



COMMISSION FOR CONTINUING EDUCATION PROVIDER RECOGNITION AMERICAN DENTAL ASSOCIATION HEADQUARTERS BUILDING, CHICAGO APRIL 6, 2017

Call to Order: Dr. Paul R. Leary, chair, called a regular meeting of the Commission for Continuing Education Provider Recognition (CCEPR) to order on Thursday, April 6, 2017 at 9:06 a.m. in the Executive Conference Room of the ADA Headquarters Building in Chicago.

Roll Call

Commissioners: Dr. Jeffrey D. Bennett, Dr. Hardeep K. Chehal, Dr. Debra Dixon, Dr. Joseph P. Fiorellini, Dr. Barry Hammond, Dr. Mark C. Hutten, Dr. Timothy C. Kirkpatrick, Dr. Mitchell J. Lipp, Dr. Susan Reed, Dr. Nancy R. Rosenthal, and Dr. Ann Steiner were present.

In addition, Dr. Kenneth McDougall, Tenth District Trustee, Board of Trustees liaison, attended the meeting.

Absent: Dr. Brian A. Beitel, Dr. Bertram Hughes, Dr. Augusto Cesar Garcia-Aguirre, and Mr. Conor McNulty were not in attendance.

Commission staff: Ms. Mary Borysewicz, director; Mr. Alejandro Lerma, coordinator.

ADA staff (for all or portions of the meeting): The following ADA staff members attended all or portions of the meeting: Dr. Anthony J. Ziebert, senior vice president, Education/Professional Affairs; Ms. Paula Tironi, Esq., senior associate general counsel; Mr. Ricky Dixon, senior director, Membership Planning and Data Analytics, and Dr. Kathleen O'Loughlin, executive director.

Preliminary Business

Adoption of Agenda: The Commission approved the agenda and authorized the chair to alter the order of agenda items as necessary to expedite business.

Disclosure of Relationships: Dr. Leary directed the Commission's attention to the ADA Conflict of Interest Policy and reminded commissioners of their obligation to make disclosures as appropriate. Commissioners disclosed the following affiliations during the course of the meeting:

Table with 2 columns: Commission Member, Disclosed the following affiliation. Rows include Dr. Debra Dixon (Faculty position at Southern Illinois University School of Dental Medicine), Dr. Mark Hutten (Associate Fellow of American Academy of Maxillofacial Prosthetics), Dr. Joseph Fiorellini (Appointed to CCEPR by American Academy of Periodontology), and Dr. Joseph Fiorellini (Funding from Zimmer Biomet).

Fiduciary Duty and Other Legal Topics: Ms. Paula Tironi gave a short presentation regarding topics such as fiduciary duty and conflicts of interest.

Minutes of the September 2016 CCEPR Meeting and Recognition Actions Taken via Email Ballot:

Minutes of the Commission's March 31-April 1, 2016 meeting, previously approved by the Commission via email ballot, were acknowledged as part of the Commission's official record. In addition, the Commission's December 2016 CERP Recognition Actions (Appendix 1), and January 2017 CERP Recognition Actions (Appendix 2), previously approved by the Commission via email ballot, were acknowledged as part of the Commission's official record. The Commission's actions are noted in Appendices 1 and 2, a confidential section of these minutes.

Consent Agenda: A consent calendar was prepared to expedite the business of the Commission. Dr. Leary reminded Commission members that any report, recommendation or resolution could be removed from the consent calendar for discussion. The following reports were accepted by the Commission on consent.

- 2017 Provider Workshop
- Appointments to the Commission
- Future Meeting Dates
- Providers Requesting Extension of Recognition Term
- Providers Voluntarily Discontinuing
- Results of Spring 2017 CERP Applicant Survey
- CERP Participation and Approval Data

Reports to the Commission

ADA Board of Trustees Liaison Remarks: Dr. McDougall noted that in his role as liaison, he will serve to convey information to the Board regarding Commission activities, and provide updates on Board initiatives to the Commission. Dr. McDougall reported that at a recent meeting the Board approved moving forward with the development of an Objective Structured Clinical Examination (OSCE) for dental licensure. The exam will be marketed to state licensing agencies as an alternative to current clinical licensure exams that involve patients. The Board has also retained a consulting firm to review the ADA's overall business plan.

