of this requirement.

• Each board may establish an exception to the qualification requirement of completion of an advanced specialty education program accredited by the Commission on Dental Accreditation for the unique candidate who has not met this requirement per se, but can demonstrate to the satisfaction of the certifying board, equivalent advanced specialty education. A certifying board must petition the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and certifying boards for permission to establish such a policy.

Example of Evidence to meet Requirement 1:
• Eligibility Requirements/Pathways
Certification Requirements-Requirement 2

- Each board shall establish its minimum requirements for years of practice in the area for which it grants certificates. The years of advanced education in this area may be accepted toward fulfillment of this requirement.

Example of Evidence to meet Requirement 2:
- Eligibility Requirements/Pathways
Certification Requirements-Requirement 3

• Each board, in cooperation with its sponsoring organization, shall prepare and publicize its recommendations on the educational program and experience requirements which candidates will be expected to meet.

Examples of Evidence to meet Requirement 3:

– Comments made to Commission on Dental Accreditation on accreditation standards revisions

– Evidence that certifying board and sponsoring organization meet on a regular basis to review educational program standards and experiential requirements