



COMMISSION FOR  
CONTINUING EDUCATION  
PROVIDER RECOGNITION

**COMMISSION FOR CONTINUING EDUCATION PROVIDER RECOGNITION  
AMERICAN DENTAL ASSOCIATION  
HEADQUARTERS BUILDING, CHICAGO  
SEPTEMBER 29-30, 2016**

**Call to Order:** Dr. Paul R. Leary, chair, called a regular meeting of the Commission for Continuing Education Provider Recognition (CCEPR) to order on Thursday, September 29, 2016 at 8:38 a.m. in the Executive Conference Room of the ADA Headquarters Building in Chicago.

**Roll Call**

**Commissioners:** Dr. Brian A. Beitel, Dr. Jeffrey D. Bennett, Dr. Hardeep K. Chehal, Dr. Debra Dixon, Dr. Joseph P. Fiorellini, Dr. Barry Hammond, Dr. Augusto Cesar Garcia-Aguirre, Dr. Mark C. Hutten, Dr. Timothy C. Kirkpatrick, Dr. Mitchell J. Lipp, Dr. Eugene J. McGuire, Dr. Nancy R. Rosenthal, Dr. Ann Steiner, and Dr. Mary A. Tavares were present.

In addition, Dr. Judith Fisch, First District Trustee, Board of Trustees liaison, attended both days of the meeting.

**Absent:** Mr. Conor McNulty was not able to attend the meeting.

**Commission staff:** Ms. Mary Borysewicz, director.

**ADA staff (for all or portions of the meeting):** The following ADA staff members attended all or portions of the meeting: Dr. Anthony J. Ziebert, senior vice president, Education/Professional Affairs; Ms. Paula Tironi, Esq., senior associate general counsel; Ms. Cathryn Albrecht, senior associate general counsel; Mr. Ricky Dixon, senior director, Membership Planning and Data Analytics, and Dr. Kathleen O'Loughlin, executive director.

**Guests of the Commission:** Incoming CCEPR commission member Dr. Susan Reed (2016-2020) attended the meeting as an observer.

**CE Provider Appearance:** Representatives of a recognized CE provider made a personal appearance before the Commission to present information. Information about the appearance and Commission action is in the confidential portion of these minutes.

**Preliminary Business**

**Adoption of Agenda and Disclosure of Relationships:** The Commission approved the agenda and authorized the chair to alter the order of agenda items as necessary to expedite business.

Dr. Leary directed the Commission's attention to the ADA Conflict of Interest Policy and reminded commissioners of their obligation to make disclosures as appropriate. During the course of the meeting, as appropriate, the following affiliations were disclosed:

Dr. Jeffrey Bennett: American College of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgeons (treasurer); Indiana University School of Dentistry (faculty)

Dr. Augusto Cesar Garcia-Aguirre: Colegio de Cirujanos Dentistas de Puerto Rico (member); The Ohio State University, College of Dentistry (faculty); University of Puerto Rico, School of Dental Medicine (faculty)

Dr. Mark Hutten: Prosthodontic Forum (past director)

Dr. Timothy Kirkpatrick: American Association of Endodontists (member)

Dr. Eugene McGuire: Temple University Kornberg School of Dentistry (faculty); American Board of Pediatric Dentistry (member)

**Fiduciary Duty and Other Legal Topics:** Ms. Paula Tironi gave a short presentation regarding topics such as fiduciary duty and conflicts of interest. The Commission was also reminded of the CERP Confidentiality Policy.

**ADA Code of Professional Conduct and Prohibition Against Harassment:** Ms. Albrecht reviewed the ADA Professional Conduct Policy.

**Minutes of the March 2016 CCEPR Meeting:** Minutes of the Commission's March 31-April 1, 2016 meeting were previously approved by the Commission via email ballot and were acknowledged as part of the Commission's official record.

**Consent Agenda:** A consent calendar was prepared to expedite the business of the Commission. Dr. Leary reminded Commission members that any report, recommendation or resolution could be removed from the consent calendar for discussion.

The following members recused themselves from the vote on the consent calendar for reasons related to specific items, which are recorded in the confidential section of these minutes: Dr. Jeffrey Bennett, Dr. Augusto Cesar Garcia Aguirre, Dr. Mark Hutten, Dr. Timothy Kirkpatrick, and Dr. Eugene McGuire.