ADA Executive Director Remarks: Dr. O'Loughlin reported on the ADA's overall performance in 2016, noting that membership and financial targets for the year were met. However, with membership market share projected to decline in future years, the ADA will continue to focus on initiatives to recruit and retain members, and increase non-dues revenues to support long-term sustainability. A consulting firm is assessing the ADA's business model, and will make recommendations regarding services or functions the ADA may wish to emphasize that meet dentists' needs. The ADA is also monitoring trends in dental care utilization and spending, and has launched a campaign to drive utilization of dental services.

Commission Business

CCEPR 2018 Budget: The Commission reviewed a draft of the 2018 CCEPR budget prepared by staff. The budget proposes increasing 2018 CERP application fees 3% to cover projected increases in operating expenses. No change was proposed to the CERP provider annual fee. The Commission's draft budget will be incorporated into the ADA budget for approval by the ADA House of Delegates in October. The Commission also noted that in 2016, revenue from CERP provider fees covered direct program costs, including salaries and meeting expenses. Indirect expenses for items such as shared support services have not traditionally been factored into CCEPR's budget. In order to obtain a more accurate assessment of the total cost to administer ADA CERP and Commission business, and to develop appropriate financial plans going forward, the Commission requested staff to work with the ADA budget and finance department to calculate indirect costs in future budgets.

Action: The Commission approves a 3% increase to ADA CERP application fees in 2018 to cover projected increases in operating costs, as indicated in the tables below.

Table 1. ADA CERP Provider Fees—United States and Canada

Fee Type	2018
New application	\$850
Reapplication	\$710
Extension	\$330*
Reconsideration	\$850
Appeal	\$1100
Annual fee	\$435*

Table 2. ADA CERP Provider Fees—International

Fee Type	2018
Pre-application fee (flat fee)	\$560
New application--Tier 1	\$890
New application--Tier 2	\$1,340
New application--Tier 3	\$3,340
Reapplication--Tier 1	\$710
Reapplication--Tier 2	\$1,070
Reapplication--Tier 3	\$2,670
Annual fee—Tier 1	\$540*
Annual fee—Tier 2	\$1,080*
Annual fee—Tier 3	\$3,455*

* No change from 2017.

ADA CERP Database and Online Application Process Update: Dr. Ziebert reported that the ADA and Aptify, the developer of the membership database software licensed by the ADA, are engaged in discussions regarding the development of an online solution for CODA and CCEPR accreditation processes, including application, review and reporting functions. A final agreement, defined scope of work and basic architecture are expected to be in place by the third quarter of 2017, with customized development of CODA and CERP functions continuing into 2018. CCEPR and ADA IT staff are simultaneously in the process of enhancing the existing CERP provider database in order to streamline operations, and to prepare to transition data to Aptify.

CCEPR Communication and Marketing Update: The Commission reviewed a summary of communications and outreach tactics since its last meeting in September 2016, and those planned for the remainder of 2017. To minimize costs, the Commission relies primarily on electronic communications with CERP recognized providers and other ADA communication outlets, such as ADA News, as opportunities are available. In that vein, the Commission discussed submitting a letter to the editor of the Journal of the American Dental Association in response to a recent editorial in that publication regarding continuing dental education. The Commission believes it is important to inform dental professionals of the role ADA CERP recognition fills in helping to identify quality CE.

2017 CERP Provider Workshop: The Commission received information on the annual educational workshop for CE providers to be held October 19 in conjunction with ADA 2017, America’s Dental Meeting, in Atlanta (consent calendar).

