

1 **AMERICAN DENTAL ASSOCIATION**
2 **MINUTES OF THE COUNCIL ON MEMBERSHIP**

3 **June 16-17, 2023**

4 **CALL TO ORDER**

5 The June 16-17, 2023 Council on Membership (CM or Council) meeting was called to order by Council
6 Chair, Dr. Nipa Thakkar, at 8:00 a.m. CDT of ADA Headquarters in Chicago, IL. The meeting was
7 convened in the Hillenbrand Auditorium on the 2nd Floor on June 16 and in the Boardroom on the 22nd
8 Floor on June 17.

9 **ROLL CALL**

10 **The following members of the Council were present for all or part of the meeting:** Drs. Nipa
11 Thakkar, chair; Aruna Rao, vice chair; Ensy Atarod; Wallace Bellamy; Renuka Bijoor; Giancarlo
12 Ghisalberti, new dentist member; Keith Jones; Nathaniel Kunzman; Janis Moriarty; Robin Nguyen; Cate
13 Nelson; Meenal Patel; Mehrdad Safavian; Susan Sergie; Kerri Simpson (via video conference); Thomas
14 Sniscak; Rhoda Sword; Terri Tiersky

15 Dr. George Shepley, ADA President; Dr. Linda Edgar, ADA President-Elect and Dr. Michele Tulak-
16 Gorecki, Board of Trustees' liaison to the Council were also in attendance.

17 **Not present for the meeting:** Ms. Justina Anigbo, ASDA Consultant

18 **Council staff members present:** Ms. Sandy Eitel, senior director, Council on Membership; Ms. Nicole
19 Subick, manager, Council on Membership; Wendy J. Wils, Esq., deputy general counsel, Division of
20 Legal Affairs

21 **Staff members present for all or part of the meeting were:** Dr. Ray Cohlma, executive director, Ms.
22 April Kates-Ellison, chief client services & tripartite relations officer, Member & Client Services; Ms. Cathy
23 Haibach, senior manager, Dental Service Organization & Group Practice Membership

24
25 **PRELIMINARY**

26 The Chair referenced the ADA Disclosure Policy on Conflict of Interests printed in the agenda and asked
27 for disclosures at the appropriate time. The Chair also reminded Council members of the ADA
28 Confidentiality Policy and referenced the Confidentiality Statement printed in the agenda.

29 **Adoption of Agenda and Consent Calendar:** The Council approved the agenda as presented, with the
30 stipulation that the chair could change the order of the agenda to expedite the business of the Council.
31 The Consent Calendar was also approved as presented.

32 **4/2023. Resolved,** that the Council on Membership approve the agenda for its June 2023
33 meeting as presented.

34 **5/2023. Resolved,** that the following informational report be filed and the following resolution
35 contained on the consent calendar be approved:

36 **ITEM 17: ASDA REPORT**

37 **Approval of the March 2023 Council on Membership Meeting Minutes:**

38 **6/2023. Resolved,** that the Council on Membership approve its March 2023 meeting minutes.

39 **2023-2024 Chair and Vice Chair Elections:** The Council elected Dr. Nipa Thakkar (District 3) as chair
40 and elected Dr. Ensy Atarod (District 15) as vice chair for the 2023-2024 term.

44

OPENING REPORTS

45 **Council Chair:** Dr. Nipa Thakkar welcomed the Council and reminded the group of the leadership
46 concept that she previously presented at the March 2023 meeting regarding “airplane emergency exit row
47 seating requirements.” As ADA leaders, Council members should be ready, willing, and able to commit to
48 the ADA and everything it stands for, and to provide leadership with the support they need.

49 **ADA President:** Dr. George Shepley, addressed the Council and provided opening remarks, sharing
50 updates from the recent Board of Trustees meeting and the conversations regarding the California Dental
51 Association Board’s proposal for optional ADA membership.

52 **Board Liaison:** Dr. Michele Tulak-Gorecki greeted the Council and reiterated the importance and
53 strength of the tripartite and moving membership forward.

54 **Executive Director:** Dr. Ray Cohlmia welcomed the Council and provided an update on the ADA’s five
55 customer groups and how they’re working together to reimagine the future of the ADA.