The following reports in their entirety, including recommendations, were placed on the consent calendar and adopted without objection as presented:

- Providers Requesting Extension of Recognition Term
- Providers Voluntarily Discontinuing
- Results of Fall 2016 CERP Applicant Survey
- CERP Participation and Approval Data
- Appointments to the Commission
- Future Meeting Dates

### **Reports to the Commission**

**ADA Executive Director Remarks:** Dr. O'Loughlin updated the Commission on ADA priorities for the next year to grow membership and increase non-dues revenues to support the Association's long-term sustainability. Dr. O'Loughlin also highlighted ongoing ADA initiatives, including proposed revisions to the ADA sedation and anesthesia guidelines, and outreach to state boards of dentistry to encourage expanded acceptance of multiple licensure exams to better support portability of licensure.

**ADA Board of Trustees Liaison Remarks:** Dr. Fisch updated the Commission on Board of Trustees activities, noting that the Board was in the process of transmitting the second set of resolutions to the ADA House of Delegates for consideration at its 2016 meeting. Dr. Fisch expressed her appreciation to the Commission for its important work to support the profession by establishing standards and assessing providers of continuing dental education.

### **ADA CERP Standards, Policies and Procedures**

**Standards Revision Subcommittee Report:** In 2015 the Commission initiated a comprehensive review of the CERP Recognition Standards, in order to help ensure that the Standards continue to establish relevant criteria for quality continuing dental education (CE). A Subcommittee was appointed to conduct the process and recommend revisions to the Commission. Dr. Leary reported that the Subcommittee has undertaken a first round of revisions to the CERP Standards. The goal of the initial round of revisions was

to consolidate the Standards to reflect the core functions of CE providers and to eliminate redundant and overly-prescriptive criteria. The next phase of revisions will include assessment of the criteria for relevance to a provider's ability to develop continuing education that addresses professional educational needs, is scientifically sound, non-commercial, and that supports improvements in oral health care. Input on the validity and relevance of the current Standards was obtained from stakeholders through a call for comments and a validity and reliability survey conducted in 2015 and 2016. The Commission noted that it will be important that the revised standards are flexible enough to embrace new learning modalities and formats of continuing professional development, an increase in the number of clinically based courses in which patients are treated, and the growing importance of evaluating the effectiveness and outcomes of continuing education. The Subcommittee's next round of assessment and revision is planned for the fourth quarter of 2016 and first quarter of 2017. The Subcommittee will present draft revisions for consideration at the Commission's April 2017 meeting. At that time, the Commission may direct that the draft of the revised Standards be circulated to the communities of interest for comment, or may direct the Subcommittee to propose further revisions

### **ADA CERP Recognition Actions**

**Fall 2016 Recognition Actions:** The Commission considered 12 new applications for recognition, 69 applications for continued recognition, seven progress reports and one request for reconsideration of intent to withdraw. The Commission granted recognition or continued recognition to a total of 78 providers of continuing dental education, including 9 new applicants. Recognition was withdrawn from one provider for failure to meet program requirements. The Commission discontinued recognition of three providers at the request of the providers. Including the Commission's September 2016 actions on recognition, 450 CE providers are ADA CERP recognized. The Commission also approved three Pre-Application Eligibility Surveys from international providers. Individual recognition actions are noted in Appendix 1, which is a confidential section of these minutes. The official list of ADA CERP recognized providers is published at [ADA.org/CCEPR](http://ADA.org/CCEPR).

**Action:** The Commission grants recognition or continued recognition to a total of 78 providers of continuing dental education. The Commission's September 2016 actions regarding ADA CERP recognition are summarized in Appendix 1.

**Providers Requesting Extension of Recognition Term:** The Commission received a report listing providers that requested and were granted a six-month extension to their recognition term and corresponding extension of the deadline for submitting an application for continued recognition in accordance with CERP procedures (consent calendar item).

**Providers Voluntarily Discontinuing:** The Commission received a report listing three providers that have notified the Commission that they will be discontinuing participation in ADA CERP (consent calendar item).

**Results of Fall 2016 CERP Applicant Survey:** The Commission received an informational report summarizing survey results from providers submitting applications each cycle (consent calendar item).

**CERP Participation and Approval Data:** The Commission received an informational report tracking annual data on program participation, submission types and acceptance rates (consent calendar item).