Appointments to the Commission: The Commission reviewed information on the Commissioners whose terms will end at the American Dental Association’s (ADA) 2017 Meeting and their replacements, whose terms will begin with the close of the ADA House of Delegates meeting in October 2017, as listed below (consent calendar item).

<u>Commissioners Completing Terms</u>	<u>Appointing Organization</u>	<u>New Appointments (2017-2021)</u>
Dr. Hardeep K. Chehal	AAOMP	Dr. Elizabeth A. Bilodeau
Dr. Brian A. Beitel	AAPD	Dr. Monica H. Cipes
Dr. Timothy C. Kirkpatrick	AAE	Dr. Karl Keiser
Dr. Paul Leary	ADA	TBA*
Dr. Ann Steiner	ADA	TBA*

**Appointments to be confirmed October 2017 by ADA House of Delegates.*

Committee Appointments: To facilitate the Commission’s work in the coming year, the chair will appoint members to serve on several committees. Committees in 2017 will include the standing Complaints Committee, to be chaired by Dr. Timothy Kirkpatrick. Other committees will include a committee to monitor the Commission’s strategic plan, a CERP Standards review committee, and an ad hoc committee to review the CERP Eligibility Criteria, as discussed in a separate report.

Future Meeting Dates: The Commission received an informational report listing the Commission’s next meeting dates which are scheduled for October 12-13, 2017, April 12-13, 2018, and October 4-5, 2018 (consent calendar).

Strategic Plan: At its September 2016 meeting, the Commission adopted mission, vision, and values statements to guide future Commission activities and identified three priorities to advance the mission over the next four years. A draft strategic plan identifying measurable objectives supporting each of the priority goals was prepared by staff in consultation with the chair and vice chair. Through a facilitated discussion, the Commission reviewed and modified the proposed plan, focusing the goals and objectives on initiatives currently underway, such as the revision of the CERP Standards, and efforts to improve operational efficiencies through technology enhancements. Staff will develop a roadmap and a committee will be appointed to monitor the plan’s progress.

Action: The Commission adopts the CCEPR Strategic Plan 2017-2020 set forth in Appendix 3.

ADA CERP Standards, Policies and Procedures

Standards Revision Update: Dr. Leary reported that subcommittee work on revising the standards would resume after the Commission’s April meeting, with the goal of presenting drafts of 3-4 of the six simplified standards for the Commission’s review at its October meeting. The Commission noted that an editorial in the April 2017 edition of the Journal of the American Dental Association addressed the challenges dental professionals face in identifying quality continuing education. The Commission expressed the view that the article underscores the importance of ensuring that CERP standards establish guidelines for the development of CE activities that address learners’ real educational needs, are evidence based and not commercial. It was suggested that to further support this concept, the Commission at some future time may wish to consider developing a process for approving individual courses.

CERP Eligibility Criteria—Commercial Entities: The Commission discussed inquiries questioning whether commercial entities, defined by the CERP Glossary as “any entity producing, marketing, re-selling or distributing health care goods or services consumed by, or used on, patients,” can meet CERP requirements for producing CE content that is free from commercial bias. The Commission noted that this issue was previously considered by the ADA Council on Dental Education and Licensure and its CERP Committee. The Commission discussed whether the issue should be reconsidered, noting that the possibility for commercialism in CE continues to exist, and the Commission’s ability to monitor this is limited. The Commission also noted that several accrediting agencies for continuing education in other health professions do not consider commercial entities eligible for accreditation. At the same time, the Commission believed it has limited information as to the extent of commercialism in continuing dental education, the degree to which it is problematic, or whether certain categories of CE providers should be excluded from participating in ADA CERP due to potential conflicts of interest, even though they may provide useful educational programs. A committee was appointed to review current approaches to managing commercial conflicts of interest in healthcare education, assess whether any changes to the CERP Eligibility Criteria may be appropriate, and to report its recommendations to the Commission in October.