56 **Chief Client Services & Tripartite Relations Officer, Member and Client Services:** Ms. April Kates-
57 Ellison updated the Council on the focused work within the tripartite, including onboarding a substantial
58 number of new state executive directors, preparing for Conference Week in July 2023, and continuing
59 work with the newly established tripartite partnership principles.

60

61

STRATEGIC DISCUSSION

62 **District Lightning Round:** Council members were asked to further engage their informal membership
63 district cabinets for group discussion. These cabinets were formed earlier in the year by each Council
64 member and are comprised of personal contacts that can be tapped throughout the year to provide input
65 and insight on discussion topics. During a lightning round, Council members shared responses they
66 received from the cabinets on the following questions/topics:

- 67 1. Early career/new graduate strategies that are being implemented within their districts
- 68 2. The most effective and ineffective ADA communications
- 69 3. Any district resolutions for this year’s HOD

70

71 **Review and Discussion of Council Responsibilities:** Through conversations in small breakouts,
72 groups identified roles and responsibilities of the Council. Responses were collected and discussed as a
73 full Council, and a workgroup was established to continue discussion and development of the
74 responsibilities and report back to the full Council.

75

76

SUBCOMMITTEE AND JOINT ACTION TEAM REPORTS

77 **Subcommittee on Membership Policy and Trends:** Dr. Kerri Simpson, Chair of the Subcommittee on
78 Membership Policy and Trends, led discussions and voting on the 22 policies up for review per House
79 Resolution 170H-2012, Regular Comprehensive Policy Review. The Council adopted the following
80 resolutions:

81 **7/2023. Resolved,** that the Subcommittee on Membership Policy and Trends of the Council on
82 Membership recommend that the following policies be maintained as written:

- 83 • Financial Hardship Dues Waivers (*Trans.*2002:381; 2018:300)
- 84 • Registration Fees for Members (*Trans.*1989:537)
- 85 • Involvement of Students in Society Activities (*Trans.*1979:649)
- 86 • Dues Exemption for Active-Duty Members (*Trans.*2004:297, 335; 2015:296)
- 87 • Parallel Membership Categories (*Trans.*2008:482; 2018:299)
- 88 • Administrative Process for Transferring Members (*Trans.*2001:422)
- 89 • Promoting the Value of Tripartite Dentistry (*Trans.*1995:606; 2013:365)
- 90 • Utilization of Tripartite Resources (*Trans.*1995:604; 2018:300)

- 91 • Collaboration with Other Organizations to Support ADA Recruitment and Retention
- 92 Activities (*Trans.*1989:540; 1997:659; 2018:301)
- 93 • Dental Organization Membership Contingent on ADA Membership (*Trans.*1985:610;
- 94 1996:667)
- 95 • Dentists Retired From Federal Service (*Trans.*1963:285; 1996:671)
- 96 • Streamlining Membership Category Transfers (*Trans.*2001:426; 2018:300) [pending
- 97 secondary review]
- 98 • Long-Term Dues Waivers (*Trans.*2002:384)
- 99 • Student Membership (*Trans.*1977:957; 1996:673; 2015:291)
- 100 • Tripartite Membership Application Procedures (*Trans.*1998:685; 2014:524; 2018:299)
- 101 • Transfer Nonrenews (*Trans.*1995:605; 2018:299)
- 102 • Requirement for Membership Maintenance in ADA for Fellows of the American College of
- 103 Dentists, the USA Section of the International College of Dentists and the Pierre
- 104 Fauchard Academy (*Trans.*1989:538; 2012:512)
- 105

106 **8/2023. Resolved**, that the ADA policy, Application Process for Direct ADA Membership
 107 (*Trans.*1989:539), be amended as follows (additions are underscored; deletions are ~~stricken~~):

108 **Resolved**, that the American Dental Association verify eligibility of direct members on an
 109 annual basis and urge constituent societies to assist in the verification of employment status
 110 of direct members, and be it further

111 **Resolved**, that the American Dental Association encourage constituent and component
 112 societies to promote tripartite membership to ADA direct member ~~federally employed~~ dentists
 113 when appropriate.