### **Commission Business**

**Strategic Planning Subcommittee Report:** At its March 2016 meeting, the Commission determined to undertake a strategic planning process to formulate a mission statement and identify priorities to guide future initiatives and support the Commission in fulfilling its responsibilities in a financially and

operationally sustainable manner. A Strategic Planning Subcommittee was appointed to facilitate the process. Dr. Leary reported that the Subcommittee met by conference call on August 31, 2016 to develop a proposal for conducting the planning process. The following were identified by the Subcommittee as desired outcomes: (1) develop mission and vision statements for CCEPR; (2) develop a strategic plan for 2016-2010 by identifying the Commission's top priorities, with 1-2 measurable goals for each; and (3) develop a road map for implementation of the strategic plan. The Subcommittee also reviewed background materials on strategic planning, ADA and CCEPR governance documents, and mission statements of accrediting agencies in the health care professions. Based on the materials reviewed, the Subcommittee proposed draft mission, vision and values statements for the Commission's consideration. The Subcommittee also developed a preliminary list of strategic objectives to advance the mission over the next four years. All members of the Commission were invited to contribute to and prioritize the list of objectives via an online survey in advance of the Commission's meeting. Discussion and adoption of a mission statement and identification of strategic priorities were considered during a facilitated planning session during the meeting, and are summarized in another section of this report.

**ADA 2017 Budget Update:** The Commission's proposed 2017 budget, reviewed by the Commission at its March meeting, was accepted by the Board of Trustees and has been submitted as part of the overall ADA budget submitted to the ADA House of Delegates for approval in October.

**ADA CERP Database and Online Application Process Update:** The Commission received an update on development of an online application and review solution for ADA CERP. Aptify, the ADA's tripartite membership database, has been selected as the platform preferred by the ADA Department of Information Technology. In the first half of 2016, staff worked to outline the technical requirements for an online application submission tool. Further action on the development of the application was suspended, however, pending evaluation of confidentiality requirements. Development is scheduled to resume in 2017.

As an interim measure to facilitate electronic submissions, guidelines for submitting CERP applications in PDF format were developed. Beginning with the Fall 2016 application cycle, providers have the option to submit applications and reports in either hard copy or PDF format. Approximately 38% of Fall 2016 applications and reports were submitted as PDFs. The Commission noted that the process of reviewing applications in PDF was challenging when the materials submitted were not consistently bookmarked. The Commission suggested several additions to the instructions for providers wishing to submit PDFs, including the following: bookmarks should be mandatory—PDFs without bookmarks for navigation should be returned; a standardized list of required bookmarks should be developed; scanned documents must be legible. It was also suggested that staff provide a tutorial for reviewers on navigating within an Acrobat document.

**CCEPR Communication and Marketing Update:** At its September 2015 meeting, the Commission discussed the need to build a communications plan to increase awareness, value and positive perceptions of ADA CERP. The Commission reviewed a summary of 2016 communications and outreach tactics to date. As CCEPR's budget does not currently include funds for marketing campaigns, to minimize costs 2016 tactics have primarily included electronic communications through CCEPR and ADA outlets. When communications featuring CERP are distributed through ADA communications channels to all members, there is corresponding increase in the number of visitors to CCEPR web pages. In 2016 the ADA launched integrated marketing campaigns, designed to coordinate ADA messaging in several broad areas across multiple outlets. Content regarding CERP has not been incorporated in any integrated marketing campaigns to date.

**Appointments to the Commission:** The Commission received information that the American Association of Public Health Dentistry has appointed Dr. Susan G. Reed to succeed Dr. Mary Tavares as that association's representative on the Commission. Dr. Reed's term on the Commission will begin in October 2016 when Dr. Tavares' term expires, and will extend until October 2020. The ADA will appoint a

representative to succeed Dr. Eugene J. McGuire when his term expires in October 2016. At the time of the Commission's meeting, the ADA's appointment had not yet been announced (consent calendar item).

**Consultant Appointments:** Under ADA *Bylaws*, the Commission may appoint consultants to assist in developing standards, conducting recognition reviewers and appeals. Former Commission and CERP Committee members are invited to serve as reviewer consultants.

**Action:** The Commission appoints the following to serve as consultants to the Commission for a one-year term beginning with the close of the 2015 ADA House of Delegates: Dr. Alan L. Felsenfeld, Dr. Alan E. Friedel, Ms. Janice Gibbs-Reed, Dr. Eugene J. McGuire, Dr. Mary A. Tavares and Dr. Timothy T. Wheeler.