Action: The Commission appoints a subcommittee to research CERP Eligibility Criteria with respect to commercial entities and, if appropriate, make a recommendation as to changes to the criteria, with a report to the Commission at its meeting in October 2017.

Extended Approval Process (EAP): Dr. Fiorellini reported on current participation in the CERP Extended Approval Process, which allows state dental societies and ADA recognized specialty organizations that have been granted CERP recognition to extend recognition to their local societies through a review and approval process. Participation in EAP is voluntary. For the May 2017–June 2018 approval period, 15 CERP approved providers (four specialty societies and 11 state societies) report that they will be extending approval to a total of 104 component societies. The list of EAP approved providers is posted on ADA.org/CERP.

The Commission also considered revisions to the EAP Guidelines to clarify which providers are eligible for extended approval. The Commission agreed that the intent of the EAP was to permit ADA state dental societies and the sponsoring organizations of the ADA recognized dental specialties to extend ADA CERP recognition to eligible societies under their jurisdiction, including district, regional, component and local membership associations. Accordingly, the Commission took action to revise the EAP Guidelines to explicitly state this.

Action: The Commission approves revisions to the CERP Extended Approval Process (EAP) Guidelines, as shown in Appendix 4.

Miscellaneous

2017 ADA House of Delegates Resolutions: Dr. Nancy Rosenthal volunteered to monitor resolutions submitted to the 2017 ADA House of Delegates related to education and ADA governance, and to report to the Commission at or prior to the Commission’s next meeting on any resolutions that may be relevant to CCEPR. Board reports and resolutions submitted to the 2017 ADA House of Delegates will be posted on ADA.org in August.

Dental Specialty Associations November 2016 Letter: The Commission reviewed as an informational item correspondence between several dental specialty societies and the ADA regarding the societies’ concerns related to certain types of CE activities.

AAOMR November 2016 Letter: The Commission reviewed as an informational item correspondence between the American Academy of Oral and Maxillofacial Radiology and the ADA regarding a CE activity held during the ADA's 2016 annual meeting.

ADA CERP Recognition Actions

Spring 2017 Recognition Actions: The Commission considered 10 new applications for recognition, 38 applications for continued recognition, 19 progress reports and four reports of substantive change. The Commission granted recognition or continued recognition to a total of 45 providers of continuing dental education, including 9 new applicants. Three providers received notification of the Commission's intent to withdraw recognition for failure to meet program requirements unless improvements are documented by a specified date. The Commission discontinued recognition of nine providers at the request of the providers. Including the Commission's April 2017 actions on recognition, 450 CE providers are currently ADA CERP recognized. The Commission also approved one Pre-Application Eligibility Survey from an international provider. Individual recognition actions are noted in Appendix 5, which is a confidential section of these minutes. The official list of ADA CERP recognized providers is published at ADA.org/CCEPR.

Action: The Commission grants recognition or continued recognition to a total of 45 providers of continuing dental education. The Commission's April 2017 actions regarding ADA CERP recognition are summarized in Appendix 5.

Providers Requesting Extension of Recognition Term: The Commission received a report listing providers that requested and were granted a six-month extension to their recognition term and corresponding extension of the deadline for submitting an application for continued recognition in accordance with CERP procedures (consent calendar item).

Providers Voluntarily Discontinuing: The Commission received a report listing nine providers that have notified the Commission that they will be discontinuing participation in ADA CERP (consent calendar item).

Results of Spring 2017 CERP Applicant Survey: The Commission received an informational report summarizing survey results from providers submitting applications each cycle (consent calendar item).

CERP Participation and Approval Data: The Commission received an informational report tracking annual data on program participation, submission types and acceptance rates (consent calendar item).

Attorney-Client Session: An attorney-client session of the Commission was held on Thursday, April 6, 2017, in the Executive Conference Room of the ADA Headquarters Building, Chicago. Those in attendance included the members of the Commission, the director, and senior associate general counsel.

Adjournment: 5:16 pm, Thursday, April 6, 2017.