114

115 **9/2023. Resolved**, that the ADA policy Nonmember Utilization of ADA Member Benefits
 116 (*Trans.*1990:532), be amended as follows (additions are underscored; deletions are ~~stricken~~):

117 **Resolved**, that the ADA Board of Trustees review the policies pertaining to nonmember
 118 utilization of ADA member benefits and take whatever action is necessary to ~~insure~~ ensure
 119 that a nonmember cannot utilize ADA member benefits to imply membership and/or promote
 120 their practice to the public, and be it further

121 **Resolved**, that the ~~pricing differential for ADA products and/or services between members~~
 122 ~~and nonmembers be at the maximum the law will allow in order to increase the tangible~~
 123 ~~benefits of being a member of the ADA~~ member-nonmember price differential should
 124 demonstrate and highlight the value of ADA membership.

125

126 **10/2023. Resolved**, that the Subcommittee on Membership Policy and Trends of the Council on
 127 Membership recommend that the following policies be rescinded:

- 128 • **Compliance With Civil Rights Laws (*Trans.*1997:666)**
- 129 ○ Explanation for rescinding: In 2023, it is unnecessary for the ADA to urge states to
- 130 follow civil rights laws they should already be adhering to. This policy is also
- 131 redundant with the ADA's Diversity and Inclusion policy (Resolution 69H-2021).
- 132
- 133 • **Differential Charges According to Membership Status (*Trans.*1982:506; 2004:294;**
- 134 **2018:300)**
- 135 ○ Explanation for rescinding: This policy is outdated and redundant with ADA policy,
- 136 Nonmember Utilization of ADA Member Benefits (*Trans.*1990:532)
- 137

- 138 • **Diversity in Association Membership Marketing and Consumer-Related Materials**
 139 **(Trans.1995:606)**
 140 ○ Explanation for rescinding: This policy is redundant with the ADA's Diversity and
 141 Inclusion policy (Resolution 69H-2021).

142 The Council also approved the following recommendations to the Board of Trustees to integrate the
 143 Quarter Year Dues Pilot into ADA's promotional incentives, as well as the recommendations for the 2024
 144 Active Member Promotion segments. Dr. Bellamy did not participate in this discussion and vote.

145 **11/2023. Resolved**, that the Council on Membership recommends to the Board of Trustees,
 146 based on the outcomes of the 15-for-12 pilot, the program be included in the promotional
 147 incentives.

148 **12/2023. Resolved**, that the following non-member segments be approved to receive a one-time
 149 Active Member Promotion incentive of 50% dues reduction in 2024.

- 150 • New Dentists 3 to 10 years out of dental school
 151 • Federal Dental Service Dentists
 152 • Dentists affiliated with a multi-site group practice, including DSOs

153 The Council also received an update from ADA's consulting group on DSO research, value propositions
 154 and membership models.

155 **Subcommittee on Grants and Member Benefits:** Dr. Janis Moriarty, Chair of the Subcommittee on
 156 Grants and Member Benefits, led the discussion and vote on the proposed resolution to the Board of
 157 Trustees to investigate a recognition program for members' philanthropic efforts. The following proposed
 158 resolution was adopted:

159 **13/2023. Resolved**, that the Council on Membership urges the Board of Trustees to ask the
 160 appropriate agency to investigate recognizing dentists who have contributed significant
 161 philanthropic efforts through a member loyalty program category, acknowledging, but not limited
 162 to, their work as dentists to make people healthy. And be it further

163 **Resolved**, that the Council on Membership urges the Board of Trustees to ask the appropriate
 164 agency to create a dynamic database allowing members to post and/or search for volunteer
 165 opportunities available to all members to increase awareness of local, state, national, and global
 166 philanthropic events.

167 **Faculty Joint Action Team:** Dr. Rhoda Sword updated the Council on the Faculty Joint Action Team
 168 (JAT), which is comprised of two members from each of the following councils: Council on Membership,
 169 Council on Scientific Affairs (CSA), and Council on Dental Education and Licensure (CDEL). The JAT was
 170 created this year to identify ways the ADA can provide an easier pathway to ADA membership for dental
 171 school faculty who are foreign trained and non-U.S. licensed, as well as better value for all faculty, who
 172 are the #1 influencer of students. The Council reviewed and discussed a resolution proposed by the JAT
 173 to eliminate the barriers to membership and offer a dues discount to all full-time faculty. The resolution
 174 found in [Appendix 1](#) was approved and will be submitted to the 2023 HOD. Support for the resolution is
 175 also being sought from CSA and CDEL. Dr. Bellamy did not participate in this discussion and vote.