**Nomination and Election of 2016-2017 Officers:** In accordance with Article II, Section 1 of the Rules of the Commission for Continuing Education Provider Recognition, the Board of Commissioners shall elect a Chair and Vice-Chair who are active, life or retired member of the American Dental Association.

**Action:** The Commission elects Dr. Paul Leary to serve as its Chair for 2016-2017.

**Action:** The Commission elects Dr. Joseph P. Fiorellini to serve as its Vice Chair for 2016-2017.

**Future Meeting Dates:** The Commission received an informational report listing the Commission's next meeting dates which are scheduled for April 6-7, 2017 and October 12-13, 2017 (consent calendar item).

**Acknowledgement of Service:** The Commission acknowledged the following board members completing their terms in October 2016: Dr. Eugene J. McGuire and Dr. Mary A. Tavares (vice chair).

### Miscellaneous

**2016 ADA House of Delegates Resolutions:** The Commission reviewed as informational the first set of resolutions on education matters published August 5 for consideration by the 2016 ADA House of Delegates. The Commission noted that Res. 37 proposes revisions to the ADA "*Guidelines for the Use of Sedation and General Anesthesia by Dentists*" and "*Guidelines for Teaching Pain Control and Sedation to Dentists and Dental Students*." Among the proposed revisions are recommendations that prior to administering moderate sedation, dentists should undergo a minimum number of hours of training and administer a minimum number of sedations in a training situation. The guidelines also state that training courses must include certification of competence in moderate sedation techniques and rescuing patients from a deeper level of sedation than intended. The Commission discussed whether the revised training guidelines, if adopted by the ADA, should be taken into consideration by the Commission as it revises the CERP Standards and Procedures. As state licensing boards ultimately determine requirements for specific procedures, the Commission will monitor developments regarding adoption of the guidelines and any implications for continuing education programs.

The Commission suggested that in future years a CCEPR member should be assigned responsibility for reviewing ADA resolutions and flagging any that the Commission may wish to review and discuss.

**CERP Reviewer Discussion and Calibration Exercise:** The Commission engaged in an exercise to calibrate reviewer assessments of CERP provider applications.

**Strategic Planning Session:** As part of the strategic planning process initiated in March 2016 and advanced by the Strategic Planning Subcommittee, the Commission engaged in a facilitated discussion to

develop mission and vision statements for CCEPR, and identify the Commission's top priorities to advance the mission in 2016-2020.

As reported earlier in this document, the Commission's Strategic Planning Committee proposed draft mission, vision and values statements for the Commission's consideration. Following a discussion and revision process facilitated by Mr. Dixon, the Commission took the following actions.

**Action:** The Commission adopts the following mission statement, effective immediately:

#### MISSION

CCEPR serves the public, the dental profession, and other healthcare providers by developing and implementing standards that promote excellence in continuing dental education to support professional competence and continuous improvement of patient care.

CCEPR fulfills its mission by:

- Establishing standards and criteria for the recognition of continuing dental education providers
- Recognizing providers of continuing dental education through a voluntary, self-regulated, peer-review process
- Promoting quality improvement of continuing dental education standards and recognized providers.

**Action:** The Commission adopts the following vision statement, effective immediately:

#### VISION

ADA CERP will be the globally accepted program for recognizing providers of quality continuing dental education.

**Action:** The Commission adopts the following values statement, effective immediately:

#### VALUES

- Improvement of Oral Health
- Excellence
- Integrity
- Science/Evidence-Based
- Life-long learning

The Commission also reviewed the results of a survey of Commission members ranking priorities for the next four years. Through a facilitated discussion, the Commission identified the following as priorities for 2016-2020:

1. Establish and promote standards for effective continuing dental education that supports quality dental care.
2. Improve CERP provider assessment processes.
3. Achieve optimal organizational capacity.

The Commission directed the Subcommittee to work with staff to draft 1-2 measurable goals for each priority in the next few months and present a draft strategic plan for the Commission's consideration. Staff will also develop a corresponding road map outlining milestones and metrics for accomplishing the goals.

**New Business:** The Commission discussed whether future Commission meetings should be scheduled over a Thursday and Friday, in the current pattern, or whether another configuration would be optimal for the majority of members. Staff will poll members' preferences prior to scheduling meetings for 2018.

**Adjournment:** 11:43 am, Friday, September 30, 2016.