176 **Dues Streamlining:** Ms. Sandy Eitel provided an overview of the history of Dues Streamlining and the
 177 previous actions taken by the Council on Membership that preceded current Council members' terms.
 178 The history is particularly beneficial with the proposed faculty resolution being presented to this year's
 179 House of Delegates. Dr. Bellamy did not participate in this discussion.

180

181

INFORMATIONAL REPORTS

182 **Report of the New Dentist Committee:** Dr. Giancarlo Ghisalberty, New Dentist Committee (NDC)
 183 member, provided the Council with an overview of recent NDC updates including membership growth

184 opportunities, a joint session with the Board of Trustees, new dentist experience at SmileCon and NDC's
185 Town Hall series, *Leadership Leads*.

186 **Farewell to Fourth Years:** As outgoing Council members, Dr. Bellamy, Dr. Nelson, Dr. Patel and Dr.
187 Sniscak, were celebrated and thanked for their dedication and contributions to the Council on
188 Membership during their respective terms.

189

190

NEW BUSINESS

191 **New Business:** No new business was presented to the Council at the June 2023 meeting.

192

193

ADJOURNMENT

194

195 **Adjournment:** The Council adjourned its meeting at noon CDT.

Appendix 1

CM-00. Resolved, that the Council on Membership approves the following proposal on faculty membership for consideration by the 2023 House of Delegates, with a recommendation to vote “yes”:

00. Resolved, that Chapter I. MEMBERSHIP, *Section 20. MEMBERSHIP ELIGIBILITY*, Subsection A. ACTIVE MEMBER, of the ADA *Bylaws* be amended to read as follows (new language underscored, deletions ~~stricken~~):

- A. ACTIVE MEMBER. Any person holding a D.D.S., D.M.D. or equivalent degree* or qualified faculty member** shall be eligible to be an active member of this Association if they meet the following qualifications:
- a. Maintains membership in good standing in this Association as that term is defined in these *Bylaws*; and
 - b. Is licensed and/or registered to practice dentistry where the laws and regulations of a constituent’s jurisdiction require licensure and/or registration in order to be a member of the constituent~~***~~; and
 - c. Is a member in good standing of the constituent and component where the member either resides, or is employed or practices; or if not a member of such constituent and component is:
 1. employed by or is serving on active duty in one of the federal dental services~~****~~ on a full time basis and is not otherwise employed or practicing dentistry within the jurisdiction of a constituent or component; or
 2. employed or practicing dentistry in a country other than the United States and is a graduate of a dental school or a graduate of a training program accredited by the Commission on Dental Accreditation; or
 3. otherwise ineligible for active membership in a constituent or component where the individual resides, is employed, or practices.

An individual qualifying pursuant to subsections c.1 through 3 shall be referred to as a “direct member.”

and be it further

Resolved, that the Chapter I. MEMBERSHIP MATTERS, Subsection B. Dues, Special Assessments and Financial Related Matters, of the Governance and Organizational Manual of the American Dental Association be amended as follows (additions underscored, deletions ~~stricken~~):

- B. Dues, Special Assessments and Related Financial Matters.
1. Dues. Under the ADA *Bylaws*, the House of Delegates has the duty to annually set the dues of active members for the ensuing year. Dues are due and payable on January 1, except where a member has opted to pay dues in installments pursuant to a plan offered by the member’s constituent, in which case, dues are paid according to the plan’s requirements.

The schedule of annual dues for each of the membership categories specified in the ADA *Bylaws* is as

Bylaws footnotes

* As used in these Bylaws, the term “equivalent degree” means a degree that the jurisdiction involved deems sufficient to allow the degree holder to sit for a full and complete dentist’s licensure examination in the jurisdiction without any additional training.

** As used herein, the term “qualified faculty member” means a dentist holding a D.D.S., D.M.D. or a degree in dentistry conferred by a school outside of the United States and who submits annually an affidavit attesting that they are employed by a dental school located in the United States on at least eighty percent (80%) of a full-time equivalent basis.

**** As used herein, the term “constituent” means a dental association organized in a state or territory of the United States or in Washington, D.C. that is chartered by the ADA House of Delegates. The term “component” means a local dental association that may be created within the boundaries of a constituent by the constituent.

***** The term “federal dental services” as used herein shall mean the dental departments of the Air Force, the Army, the Navy, the Public Health Service, the department of Veterans Affairs and other federal agencies.

follows:

a. Active Members.

- i. From degree award through conclusion of the first full year following an award of a D.D.S. or D.M.D. degree: The member is exempt from the payment of dues.
- ii. Second full year following degree award: Fifty percent (50%) of active member dues as set by the House of Delegates pursuant to the *ADA Bylaws*.
- iii. Third full year following degree award and thereafter: One hundred percent (100%) of active member dues as set by the House of Delegates pursuant to the *ADA Bylaws*.

iv. Eligible faculty members* : Fifty percent (50%) of the active member dues as set by the House of Delegates pursuant to the *ADA Bylaws*.

~~iv~~.v. Members becoming active members after July 1, except for those whose membership has lapsed for failure to pay the current year's dues and/or any special assessment, shall pay fifty percent (50%) of any annual dues then in effect. Those members becoming active members after October 1, except for those whose membership has lapsed for failure to pay the current year's dues and/or any special assessment, shall be exempt from the payment of any annual dues then in effect.

2. Special Assessments. Pursuant to the *ADA Bylaws*, the House of Delegates has the power to levy special assessments. Any special assessment for a calendar year is due and payable on January 1, except where a member has opted to pay in installments pursuant to a plan offered by the member's constituent; in which case, the special assessment is paid according to the plan's requirements.

The schedule of special assessment allocation for each of the membership categories specified in the *ADA Bylaws* is as follows:

a. Active Members.

- i. From degree award through conclusion of the first full year following an award of a D.D.S. or D.M.D. degree: the member is exempt from the payment of any special assessment then in effect.
- ii. Second full year following degree award: Fifty percent (50%) of any special assessment then in effect.
- iii. Third full year following degree award and thereafter: One hundred percent (100%) of any special assessment then in effect.

iv. Eligible faculty members*: Fifty percent (50%) of any special assessment then in effect.

~~iv~~ v. On a one-time only basis, those members becoming active members after July 1, except for those whose membership has lapsed for failure to pay the current year's dues and/or any special assessment, shall pay fifty percent (50%) of any special assessment then in effect. On a one-time only basis, those members becoming active members after October 1, except for those whose membership has lapsed for failure to pay the current year's dues and/or any special assessment, shall be exempt from the payment of any special assessment then in effect.

and be it further

Resolved, that Chapter VIII. COUNCILS, Subsection B. Eligibility, of the *Governance and Organizational Manual* of the American Dental Association be amended as follows (new language underscored; deletions stricken):

B. Eligibility.

1. All members of councils must be active, life or retired members in good standing of this Association except as otherwise provided in the *Bylaws* or this *Governance Manual*.
2. No member of a council may serve concurrently as a member of another council or commission.
3. A member shall not be eligible for appointment to another council or commission for a period of two (2) years after completing a previous council or commission appointment, except that a member who serves no more than fifty percent (50%) of their maximum tenure of four (4) one-year terms of council service while they are serving as the nominee of the New Dentist Committee will be exempted from the requirement to wait two years before being eligible to serve on another council.

* As used in the *Governance Manual*, the term "eligible faculty member" is as defined in Chapter I. of the *ADA Bylaws*.

4. The elective and appointive officers and the trustees of this Association shall not serve as members of councils.
5. A member of the Council on Dental Education and Licensure who was selected by the American Association of Dental Boards or the American Dental Education Association but ceases to be an active member of that body may continue as a member of the Council for the balance of that member's term.
6. A member of the Council on Dental Education and Licensure who was selected by the American Dental Education Association but ceases to be a member of the faculty of a member school of that body shall cease to be a member of the Council on Dental Education and Licensure and the President shall declare the position vacant.
7. To be eligible to serve on the Council on Scientific Affairs, the current recipient of the Gold Medal Award for Excellence in Dental Research shall be an active, life or retired member in good standing of this Association if that individual qualifies for membership in the Association.
- 8A. A member of a council who holds a degree in dentistry conferred by a school outside of the United States and who ceases to be employed at a dental school in the United States shall remain eligible to serve on that council for the remainder of the membership year.
